

A report of:

City of Spokane Downtown Spokane Partnership Downtown Business Improvement District

Prepared by:

Melvin Mark Development Company Nelson/Nygaard Consulting Robinson Research

> Final April 2005

Available at: www.downtown.spokane.net



#### Introduction – Spokane Parking Demand Study

This report has been produced to fulfill requirements of the work scope for the *Spokane Downtown Parking Demand Study.* The study process and its ensuing recommendations were initiated by the Downtown Spokane Partnership and the City of Spokane in association with a Parking Steering Committee comprised of representatives of retail and commercial businesses, the development community, citizens and City staff. The purpose of the study has been to develop a comprehensive parking management plan that responds to the unique access environment, goals and objectives of Downtown Spokane. The parking management plan and the process to develop it, are compiled and summarized in this report. The consulting team of Melvin Mark Development Company (MMC) and Nelson/Nygaard Consulting (N/N) conducted the study.

#### A. THE ROLE OF PARKING IN DOWNTOWN

The role of parking in downtown cannot be seen as a standalone solution in and of itself. The key to a successful downtown is truly the land uses that comprise it. A vital downtown is an area that has a clear sense of place and identity, comprised of an exciting and attractive mix of uses and amenities. In a nutshell, "people do not come downtown to park." People come downtown to experience an environment that is unique, active and diverse. As such, the true role of parking is to assure that the desired vision for downtown is fully supported.

Parking is just one tool in a downtown's economic development toolbox. Parking must be managed to assure that priority land uses are supported with an effective and efficient system of access that caters to the needs of priority users. In the case of Spokane, the priority user for the public system of parking has been identified as the <u>patron of</u>



<u>downtown</u>, the person who shops, visits or recreates. As the Parking Steering Committee concluded, the objective of parking management in downtown should be to implement a plan that:

"Supports the development of a vibrant, regional center for shopping, working, living, recreation and entertainment and the customers, visitors, employees and residents of those uses. The components of this plan need to be simple and intuitive for the user, providing and understandable system that is safe, secure, affordable and well integrated into the traffic system and other access modes. The plan should recognize the role of the public sector in providing parking for patrons of the downtown, as well as seeking out opportunities for creating partnerships with the private sector to improve access and support of alternative modes of access."

#### B. CONTEXT

The downtown parking strategy developed through this study needed to remain sensitive to and compatible with extensive planning work already completed in Spokane. The City of Spokane and the Downtown Spokane Partnership (DSP) have produced several documents that set forth

a dynamic vision for the downtown's future development as well as reviews of, and planning for, parking management. These works are briefly summarized below:

## 1. The Plan for a New Downtown (July 1999)

The City of Spokane's 1999 *Downtown Plan (Plan for a New Downtown)* provides a clear and comprehensive vision for downtown as the center and focal point for the community. The Plan underscores the diversity of uses and activities that define and will shape Downtown Spokane. The Plan recognizes that parking and access management must be designed, calibrated and responsive to this diversity of economic activity. As development occurs, conflicts for access will arise. Important competing uses will create growing demand for access to and from the downtown. For Spokane, these users include:

- Cultural and event activities
- Commercial employment (for existing businesses and future development)
- Retail (as an employment and visitor activity)
- Residential development
- Convention trade and its associated visitor activity

With the *Plan for a New Downtown* Spokane begins with a strong base of knowledge, practices and vision that will both support and augment the development of a parking demand analysis and management plan. It will be critical that there be a clear link to the assets, challenges and opportunities identified in the *Plan for a New Downtown* as well as its Vision/Downtown Plan Concept and strategic objectives.

## 2. IDA Advisory Panel Report (November 2001)

The DSP and the Business Improvement District (BID), with support from the City of Spokane, engaged the International Downtown Association (IDA) to conduct and expert IDA Advisory Panel focused on downtown parking issues. The panel conducted its review in November 2001. The panel came to the following conclusions and recommendations:

- Spokane needs a fresh look at parking and a new way to think about downtown parking to guide decision-making.
- The "customer experience with parking" needs to be improved.
- There is high demand (currently un-met) for "close-in employee parking."<sup>1</sup>
- There is a perception that the parking enforcement program is too aggressive.
- "Significant waiting lists" exist at certain parking facilities.
- Non-parking issues include the need to improve the performance/mix of office, retail and residential within the downtown, including a need to improve the pedestrian environment.
- Parking management should be centralized under a single entity.

These are but a few of the primary considerations from the IDA report. A complete itemized list of parking strategy and program recommendations is included in the full IDA document, which is available from the DSP.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> In response to this, the DSP established the City Ticket parking program that provides employee parking in lots peripheral to the downtown core.

#### 3. Downtown Comprehensive Parking Program – Steering Committee Recommendation (April 2002)

In response to recommendations in the *Plan for a New Downtown,* the Downtown Spokane Partnership Business Improvement District and the City of Spokane implemented a 400-sample survey of Spokane County residents on parking issues and conditions. The survey was conducted in February 2002. The final report of the survey findings was completed and published in April 2002 and updated in January 2003. Key findings and/or recommendations of the report included:

#### Findings

- Negative customer perceptions about downtown parking continue to be an issue.
  - + 54% describe downtown parking as "lousy, frustrating, terrible and inconvenient"– up from a previous year's survey.
- On-street meters are the preferred customer parking option (34% of respondents).
  - + There is increasing use of River Park Square Garage (24%).
  - + There is moderate use of The Parkade (16%).
- There is strong use of "customer" validation program (38%).
- Employee abuse of on-street parking and how to balance enforcement activities (perception that enforcement is too aggressive) is a continuing issue.

#### **Recommendations**

- Goal: "A customer service-based downtown parking system to promote economic development in Downtown Spokane."
- Create new system or organization for managing "current parking assets."
- 4. Downtown Spokane Business Improvement District Draft 2004 Parking System Plan

The DSP has prepared a *Draft Parking System Plan* for implementation in 2004. The plan is a comprehensive attempt to initiate management of parking in downtown within the context of a system-wide approach. The *Parking System Plan* is responsive to the goals and objectives of the *Plan for a New Downtown* and the findings and recommendations of the IDA Advisory Panel Report.



The plan provides a list of implementation strategies designed to improve:

- Overall parking operations.
- Customer awareness and perceptions of downtown parking (and the downtown).

- Customer awareness of parking regulations and options.
- Use of existing programs and incentives (i.e., *Easy Park, Premier Pass, Bounce-Back, Courtesy Tickets and City Ticket*).
- Parking opportunities and traffic routes.

In summary, each of the processes and reports described above recognize the importance of parking and access in the success of downtown's economic development future. Each provides a context from which the parking management plan has been developed. All contain objectives targeted to:

- Improve the "status quo" for parking and access to the downtown.
- Increase public awareness of program options.
- Assure that parking supports on-going economic development priorities.

The only element lacking in the present environment is a consensus blueprint for parking that will allow the City, stakeholders and the general community to leverage parking as a tool to facilitate the dynamic vision called for in the *Plan for a New Downtown*. The plan presented in this document is intended to serve as that necessary element.

