# City of Spokane



## Conditional Use Permit

Planning Services Department Application

List the provisions of the land use code that allows the proposal.

Chapter 17C.335 Historic Structures – Change of Use Section 17C.335.010 Purpose

The purpose of this chapter is to establish standards for the use and re-use of historic structures.

Change in Use.

A change to any use other than a use listed as permitted in the base zoning district may be allowed by Type III permit from the hearing examiner if the following criteria are met:

The structure is listed on the Spokane Register or National Register of Historic Places.

All proposed changes to the structure have been approved by the landmarks commission as being compatible with the historical designation of the property, the form of approval being specified in the rules of procedure of the hearing examiner.

The change in use is demonstrated as necessary to ensure that the structure will be preserved, considering all uses allowed in the underlying zone.

The benefits to the public arising out of preserving the structure are greater than the harm to the public resulting from allowing the proposed use of the structure, considering such factors as public access to the structure provided by the proposed use, the distinctive character of the proposed use, the need for the proposed use in the neighborhood in which the building is located or in the City, the amount of traffic, noise and other off-site impacts anticipated to be caused by the use and the means available to mitigate any potential off-site impacts.

Copies of the listing of the Turner Mansion on the National Historical Register and the local Spokane Historical Register are on file with the Spokane Historical Office. Below are some highlights of the documents.

#### ARCHITECTURAL HISTORY

The Luther & Jane Marie Turner House is historically significant as an example of the Neo-Classical architectural style, and for its association with the Luther P. Turner family, early settlers of the Inland Northwest who made their fortune growing wheat on the rolling Palouse hills west of Spokane in the community of Harrington. Luther and his wife later became prominent participants in the social life of Spokane.

The Neo-Classical style was a popular mode of architectural taste during the first half of the 20th century. It began on the east coast and quickly spread to the west into communities such as Spokane. The renewal of interest in classical architectural forms can be traced to the 1893 World's Columbian Exposition in Chicago, which set a new course in architectural fashion. Major buildings in the immensely popular and widely promoted fair were required by fair organizers to have a classical theme and many of the day's leading architects competed to design them. The centerpiece of the fair was the Great White City by Daniel Burnham that single-handedly inspired the larger City Beautiful movement. Many of the architects of the fair employed Greek and Roman orders as motifs that would percolate through to the home building public shortly thereafter.

As such, it comes as no surprise that the Neo- Classical style was a "top-down" style originating in formally trained architects and realized at first in homes of the upper class. Nationally known firms such as McKim, Mead & White made a specialty of the style producing landmark examples. For many of the newly minted millionaires of the 1890s, a Neo-Classical house seemed to strike the right balance between instant, imposing grandeur and European-derived establishment.

By the 1910s, the key features of the Neo-Classical idiom had filtered from the east coast to the west coast through the ranks of the architectural profession.

The Turner House in Spokane is a good example of the Neo-Classical expression as executed in a midsize western city. Its plan, massing, scale, and detail are typical of high style Neo-Classical dwellings. The Turner House, featuring clusters of one and two-story lonic porch columns, ornamental balustrades, large overhanging eaves with modillions, and symmetrical massing is the only one of the group to have brick exterior walls. Additionally, it appears that the Turner House may be the only high style Neo-Classical home on the north side of the Spokane River within the city limits. Other imposing Neo-Classical homes were reserved for the more upscale and fashionable south hill of the city. Other Neo-Classical Dwellings in Spokane -

Spokane has several Neo-Classical designed homes (see partial list below), but the Turner House is one of the better examples.

Property Name Address

Earl Crane House S. 817 Adams

C. F. Clouah House W. 1406 9th Avenue
J. Grier Lana House W. 1307 8th Avenue
George Odell House 508 E. Rockwell Blvd.
Levi & May Hutton House 2206 E. 17th Avenue
House 734 24th Avenue E
House 2229 Rockwood Blvd S.
James Arrnstrono House 1022 W. Ninth Avenue
John Finch House 2340 W. First Avenue

A local newspaper identifies the architect of the Turner House as J.R. Burrill. Burrill-designed structures in Harrington include the Harrington Bank Block and Opera House. Both being prominent citizens of Harrington, it's probable that Luther Turner was well-acquainted with Mr. Burrill, and he likely invited the local designer to supervise construction of his new Spokane house.

The house, completed in 1917, was designed to be a commemoration of Luther Turner's financial success, with its pretentious Grecian columns and expansive front porch and balcony. The large city block on which it was built, afforded room to spread out, unlike the quickly filling exclusive neighborhoods of the city's south side. The extensive grounds surrounded the estate originally included a large, two-car garage and a small barn.

Designed and furnished to entertain, the Turners make good use of their new home by hosting lavish parties and receptions. The marriages of the Turner's five daughters were all well covered in the social pages of the local newspaper and were usually followed by a lavish reception at the Turner home. Eventually the extended Turner family became quite large and they often gathered together for dinner at the family home. One such gathering featured more than 20 family members representing five generations.