## B. STUDY PURPOSE

The purpose of this study is to develop a workable parking and transportation management plan for the Downtown. The plan has been developed to be specific enough to address known parking and access constraints with immediate to near-term improvements. This will assure on going improvements in access opportunities for patrons, employees and residents of the downtown. The plan is also flexible enough to provide the City with mid and long-term solutions (and decision-making guidelines and triggers) to assure that parking management strategies and programs are implemented in a manner that best serves the unique and changing nature of the downtown business environment.

Key elements of the study work scope called for development of a parking management plan that is:

- Based on an accurate and objective understanding of the dynamics of downtown access;
- Correlated to a clear vision for downtown's economic development;
- Grounded in a set of Guiding and Operating Principles that provide a lasting framework for decisionmaking;
- Comprised of both near-term and ongoing strategies for parking and transportation management that allows for flexibility and effective responses to the evolving access needs of the downtown.



This report documents the process and results of an extensive study effort carried out in partnership with the Downtown Spokane Partnership, the City of Spokane and an active and representative Parking Steering Committee (PSC) of downtown stakeholders. The plan contained within this report will provide the City with the information necessary to adopt and implement a comprehensive strategic access management plan. This will equip the City with a useful and strategically coordinated "tool box" of strategies that will assure priority users are accommodated and priority land uses are fully supported.

## C. PUBLIC INVOLVEMENT

The consultant team participated with the DSP and the City in a comprehensive education and involvement process that engaged key stakeholders, City staff, City Council members, the Downtown Business Improvement District (BID), and the general public. The primary objective was to identify key issues regarding parking, transportation and access in the downtown and their impact on the continuing economic vitality of the downtown. From this dialogue, functional alternatives and strategies were developed to improve identified deficiencies or shortcomings and initiate a framework plan for the on-going management of, and planning for, access in the downtown.

The work leading up to completion of this study was conducted in concert with a Parking Steering Committee (PSC). The PSC was established to provide oversight, guidance and review of the study process. Key stakeholders included local business owners, parking operators, public officials and staff, residents and downtown property owners and developers. These individuals provided significant assistance in the identification, description, and prioritization of issues to be addressed. They were further instrumental in the development of strategies and plans necessary for implementation of the parking management plan that is a component of this document. The PSC met nine times since initiation of the study in January 2004.

Overall, the high level of informed input and participation of stakeholders, City staff and City leadership reflects a deep-seated dedication and commitment to a vital and livable Downtown Spokane.

## D. SUMMARY

Spokane has done a good job in managing its parking assets to this point in time. What is lacking is a clear, flexible and consensus based blueprint for using parking management to support and facilitate the longer-term strategic vision. This plan provides that blueprint. It will serve as a guide to maximizing the City's existing parking resources and as a means to assure cost effective solutions for access, which includes new parking supply and transportation demand management programs and strategies.

## Acknowledgements

#### **Sponsors of the Assignment**

Mike Edwards	President, Downtown Spokane Partnership
James West	Mayor, City of Spokane

## **Parking Steering Committee**

Cherie Rodgers	City Council Member
Mark Aden	Ventures Board & Professional Engineer
Tom Best	BID Board & Department Store Chain Manager
Cal Brown	Property Manager
Dan Geiger	BID Board & Parking Manager
Steve Gelhausen	Parking Manager
Judith Gilmore	BID Board & Business Manager
Doug Griepp	Restaurant Business Manager
Rob Holen	BID Board & Theater Manager
Jim Kolva	Ventures Board & Professional Planner
Joe Madson	School District Representative
Dave Mandyke	BID Board & Deputy Director of Public Works
Kerry Novell	Parking Director, River Park Square
Chris O'Hara	BID Board Chair and Business Owner
Gary Pollard	Neighborhood Group President
Jana Reitmeier	Hotel Manager
Dave Shaw	City of Spokane, Parking Enforcement Manager
Bob Turner	City of Spokane, Senior Traffic Engineer
Steve Warrington	Parking Manager

## **Project Coordinator**

Mary Ann Ulik

Downtown Spokane Partnership, Parking and Operations Director

#### The Consultant Team

Rick Williams Owen Ronchelli Thomas Brennan William Robinson Nicholas Huff Melvin Mark Development Company Melvin Mark Development Company Nelson Nygaard Consultants Robinson Research Robinson Research

## Funding

The contents of this study were funded by the City of Spokane, Downtown Spokane Business Improvement District, and Downtown Spokane Partnership

# **Table of Contents**

EXECUTIVE	SUMMARYi
Introduction	
Section I:	Common Themes, Challenges and Opportunities
Section II:	Guiding Principles for Access
Section III:	Parking Management Plan – Operating Principles
Section IV:	Parking Management Plan – Strategies for Implementation
Section V:	Development of New Parking Supply
Section VI:	Funding Options for New Parking Supply and System Management
Section VII:	Summary
APPENDICE	S
A. Parkir	ng Inventory Analysis - South and North Study Zones (Weekday)
B. Parking Inventory Analysis – South Study Zone (Saturday)	
C. Parkir	ng Inventory Analysis – Passenger and Commercial Loading Zones

D. Garage Development Pro Forma

#### **Executive Summary**

This report has been produced to fulfill requirements of the work scope for the *Spokane Downtown Parking Demand Study.* The study process and its ensuing recommendations were initiated by the Downtown Spokane Partnership and the City of Spokane in association with a Parking Steering Committee comprised of representatives of retail and commercial businesses, the development community, citizens and City staff. The purpose of the study has been to develop a comprehensive parking management plan that responds to the unique access environment, goals and objectives of Downtown Spokane. The parking management plan and the process to develop it are compiled and summarized in this report. The consulting team of Melvin Mark Development Company (MMC) and Nelson/Nygaard Consulting (N/N) conducted the study. Robinson Research provided technical assistance in the collection of parking capacity and utilization data.

## A. BACKGROUND

The consultant team participated with the DSP and the City in a comprehensive education and involvement process that engaged key stakeholders, City staff, City Council members, the Downtown Business Improvement District (BID), and the general public. The primary objective was to identify key issues regarding parking, transportation and access in the downtown and their impact on the continuing economic vitality of the downtown. From this dialogue, functional alternatives and strategies were developed to improve identified deficiencies or shortcomings and initiate a framework plan for the on-going management of, and planning for, access in the downtown.



The work leading up to completion of this study was conducted in concert with a Parking Steering Committee (PSC). The PSC was established to provide oversight,

guidance and review of the study process. Key stakeholders included local business owners, parking operators, public officials and staff, residents and downtown property owners and developers. These individuals provided significant assistance in the identification, description, and prioritization of issues to be addressed. They were further instrumental in the development of strategies and plans necessary for implementation of the parking management plan that is a component of this document. The PSC met nine times since initiation of the study in January 2004.

#### B. REPORT FORMAT

This report is presented in six sections, with each section representing the critical phases of the yearlong stakeholders process. The comprehensive findings of the data inventory are included in three separate appendices.

#### C. BASIC FINDINGS

The basic findings of the data inventory and stakeholder process include:

#### 1. Data findings

Melvin Mark Development Company (MMDC), Nelson/Nygaard (N/N) and Robinson Research (RR) conducted the capacity/utilization and turnover inventory on two separate days, Thursday, May 20, 2004 and Saturday, May 22, 2004. The survey days were selected in consultation with the DSP, the City and the PSC, as were the boundaries of the study area. Overall, both days displayed consistent parking activity in all sectors of the downtown. The Thursday parking inventory was conducted between 10:30 a.m. and 9:30 p.m. The Saturday parking inventory was conducted between 11:30 a.m. and 10:30 p.m.

The survey itself involved an hourly accounting of each occupied on-street parking stall in the study area using the last four digits of the parked vehicle's license plate. All public off-street facilities were similarly documented. In total 8,320 parking stalls were inventoried (2,419 on-street, 5,901 off-street in 29 lots and garages).

Data findings for the general downtown area can be summarized as follows.

- Overall occupancy of the downtown reaches a peak capacity of 63.8% in the peak hour (i.e., 12:30 p.m. 1:30 p.m.).
- At the peak hour, the downtown maintains an available supply of approximately 2,683 on and off-street parking stalls.
- The *on-street* parking systems in the Core and West End Zones of the downtown operate with high turnover and utilization. The Core Zone reaches 89.7% occupancy at its maximum peak hour and the West End reaches 84.4%.
- While on-street occupancies are high in the Core and West End Zones, both zones have low utilization of *off-street* facilities. Off-street facilities in the Core Zone do not exceed peak hour utilization in the mid-60% range, while off-street facilities surveyed in the West End Zone do not exceed the mid-50% range. At its highest peak hour, the Core Zone maintains a minimum of 1,102 available off-street stalls. This relationship underscores the need for a better system of wayfinding/signage, communication, lighting/landscaping and pricing that draws patrons into off-street facilities.
- Time stay violations are high in the downtown study area. This is particularly evident in the Core Zone. The situation in the Core Zone is likely the result of the high number of 1-hour meters (and 30-minute meters) in the zone, which is out of sync with a patron's average time stay of approximately 1.5 hours. A review and reconsideration of the mix of time stay allowances in the Core Zone is recommended. *The conversion of 1-hour meters to 90-minute meters was implemented in November 2004.*
- It appears that the available supply of parking in the peak hours is adequate to accommodate current and future levels of demand.
- A large portion of available off-street supply is located on surface parking lots. Managing this surplus of parking as demand increases will impact decisions regarding future parking development requirements (for both the private and public sectors) as surface facilities in the study area redevelop into desired new uses.

## 2. Common Themes, Challenges and Opportunities

To develop a parking and access plan for downtown, it is first necessary to understand the dynamics of land use, access and growth that are unique to Spokane. Community perceptions and realities regarding constraints that limit existing businesses from expanding and those that limits Spokane's ability to attract new business growth to the downtown need to be fully considered. Similarly, opportunities and successful programs/strategies that currently contribute to downtown's health need to be understood in order to ensure they are supported and enhanced by any new parking and access strategies developed. The PSC was able to identify several "consensus" challenges and opportunities. These included:

#### Challenges to Access - Consensus Themes

- There is not a clear consensus on parking policy or the roles of the public and private sector in the provision/management of parking to meet future goals and objectives.
- The parking supply is not managed to its maximum potential.
- There is a high level of employee abuse of the on-street parking system.
- There is a negative perception of access/capacity.
- Maintaining transit service (and other modes) is a key strategy necessary to reduce constraints on the downtown parking supply.
- Concern regarding the community's ability (public and private sector) to provide for increases in the parking supply necessary to meet growing demand.

#### Opportunities – Consensus Themes

- Several programs are in place that communicates a customer-friendly approach to downtown. They include *City Ticket*, *Bounce-Back and Easy Park*.
- Demonstrable commitment to downtown by the City, business community and citizenry.
- A strong positive sense about downtown's future.

#### Definition of "Priority Customer"



The consensus of the PSC was the priority customers of Downtown Spokane are its *patrons*; those who come repeatedly to shop, dine, recreate and be entertained. The general profile of the patron is short-term stays that result in a high turnover of parking in the downtown. As patron demand increases, parking opportunities both on and off-street will be required to assure continued access. Efforts and resources in the area of parking management should be directed toward patron demand. The private sector can be an ally in facilitating access for employees and residents as well as support for, and participation in, alternative transportation mode programs and strategies.

The fact that the PSC has prioritized the downtown patron as the focal point of parking management is not to downplay the importance of other users of the downtown. The PSC has defined a benchmark against which management and decision-making for publicly controlled supply is measured. The PSC recognizes that constraints and conflict for demand within the

supply will occur and that decisions and strategies will have to be implemented that guarantee access to the priority patron.

It was clear form the work of the PSC there is a strong consensus on the challenges and opportunities that exist in Downtown Spokane. There is also a clear sense Spokane is moving forward in attracting economic activity and amenities that support the "ideal" downtown called for in *The Plan for a New Downtown*. Most importantly, the PSC was strong in its understanding of access priorities and unified in support of developing programs and strategies necessary to make certain those access priorities are met and desired economic uses are supported. In the area of parking, it is clear the priority of stakeholders is to assure continued and growing accessibility for the patron of downtown.

## 3. Guiding Principles for Access

The development of Guiding Principles for Access in Downtown Spokane supports creation of a parking system that truly facilitates and contributes to a vital and growing downtown. Guiding Principles for Access are based on the premise that development of the downtown will require an integrated and comprehensive package of strategies to stimulate economic development and redevelopment. The ensuing parking plan becomes but one critical element of a larger coordinated package for economic growth.

The work of the PSC can be summarized into an objective statement with nine Guiding Principles to facilitate future decision making related to parking and access in the downtown.



#### **Objective Statement**

To implement a Parking Management Plan for Downtown Spokane that supports the development of a vibrant, *regional center for shopping, working, living, recreation and entertainment*<sup>1</sup> and the customers, visitors, employees and residents of those uses. The components of this plan need to be simple and intuitive for the user, providing an understandable system that is safe, secure, affordable and well integrated into the traffic system and other access modes. The plan recognizes the role of the public sector in providing parking for patrons of the downtown, as well as seeking out opportunities for creating partnerships with the private sector to improve access and support of alternative modes of access.

#### Guiding Principles

- A. Make the downtown accessible to all users through multiple modes.
- B. Provide sufficient and convenient parking.
- C. Make the downtown core conveniently accessible for the priority user of the public parking system the <u>patron</u> of downtown.
- D. Provide adequate employee parking and encourage other modes.
- E. Promote strategic development of off-street facilities.
- F. Preserve and expand on-street parking wherever possible.
- G. Improve access linkages between districts and the downtown core.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Taken from Chapter III, Vision and Concept, of the *Plan for a New Downtown* (page 31).

- H. The City should lead in the development of access options for patrons (customers and visitors) of the downtown and actively partner with the business community to incent additional access and growth.
- I. The "parking product" in the downtown should be of the highest quality to create a positive customer experience with parking and the downtown.