Jane Marie Turner died on May 12, 1940, after an extended illness. Luther Turner passed away on December 8, 1941 at the age of 79. He had contracted the flu before the Thanksgiving holiday and never fully recovered. At the time of his death his estate, estimated at \$400,000.

In June 1943, the house was sold to Elizabeth M. Davis for an undisclosed amount. Mrs. Davis announced plans to convert the home to a nursing facility for the elderly, and tentatively announced that the building would be called the "Turner Memorial Nursing Home for the Aged"." The name never caught on and for many years the building was called simply the Davis Nursing Home. During its existence as a nursing home, the Turner House endured extensive modifications, especially to the interior, which was sub-divided into smaller rooms to accommodate individual apartments. Most of the elaborate wood trim and built-in furnishings were retained however. Furthermore the exterior of the house was maintained except for some notable exceptions, including the attachment of a two-level, covered wheelchair ramp to the west side, and the addition of a one-level extension on the north side to accommodate a new kitchen. In the early 1950s, overcrowding prompted the construction of a companion facility, located to the west of the home. This two story brick building has since been removed, and a new modern care center has been erected on that site. It is now called St. Marks Senor Living.

2. Please explain how the proposal is consistent with the comprehensive plan designation and goals, objectives and policies for the property.

The site is within the Residential 4-10 designation on the City of Spokane Plan Use Plan Map

The Comprehensive Plan Chapter 8 Urban Design and Historic Preservation, states the following:

### Vision

"The qualities that make Spokane unique, including the historic and cultural fabric, neighborhoods, downtown area, parks and green spaces, and tree-lined streets, will be maintained and improved.

#### Values

- ♦ Having downtown Spokane be distinctive and urban by using its architectural heritage and splendor.
- ♦ Maintaining the natural beauty that makes Spokane distinctive, including the parks, waterways, tree-lined streets, and green areas.
- ♦ Preserving the historic buildings, historic fabric, and cultural heritage that provide Spokane with its character.

## DP 4.8 Zoning Provisions and Building Regulations

Utilize the existing and develop new zoning provisions, building regulations, and design standards that are appropriate for historic properties, sites, districts, and neighborhoods.

Discussion: Regulations are tools that can, and should be used to promote preservation and renovation rather than demolition. New provisions could take the form of zoning categories and standards that reinforce certain districts or promote adaptive reuse of existing underutilized buildings. Deviations of parking requirements and reduction of site dimensional standards are other possibilities. The existing "Historic Building Code Relief" and "Special Use Permit" incentives should be improved and their use encouraged.

## DP 4.9 Rehabilitation of Historic Properties

Assist and cooperate with owners of historic and cultural landmarks and sites to identify, recognize, and plan for the use of their property to ensure compatibility with preservation objectives

## Discussion: Assistance with the identification and

designation of historic properties, and public recognition for the owners, could serve as an important stimulus and reinforcement for historic preservation. Public agencies can cooperate with owners to provide for the preservation and maintenance of historic and cultural resources. There are too few incentives for the adaptive reuse of older buildings in the downtown and other small commercial districts, resulting in a loss of opportunities and a proliferation of surface parking lots and vacant land. Creative incentives, such as reduced taxes, deviations from development standards, and accelerated permitting could be sponsored and provided by the City of Spokane at little or no direct cost. Public recognition of owners who have undertaken appropriate rehabilitation of historic properties could also serve as an incentive.

## DP 4.10 Neighborhoods, Areas, and Historic Districts

Assist neighborhoods and other potential historic districts to identify, recognize, and highlight their social and economic origins and promote the preservation of their historic heritage and cultural resources.

**Discussion:** Identifying the social and cultural resources of an area is necessary for protection and guides decision-making in resource planning and management, and environmental review. The conservation of neighborhoods of historic character, preservation of historically significance resources, and their inclusion into historic districts are encouraged. Outstanding historic structures should be preserved when neighborhoods are redeveloped and rehabilitated. Where these resources exist, the blending of quality newer developments with the historic landmarks enhances and enriches the neighborhood character

#### LU 7.3 Historic Reuse

Allow compatible residential or commercial use of historic properties when necessary to promote preservation of these resources.

**Discussion:** Preservation of historic properties is encouraged by allowing a practical economic use, such as the conversion of a historic single-family residence to a higher density residential or commercial use. A public review process should be required for conversions to a use not allowed in the underlying zoning district. Special attention should be given to assuring that the converted use is compatible with surrounding properties and the zone in which the property is located. Recommendations from the Historic Landmarks Commission and the Historic Preservation Officer should be received by any decision-maker before a decision is made regarding the appropriateness of a conversion of a historic property.

The past use of the Turner Mansion as a nursing home has been detrimental to the historical fabric of the house and the neighborhood. The impact to the house and to the neighborhood was much higher when up to 45 people were licensed to live there. In addition, a 24 hr/day, 7 day/week staff was required care for them.