The Guiding Principles derived from dialogues with the DSP, City, and its stakeholders can serve as a solid foundation for coordinating parking and transportation decision-making and policy. The Guiding Principles are grounded in the long-term economic development vision of the City and its downtown stakeholders. Their intent and purpose is to generate parking and transportation management strategies and programs that will complement the DSP and City's efforts in attaining its long-term growth and development vision.

## 4. Parking Management Plan – Operating Principles

Operating principles have been developed for each of five identified parking management zones. Parking management zones represent "economic activity zones" in the downtown that are both reflective of existing land uses in addition to areas where future growth of specific economic development is anticipated and desired. From an access perspective, each zone needs to be managed in a manner that supports priority economic uses and users identified for that zone.

Operating Principles complement and reinforce the Guiding Principles established for the downtown. Within the context of the operating principles for each zone a specific implementation framework has been developed through which decision making for that zone can occur. The implementation framework provides an on-going foundation for strategic decision making grounded in the operating priorities established for the zone and for the downtown as a whole.

With adoption of a parking management plan the City will work with stakeholders on ways to work toward reasonably attainable priorities as outlined in the Plan. This will facilitate strategies that support the purpose and priority for parking established in the Operating Principles.

#### 5. Parking Management Plan – Strategies for Implementation

As a result of the data inventory process and discussions with the Parking Steering Committee (PSC), specific parking management strategies have been identified and are recommended for implementation. The plan recommends a range of strategies to improve downtown's parking environment, these include:

- Programs to improve signage and communications
- Re-mixing parking time stay allowances
- Capturing additional on-street parking supply
- Specific policy level actions to reduce levels of parking abuse
- Creation of a permanent Parking Steering Committee,
- Establishing a decision-making "trigger" that compels on-going review of the parking system (i.e. the 85% Rule), and
- Designating a Parking Manager charged with facilitating the Parking Steering Committee process and acting as a liaison/partner with the City in managing parking in the downtown.

Recommendations for changes in current policy/code and several near-term strategies will optimize the efficiency of the *existing* parking inventory in Downtown Spokane. Additional mid and longer-term strategies are also recommended for consideration. The consultant team believes all of the recommendations presented in the report are consistent with the Guiding Principles and Operating Principles for parking in Spokane.

## 6. Development of New Parking Supply

The PSC envisions development of a parking garage in the Core or Convention Center Zone as a long-term strategic priority within the parking management plan for downtown. The decision to create new parking supply in structures is an important element in Spokane's *Plan for a New Downtown* in its effort to continue to accommodate customer/visitor access and economic growth.

The cost of structured parking is significant. Planning for the timely development and successful financing of such projects requires combined efforts on the part of the public and private sectors. In this regard, the PSC recognizes the need for all downtown stakeholders to understand the realities of parking development and the impact such a decision can have on parking policy, financing and partnerships.

#### Current Parking Environment

Information from the parking and utilization study indicates that, within the entire study area, there is an adequate supply of available parking during the peak hours. The weekday average peak occupancy for the study area is approximately 62%. In the Core Zone, peak hour occupancies for the combined supply is approximately 67%, though on street occupancies approach 90% in the evening. In a status quo environment, it would be several years before "constraints" in the public supply were realized. However, the great majority of available parking supply is now located on surface parking lots. As successful implementation of *The Plan for a New Downtown* occurs, the loss of surface supply to new development could hasten the loss of available parking.

#### Challenges to Development of New Parking Supply

The consultant team prepared two parking garage development scenarios with proforma analysis of their cost of construction, financing and potential revenue generation. Based on existing market conditions in downtown Spokane, it is clear that pursuit of a publicly initiated garage project will require additional revenue beyond the garage's ability to cover its own operating and financing costs.

The current parking market in downtown Spokane suggests the feasibility of a new parking structure will require additional sources of revenue beyond anticipated parking revenue generated by a facility. To this end, the process for considering how a new parking facility will eventually be developed in the downtown needs to be initiated if the downtown is to be prepared to meet future demand and support existing business' continued growth. Similarly, a "package" of funding options will need to be developed and implemented. This process is recommended as a near to mid-term strategy in the overall parking management plan for the downtown to be implemented by a new Parking Steering Committee.

#### D. SUMMARY

Spokane has done a good job in managing its parking assets to this point in time. What is lacking is a clear, flexible and consensus based blueprint for using parking management to support and facilitate the longer-term strategic vision. This plan provides that blueprint. It will serve as a guide to maximizing the City's existing parking resources and as a means to assure cost effective solutions for access, which includes new parking supply and transportation demand management programs and strategies.

It is apparent that as Downtown Spokane grows, so too will demand for parking. New development, a faster pace of trip growth, losses of current parking supply on surface lots, parking and transportation demand management programs and/or other events can work to accelerate or moderate the need for new parking supply.

In summary, the plan developed through this process recognizes the importance of parking and access in the success of downtown's economic development future. The plan and its associated strategies provide a context from which coordinated and strategic parking management can begin.

## Section I: Common Themes, Challenges and Opportunities

The parking capacity and utilization work that supports this study presents a comprehensive quantitative picture of how parking currently functions in Downtown Spokane (see **Appendices A – C)**. Data from that analysis has was thoroughly reviewed by Parking Steering Committee (PSC) to garner a more complete understanding of the actual dynamics of parking activity in the downtown as well as an assessment of the true availability of parking. Equally important for development of a parking management plan is an understanding of the vision for the future of the downtown from the perspective of the stakeholders.

## A. BACKGROUND

A key element of the work scope for this study was to identify and develop "consensus priorities for parking" and to incorporate those priorities into Guiding Principles for parking management. In this regard, the PSC met in



several work sessions to discuss and identify common themes and develop consensus on the following issues:

- Development and access challenges for businesses and residents.
- Current opportunities that would facilitate doing business in the downtown.
- Identification of priority users of the downtown (current and future).
- Establish consensus priorities for access and use for a range of parking uses that included:
  - a. On-street parking
  - b. Off-street parking (privately controlled)
  - c. Off-street parking (publicly controlled)
  - d. Priority/role of alternative access modes
- Develop guiding principles for parking management that will define the primary purpose of parking and transportation facilities within the downtown study area.

The PSC's work in addressing the above stated issues provided a foundation for understanding downtown not only from the perspective of parking, but of long-term visioning for economic development. This effort resulted in establishment of a consensus set of Guiding Principles to guide parking management decisions in a strategic manner. These Guiding Principles are presented in **Section II**.

## B. STAKEHOLDER INPUT

The work scope called for strong stakeholder input into the development of a parking plan for the downtown. The participation of downtown stakeholders in this process has been strong and represents a critical component of this work. Stakeholders will continue to represent an essential resource for the City as the parking management plan and strategies recommended in this study are implemented over time. As such, understanding stakeholder concerns and ideas

for downtown is critically important because they are the users of the downtown system on a daily basis. In addition, their investment and ownership in downtown will be supported as the recommendations of the parking study and management strategy are put in place. Any parking or access changes made to the downtown will have a direct impact on those who own, work, shop, or visit Downtown Spokane. The consultant team believes the plan has endeavored to be sensitive to, and cognizant of, this relationship.

## C. CHALLENGES AND OPPORTUNITIES

To develop a parking and access plan for downtown, it is first necessary to understand the dynamics of land use, access and growth that are unique to Spokane. Community perceptions and realities regarding constraints that limit existing businesses from expanding and those that limits Spokane's ability to attract new business growth to the downtown need to be fully considered. Similarly, opportunities and successful programs/strategies that currently contribute to downtown's health need to be understood in order to ensure they are supported and enhanced by any new parking and access strategies developed.

To this end, the consultant team conducted an initial work session with the PSC to begin to establish a consensus view of these challenges and opportunities. It was also important for the consultant team to establish a common perception or view of Downtown Spokane – today and into the future – with key stakeholders.

## 1. Desired Outcomes

PSC members were asked to take a moment and state what they would like to see as an outcome of this process. For example, if a new parking management program were developed, what beneficial outcomes would be derived? A bulleted list of those desired outcomes are provided below.

- Clearer policy direction
- More consistency in managing parking by zones
- Integrated decisions that balance need with effect on the entire parking system (i.e., consider how initiating one thing in a parking zone may have a negative impact on another)
- Managing parking to have "pedestrian friendly" benefits
- Having a better understanding (through analysis) of the physical profile of parking
- Understanding strategic/deliberate elements of managing parking
- A more "customer friendly" parking system in downtown
- A transition of surface parking lots to structures (strategically located)
- Preserve historic character of buildings in downtown (i.e., new parking supply should not come at the expense of historic buildings)
- A 'tool box' to influence future parking policy for office/retail/residential development
- Easy to use finished product a "usable" parking program

It was clear from the listing of desired outcomes that PSC members feel the current system of parking management lacks integration and consistency with the larger vision for downtown. Similarly, the theme of the need to better "understand" parking runs through many of the stated outcomes. In short, to get to the desired outcome of a usable and friendly parking system, requires more clarity and coherency in how parking is, and will be, managed.

## 2. Challenges to Access - Consensus Themes

PSC members discussed their insights into the major parking challenges facing downtown today and in the coming years. They were asked to consider these challenges as they influence downtown's ability to remain vital, attract and retain business and achieve the vision set out in the *Plan for a New Downtown*. Overall, nineteen items were developed. Challenges ranged from general perceptions of parking to actual physical infrastructure. The consultant team condensed the discussion into six themes. Themes regarding challenges to access are presented below, with clarifying bullet points taken from the PSC discussion following each theme.<sup>1</sup>

- ✓ <u>There is not a clear consensus on parking policy or the roles of the public and private sector</u> in the provision/management of parking to meet future goals and objectives. The issue of how parking is provided in downtown to meet economic goals and objectives is critical to the success of a parking management plan. The specific role the public and private sectors play in the provision of parking for the "public" must be understood and mutually agreed upon.
  - Aligning partnerships as it relates to parking and access (i.e., goals and policies need to be mutually developed and adopted).
  - Need to attract a more diverse mix of businesses downtown.
- The parking supply is not managed to its maximum potential. There was a feeling by some on the PSC that the current parking supply is not managed to achieve optimum utilization. This is an existing problem that could have impacts on the efficiency and cost of development of future supply.
  - There is not a coordinated system of parking management for the downtown.
  - Need for better connectivity in the downtown between destinations.
  - The availability of accessible and proximate parking for customers and patrons.
  - Conflicts in the parking supply between customer and employee demand.
  - A better understanding of the appropriateness of the current parking format downtown (i.e., meter times, loading zones, management zones, etc.).
- Parking abuse. PSC members believe there is a high level of employee abuse of the onstreet parking system. The PSC noted that large numbers of employees are not parking in areas designated for employee parking, violating time stays and "moving to evade.<sup>2</sup>" Similarly, stakeholders noted abuse of handicap spaces and loading zones. Overall, this type of activity hinders maximum efficiency and reduces/constrains the availability of onstreet parking for customer and visitor parking access in the downtown.
  - Employees parking in downtown (on-street).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The themes are not listed in any rank order. The PSC felt each theme had an important impact on the downtown's ability to achieve its strategic vision and should be considered equally in the context of multiple challenges. <sup>2</sup> "Moving to evade" involves employees who move their vehicles from one on-street parking stall to another within the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> "Moving to evade" involves employees who move their vehicles from one on-street parking stall to another within the downtown, throughout the day, rather than parking in a designated employee area for their entire work day. It is assumed that this practice is engaged in by employees as an attempt to avoid a higher cost for off-street parking.

- Handicapped parking abuse issue.
- Abuse of loading zones (i.e., bagging).
- ✓ <u>Negative perception of access/capacity</u>. Several PSC members noted the public has a strong perception that Downtown Spokane has an insufficient number of parking stalls and that the parking system is difficult to use and understand. These perceptions, whether true or not, have an adverse impact on downtown business viability. Compounding this is the sense that directional and information systems for patrons are inadequate. In addition, the need for aggressive and sustained marketing and communications will be important.
  - Perception that Downtown Spokane lacks capacity and is difficult to access.
  - Cost (affordability) of parking for both office and retail users.
  - Low-tech system (i.e., meters, pay systems, communication, etc.) may create confusion/ inefficiencies.
  - Downtown must compete with other shopping areas.
  - Parking downtown is hard to understand (i.e., rates, signage, directional systems, etc.).
- Maintaining transit service (and other modes) as a means to reduce constraints on the downtown parking supply. The PSC noted that transit service could play an important role in addressing congestion issues and influencing the overall amount of parking that may need to be built in the future. However, recent funding cuts to the STA, and ensuing cuts in service, could lead to an increase in employee use of the existing parking supply. The PSC noted the critical need to build support for transit and transit funding as a component of a comprehensive parking plan.
  - Threat to, and potential loss of, STA funding and services resulting in less transit for use by employees. This can create additional demands on the parking and traffic systems.
  - Building support for transit and the STA as a parking objective.
- Cost of building structured parking. Several on the PSC expressed concern regarding the community's ability to provide for increases in the parking supply necessary to meet growing demand. The cost to develop parking, particularly in structures, is very high and the current system does not support growth in the supply of parking. There is also a desire to see some surface parking lots develop into structures rather than see historic buildings razed to create surface parking. Net increases in parking should not come at the expense of the historical integrity of the downtown.
  - Resistance to public sector investment in public parking.<sup>3</sup>
  - Lack of a capital strategy for funding/supporting public parking program(s)/infrastructure.

## 3. **Opportunities – Consensus Themes**

PSC members discussed programs, strategies or elements that are currently in place and "working for downtown" by contributing to its success and supporting business and economic growth. Overall, PSC members mentioned twelve items. Opportunities ranged from Spokane's unique business environment to its strong sense of community. Three opportunity themes were clearly distinguished. They are briefly detailed here:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> At the time of this writing, the issue of litigation over the River Park Square Garage was likely fueling this resistance.