When the Davis family bought the property in 1943, they called it the "Turner Memorial Nursing Home for the Aged". Today's health care standards would probably not allow the house to be used for a nursing home.

The proposed use of the Turner Mansion as office space means less traffic and less neighborhood impact than its previous use.

The structure is now much closer to its original grandeur than it has been since 1943.

3. Please explain how the proposal meets the concurrency requirements of SMC Chapter 17D.010.

Chapter 17D.010 Concurrency Certification

Section 17D.010.030 Certificate of Capacity

Issuance.A certificate of capacity shall be issued at the same time the development permit is issued and upon payment of any fee and/or performance of any condition required by a service provider.

A certificate of capacity shall apply only to the specific land uses, densities, intensities and development project described in the application and development permit.

A certificate of capacity is not transferable to other land, but may be transferred to new owners of the original land.

No Impact.

Development permits for development which creates no additional impacts on any concurrency facility are exempt from the requirements of this chapter. Such development includes, but is not limited to:

- any addition to a residence or accessory structure with no change in use or increase in the number of dwelling units;
- 2. interior renovations with no change in use or increase in number of dwelling units;
- interior completion of a structure for use(s) with the same or less intensity as the existing use or a previously approved use;
- 4. replacement structure with no change in use or increase in number of dwelling units;

The building and site has been much the same since 1916 and has been integrated into the neighborhood for many years. However, it has not been a private residence since 1943 when Elizabeth Davis purchased the property and licensed it as a senior living facility. The Davis family called it the "Turner Memorial Nursing Home for the Aged". That impact to the house and to the neighborhood was much higher than is proposed now when up to 45 people were licensed to live there. In addition, a 24 hr/ day, 7 day/week staff was required care for them.

It served as a nursing home for many years until it was shut down by the state and subsequently purchased by James Delegans in a foreclosure proceeding. Its designation on the National Historic Register and the Spokane Historical Register was in October 2003. It was sold to J Thomas Sawyer, the current applicant, in 2008.

There is no proposed alteration to the footprint of the Turner House, and the only alteration to the site plan is the addition of the handicap ramp into the building, the handicap parking pad and the city sidewalk and approach to meet today's codes. Permits for these items have been issued and most of the

work has been approved and completed. Final inspections will be required. No other exterior additions or alterations are proposed. Existing facilities, including water and sewer within the house are being used. Storm water is absorbed by the existing landscaping and drainage. Solid waste will be picked up on a residential schedule. Very little weekend traffic will be generated.

4. If approval of the site plan is required, demonstrate how the property is suitable for the proposed use and site plan. Consider the following: physical characteristics of the property, including but not limited to size, shape, location, topography, soils, slope, drainage characteristics, the existence of ground or surface water and the existence of natural, historic, or cultural features.

The Turner House was the first house to be built in this area. It is also the biggest house in the area. It borders St Mark Senior Living Facility and is now surrounded by sidewalks on the other 3 sides. It fits into the neighborhood and many people have stopped by and expressed gratitude that the "grand old lady" is looking so much improved. Four of the descendants of the Turner family have even stopped by and given me additional historical information on the house and the family. Their unsolicited information was offered because they seem quite happy to see someone finally put the house to good use. Two of them even showed up for the community hearing to tell me stories. Other neighbors have said that they think the current renovations have improved their property values.

Visitors to the tenants will most likely park on E Illinois Ave which is a high traffic street with parking on both sides. The south side of the street has no structures or homes along that side and is the most likely way to enter the front of the building, thereby reducing parking on side streets

As mentioned above, St Mark's senior living facility is located next door. The 30 acre Riverview retirement community is within 5/8 of a mile. The Academy, another senior living facility, is located within 1.3 miles. It is an ideal location for health care professionals to maintain office space to serve the elderly. Located within 3.2 miles of downtown Spokane, it offers lower rents than the downtown area with free parking. It is also within 100 yards of the Centennial Trail which offers biking access for environmentally minded professionals. Illinois Ave fronts the building and has city striped bicycle lanes on both sides.

5. Please explain any significant adverse impact on the environment or the surrounding properties the proposal will have and any necessary conditions that can be placed on the proposal to avoid significant effects or interference with the use of neighboring property or the surrounding area, considering the design and intensity of the proposed use.

The proposed action returns a beautiful neo-classical mansion to the neighborhood. It adds to the value of the existing homes because it will no longer be disfigured by the fire escape and other structures needed for the nursing home. The newly permitted and installed sidewalk adds to the walkability of the neighborhood since nothing but gravel was there before. As a private mansion in a working class

neighborhood, it will most likely add value and be a positive impact to the neighborhood not an adverse one.

Over the past 95 plus years since the Turner mansion was built, Illinois Avenue has become a major part of the traffic pattern through the neighborhood. Since this proposal fronts that street, the increased traffic, if any, should have little impact on the houses to the north and east. St Marks's is to the west and there is no impact to that property.

Because it is a historical property, signage, lighting and any future alterations will be controlled by the constraints used for other similar historical properties.