- Success of, and potential for, existing rewards and incentive programs. Several programs are in place that communicates a customer-friendly approach to downtown. Those programs should stay in place and be augmented over time to increase public awareness and understanding of them. They include City Ticket, Bounce-Back and Easy Park. Additional efforts in marketing, communications and outreach need to be developed in response to the challenge of "perception" described above.
  - *City Ticket* program is a good program.
  - Incentive rewards programs, which include *Bounce Back* and *Easy Park* are good.
  - Use of the peripheral lots (550 vehicles using these lots), which takes employee demand out of the core.
- Demonstrable commitment to downtown by the City, business community and citizenry.



PSC members underscored the active role the business community and citizens have played in Spokane's success and the partnership approach of City leadership. Stakeholders noted that there is a strong "sense of community" in Spokane, which underlies Spokane's unique character and success.

- Stakeholder partnership(s). A good feeling about downtown's future.
- Sense of place/home/community/friendly people.
- A visionary picture of the future The Plan for a New Downtown.
- ✓ <u>A strong positive sense about downtown's future.</u> The PSC was unanimous in its sense that the future of Downtown Spokane is that of success, growth and vitality. The work that has been put in place to establish a foundation for growth (i.e., *Plan for a New Downtown*) has high level of support and feasibility.
  - A viable downtown.
  - A sense that people want to come downtown.
  - Downtown is a unique destination and shopping experience.
  - Improving nightlife in downtown.
  - Increased interest in housing development downtown.
  - Lots of opportunity for continued growth.

Overall, programs and strategies that continue to support and enhance the opportunity themes developed by the PSC can serve as a framework through which the consensus challenges are best addressed. All parking strategies developed by the PSC and presented in **Section IV** of this report are intended to mitigate challenges and support opportunities.

## D. ACCESS PRIORITIES

## 1. Key Elements of a Successful Parking Program

PSC members were asked to list elements they would use to describe a "successful" parking program that, if in place in Spokane, would facilitate solving the transportation challenges and support/enhance the priority opportunities described above. Stakeholder input is outlined below.

A successful parking program for Spokane would be...

- Simple and intuitive easy to use
- Well-signed and understood
- Pay for itself be cash positive
- Safe and secure
- Well-lit
- Effective/appropriate enforcement
- Parking integrated into the existing traffic system
- "System" is coordinated (all parking areas/zones work together)
- Uniform parking management plan (public/private) with consensus on priorities
- Connects the core to other growing areas of the downtown
- Cost effective (affordable)
- Customer friendly
- Convenient and available
- Proximate and efficient
- Supportive of downtown's goals and vision
- Parking as a package of services (i.e., customer and employee). Serves all users.
- Parking assets are linked (i.e., to pedestrian system, to each other, to destinations)
- Parking management is well coordinated with other access modes (i.e., transit, bike, walk, etc.)
- Pricing is innovative to support/attract priority uses

It is clear the PSC would envision a parking program that is innovative and flexible to meet the changing demands of an evolving downtown. They would also stress the need for an affordable, safe and secure parking system. The parking program should contribute to the overall viability of the downtown and its goals and vision. At root, a successful parking system is convenient and user friendly. The charge of the consultant team and the PSC was to develop a parking strategy that achieves and supports these elements to the highest degree possible. The plan and strategy are presented in Sections III and IV of this report.

#### 2. Definition of "Priority Customer"

The Downtown Spokane parking system currently services a broad mix of users that include commercial employees, retail patrons, event goers and visitors to the downtown. In the future, increasing numbers of downtown residents and service industry employees will add to the



existing demand on the parking supply. As such, it is important to recognize that a balanced *system* of access needs to be developed and managed to assure the overall vision of a vital, active and mixed-use downtown is achieved.

Nonetheless, (for purposes of the management of on-street parking) the consensus of the PSC was the priority customers of Downtown Spokane are its patrons; those who come repeatedly to shop, dine, recreate and be entertained. The general profile of the patron is short-term stays that result in a high turnover of parking in the downtown. As patron demand increases, parking opportunities both on and off-street will be required to assure continued access. Efforts and resources in the area of parking management should be directed toward patron demand. The private sector can be an ally in facilitating access for employees and residents as well as support for, and participation in, alternative transportation mode programs and strategies.

The fact that the PSC has prioritized the downtown patron as the focal point of parking management is not to downplay the importance of other users of the downtown. The PSC has defined a benchmark against which management and decision-making for publicly controlled supply is measured. The PSC recognizes that constraints and conflict for demand within the supply will occur and that decisions and strategies will have to be implemented that guarantee access to the priority patron.<sup>4</sup>

#### 3. "Is" Versus "Should"

In a final work session, the PSC discussed its access priorities for downtown. Stakeholders were asked to consider a number of questions regarding the realities of access and use within the current transportation system (i.e., the <u>is</u> of today). They were then asked to consider how the transportation system <u>should</u> be accessed and used in the future within the context of the challenges/opportunities discussed above, and incorporate their goals and objectives for developing an "ideal" Downtown Spokane – as envisioned in the *Plan for a New Downtown*.

## A. Priority Land Uses

When asked, *"what is the priority land use(s) in downtown today?"* the committee responded:

- Commercial office in the core zone
- Mixed uses and open space surrounding the core

In the future, the committee agreed the priority for land uses <u>should</u> be "a more highly developed mixed-use core" that maintains commercial office but grows retail, entertainment and residential.

#### B. Priority Modes of Access

When asked to define the priority mode of access to downtown by both customers and employees, the PSC responded as follows:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The term "publicly controlled supply" will need further discussion by the PSC as this plan evolves. The fact that little off-street supply is currently in public control presents unique challenges for creating a "system" of patron supply. Innovative partnerships and programs will need to be developed, requiring high consensus on priorities and a clear understanding of current parking deficits and surpluses.

#### **Customer trips**

Today, a customer's priority mode of access to downtown *is* by the single-occupant vehicle.

In the future, a customer's primary mode of access <u>should</u> be through <u>a greater mix of access</u> <u>options</u> (i.e., transit, bike, walk), recognizing the single-occupant vehicle will still represent the greatest percentage of customer trips. **Employee trips** 

Today, an employee's priority mode of access to downtown *is* by the single-occupant vehicle.

In the future, an employee's primary mode of access <u>should</u> be through <u>a greater mix of access</u> <u>options</u> (i.e., transit, bike, walk), **recognizing that each employee auto trip to the downtown removes a parking space that could be used by patrons of the downtown**.

Transit in particular <u>should</u> bring an increased percentage of total employee trips to the downtown.

## C. Priority Use of Parking

#### On-street



When asked, *"who is the <u>on-street</u> parking system currently prioritized for?"* the PSC felt that existing onstreet parking strongly favors the customer/patron in the core and longer-term users on the periphery. There was a strong sense that employees currently abuse on-street parking in the core area.

In the future, the committee felt that downtown on-street parking <u>should</u> continue to be prioritized for <u>patrons</u> in all areas where short-term demand is most prevalent. Strong efforts should be made to assure that only patrons are using the on-street system (i.e., enforcement) and that the outer areas and strategically located off-street facilities should serve a mix of patrons and employees. Employee abuse <u>should</u> be mitigated.

#### Off-street

As to the question of parking in *privately controlled off-street* parking facilities, the PSC noted the current priority for lots in downtown *is* a mix of users that includes employees and patrons. In the future, the PSC believes that off-street parking in the downtown should be prioritized for patrons requiring a time stay greater than provided on-street.

Recognizing the City has limited abilities to influence how private facilities are operated, the PSC believes that privately owned off-street facilities <u>should</u> gradually prioritize more parking for an increasing number of long-term parkers, particularly in lots and garages outside the core zone.

#### D. Priorities for Alternative Modes of Access

The PSC considered the role of alternative modes for users of the downtown (patrons and employees). When asked what the on-going role of transit/bike/rideshare and walking was for customers and employees, the PSC stated the following:

- Transit, bicycling, ridesharing <u>should</u> become an "option that <u>patrons</u> **can** choose" as a means of accessing downtown.
- Transit, bicycling and ridesharing <u>should</u> become a "realistic and cost-effective option that a greater percentage of <u>employees</u> will choose" as a means of accessing downtown.
- Alternative modes for employees <u>should</u> be strongly encouraged, as success in alternative modes will lead to better efficiencies for the supply of patron parking.



#### E. SUMMARY

It was clear form the work of the PSC there is a strong consensus on the challenges and opportunities that exist in Downtown Spokane. There is also a clear sense Spokane is moving forward in attracting economic activity and amenities that support the "ideal" downtown called for in *The Plan for a New Downtown*. Most importantly, the PSC was strong in its understanding of access priorities and unified in support of developing programs and strategies necessary to make certain those access priorities are met and desired economic uses are supported. In the area of parking, it is clear the priority of stakeholders is to assure continued and growing accessibility for the patron of downtown.

#### Section II: Guiding Principles for Access

The work of the PSC described in **Section I** resulted in establishment of a consensus set of Guiding Principles designed to guide and inform access and parking management decisions. Strategically, the Guiding Principles encourage the use of parking resources to support and facilitate priority economic development goals and serve priority users.

The Guiding Principles will serve as a foundation for near- and long-term decision-making and implementation of parking management and access strategies in the downtown. These strategies are intended to support the on-going economic development and vitality of downtown.

## A. BACKGROUND

The development of Guiding Principles for Access in Downtown Spokane supports creation of a parking system that truly facilitates and contributes to a vital and growing downtown. Guiding Principles for Access are based on the premise that development of the downtown will require an integrated and comprehensive package of strategies to stimulate economic development and redevelopment. The ensuing parking plan becomes but one critical element of a larger coordinated package for economic growth.

The Consultant Team believes the work of the PSC can be summarized into nine Guiding Principles. The Guiding Principles are listed below. Each guiding principle is followed by some of the important consensus challenges it addresses (from **Section I**) as well as the desired outcomes and opportunity themes it supports.

#### 1. Recommended Guiding Principles

#### **Objective Statement**

To implement a Parking Management Plan for Downtown Spokane that supports the development of a vibrant, *regional center for shopping, working, living, recreation and entertainment*<sup>1</sup> and the customers, visitors, employees and residents of those uses. The components of this plan need to be simple and intuitive for the user, providing an understandable system that is safe, secure, affordable and well integrated into the traffic system and other access modes. The plan recognizes the role of the public sector in providing parking for patrons of the downtown, as well as seeking out opportunities for creating partnerships with the private sector to improve access and support of alternative modes of access.

#### GUIDING PRINCIPLE FOR ACCESS

**A.** *Make the downtown accessible to all users through multiple modes.* Economic development is best supported through multiple access options, which allows all users to conveniently visit, shop, live and recreate in the downtown. This also creates efficiencies within the transportation system. As such, all access modes should be supported (i.e., automobile, transit and bike/walk). The City should strive to create and implement as many access options as possible. Parking management strategies and programs should support

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Taken from Chapter III, Vision and Concept, of the *Plan for a New Downtown* (page 31).

and compliment other access modes as a way to maximize total access capacity in the downtown. Parking is only one tool in the City's broader package of services for those who would use the downtown.

Challenges and desired outcomes addressed:

- ✓ Develop clearer policy direction.
- ✓ Perception that Downtown Spokane lacks access and capacity.
- Parking management is well-coordinated with other access modes (i.e., transit, bike and walk).
- ✓ Need to attract a more diverse mix of businesses downtown.
- ✓ A tool box to influence future parking policy for office/retail/residential development.

#### Opportunity themes supported:

- ✓ Great business environment downtown.
- $\checkmark$  Downtown is a unique destination and shopping experience.
- $\checkmark$  Lots of opportunity for continued growth and expansion.

## GUIDING PRINCIPLES FOR PRIORITY PARKING

**B.** *Provide sufficient and convenient parking. Sufficient* parking should be provided to support desired and priority economic activities in downtown. However, parking should not be overbuilt to assure efficiencies of land use, balance with other access modes and preservation of downtown's architectural integrity. Parking under public control and/or ownership should be preserved for, and actively managed to accommodate, patron access to the area.

#### Challenges and desired outcomes addressed:

- ✓ Understanding strategic/deliberate elements of managing parking
- ✓ Integrated decisions that balance need with effect on larger parking system.
- ✓ A transition of surface parking lots to structures (and strategic location of such).
- ✓ Preserve historic character of buildings in downtown.
- ✓ Need to attract a more diverse mix of businesses downtown.
- ✓ Cost of building structured parking.
- Maintaining transit service (and other modes) as a means to reduce demand burden on the downtown parking supply.

#### Opportunity themes supported:

- $\checkmark\,$  A viable downtown. A sense that people want to come downtown.
- ✓ A visionary picture of the future *The Plan for a New Downtown*
- C. Make the downtown core conveniently accessible for the priority user of the public parking system the patron of downtown. The core zone of downtown should provide an access system that supports its priority role as the central point from which customers and

visitors are connected to all areas of the downtown. The priority user of the downtown is the short-term patron.

Challenges and desired outcomes addressed:

- ✓ Develop clearer policy direction.
- ✓ Parking supply is not managed to its maximum potential.
- ✓ Parking downtown is hard to understand (i.e., rates, signage, directional systems).
- ✓ A more "customer friendly" parking system in the downtown.
- ✓ The availability of accessible and proximate parking for customers and patrons.
- $\checkmark$  Downtown has to compete with other shopping areas.
- ✓ Parking abuse (i.e., conflicts with patron priority).

#### Opportunity themes supported:

- ✓ Demonstrable commitment to downtown by the City, business community and citizenry.
- $\checkmark$  Downtown is a unique destination and shopping experience.
- ✓ Success of, and potential for, existing rewards and incentives programs.
- **D.** *Provide adequate employee parking and encourage other modes.* Adequate parking to meet employee demand should be provided in conjunction with a transportation system that offers multiple travel mode options. All parking strategies should be coordinated with transportation demand management goals and objectives to ensure that commuters and customers have reasonable options available for access. Access management strategies should move larger percentages of employees into alternative modes over time to reduce overall demand for commuter parking.

#### Challenges and desired outcomes addressed:

- ✓ Develop clearer policy direction.
- ✓ Parking supply is not managed to its maximum potential.
- ✓ A tool box to influence future parking policy for office/retail/residential development.
- ✓ Cost of building structured parking.

#### Opportunity themes supported:

- ✓ Demonstrable commitment to downtown by City, business community and citizenry.
- ✓ Success of, and potential for, existing rewards and incentive programs.
- Maintaining transit service (and other modes) as a means to reduce constraints on the downtown parking supply.
- E. *Promote strategic development of off-street facilities.* Off-street parking facilities should be developed to serve a diverse mix of uses and facilitate continued access activity throughout the day and into the evenings and weekends. Parking facilities should be strategically located to assure that a mix of uses is conveniently and economically served, *particularly patron access.* Facilities should be sited in a manner that supports connectivity within the downtown and cost recovery. Employee parking should not be the long-term, primary intent of parking facilities in the downtown.

#### Challenges and desired outcomes addressed:

- ✓ There is not a clear consensus on parking policy or the roles of the public and private sector in the provision/management of parking to meet future goals and objectives of the downtown.
- ✓ Lack of a capital strategy for funding/supporting public parking programs and infrastructure.
- ✓ Understanding strategic/deliberate elements of parking management.
- $\checkmark$  Need for better connectivity in the downtown between destinations.
- ✓ Cost of building structured parking.

#### Opportunity themes supported:

- $\checkmark$  Downtown is a unique destination and shopping experience.
- $\checkmark$  A viable downtown.
- $\checkmark$  Lots of opportunity for continued growth.
- F. Preserve and expand on-street parking wherever possible. On-street parking should be preserved along strategic corridors to improve customer/visitor accessibility and to facilitate revitalization of street level activities. In some cases, on-street access should take priority over street capacity and vehicle speeds.

#### Challenges and desired outcomes addressed:

- ✓ Managing parking to have "pedestrian friendly" benefits.
- ✓ Understanding parking strategically.
- ✓ A more "customer friendly" parking system in downtown.
- ✓ Perception that Spokane lacks parking capacity and convenient access.

#### Opportunity themes supported:

✓ Downtown is a unique destination and shopping experience.

#### GUIDING PRINCIPLE FOR UNDERSTANDABILITY

**G.** *Improve access linkages between districts and the downtown core.* Access linkages within the core and between districts should be clearly identified through signage, wayfinding measures and other communication strategies to increase customer understanding of the downtown. Access linkages include parking, transit, and pedestrian/bicycle systems.

#### Challenges and desired outcomes addressed:

- ✓ The lack of a coordinated parking management system.
- ✓ The availability of accessible and proximate parking for customers and patrons.
- $\checkmark$  Building support for transit and the STA as a parking objective.
- ✓ Parking downtown is hard to understand (i.e., rates, signage and directional systems).

#### Opportunity themes supported:

- ✓ A visionary picture of the future *The Plan for a New Downtown*.
- ✓ Lots of opportunity for continued growth.
- ✓ A strong, positive sense about downtown's future.

#### GUIDING PRINCIPLE – ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES

H. The City and PSC should participate in the development of access options for patrons (customers and visitors) of the downtown and partner with the business community to stimulate additional access and growth. The City and PSC should promote alternative modes for commuter access as well as creating incentives, partnerships and programs with the private sector to attract and accommodate desired development growth. Strategies should be developed and integrated into a uniform parking management plan that has the consensus support of the public and private sectors.

#### Challenges and desired outcomes addressed:

- ✓ Develop clearer policy direction.
- ✓ Aligning public/private sector partnerships as it relates to parking and access.
- ✓ Understanding strategic/deliberate elements of parking management.
- ✓ A tool box to influence future parking policy for office/retail/residential development.
- ✓ Resistance to public sector investment in public parking.
- ✓ Lack of a capital strategy for funding/supporting public parking program(s)/infrastructure.
- ✓ Need to attract a more diverse mix of businesses downtown.

#### Opportunity themes supported:

- $\checkmark$  Downtown is a unique destination and shopping experience.
- ✓ Demonstrable commitment to downtown by the City, business community and citizenry.
- ✓ Increased residential development potential to grow the market.
- ✓ Great business environment downtown.

#### GUIDING PRINCIPLE – QUALITY

I. The "parking product" in the downtown should be of the highest quality to create a positive customer experience with parking and the downtown. Parking facilities (surface and structured) should be of uniform quality to create a sense of safety, convenience, understandability and coordination with the pedestrian environment. Communication and marketing materials should also be of high quality and integrated into a comprehensive package of services to inform and guide the parking public.

#### Challenges and desired outcomes addressed:

- ✓ Perception that Spokane lacks access and capacity.
- ✓ Managing parking to have "pedestrian friendly" impacts.
- ✓ A more "customer friendly" parking system in downtown.
- ✓ Easy to use finished product a "usable" parking program.

✓ Safe, secure and well lit.<sup>2</sup>

#### Opportunity themes supported:

- ✓ Downtown is a unique destination and shopping experience.
- ✓ Great business environment downtown.
- ✓ A strong, positive sense about downtown's future.

#### B. SUMMARY

The *Plan for a New Downtown* is an exciting vision for Spokane. That vision recognizes the goal and objective of the City of Spokane, Downtown Spokane Partnership\BID, stakeholders and the community to move downtown toward becoming a vibrant, vital, 24-hour urban neighborhood destination - an ideal downtown. With this recognition has come the understanding that managing the infrastructure that supports multiple economic uses is challenging. It requires fully using the parking and transportation system to provide understandable, convenient, safe, reliable transportation *options* for employees, customers, visitors, and residents. This network of access is essential to the vitality of each desired economic use.

The Guiding Principles derived from dialogues with the DSP, City, and its stakeholders can serve as a solid foundation for coordinating parking and transportation decision-making and policy. The Guiding Principles are grounded in the long-term economic development vision of the City and its downtown stakeholders. Their intent and purpose is to generate parking and transportation management strategies and programs that will complement the DSP and City's efforts in attaining its long-term growth and development vision.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Even though this element was not mentioned by the PSC as a challenge or desired outcome, it was strongly suggested in the discussion of elements of a successful parking system.

## Section III: Parking Management Plan – Operating Principles

This Section presents a proposed parking management plan for Downtown Spokane. The proposed plan strives to remain consistent with the Guiding Principles and give direction to future decision-making for the implementation of parking management strategies. These strategies are designed to assure priority access is maintained in each parking management zone. Overall, the plan is intended to provide a flexible system of parking management that is triggered by demand and implemented within the context of consensus goals and vision for the downtown.

The purpose of the parking management plan is to:

- Clearly define the intended use and purpose of the parking system,
- Manage the supply and enforce the parking policies and regulations,
- Monitor use and respond to changes in demand, and
- Maintain the intended function of the overall system.

#### A. PARKING MANAGEMENT PLAN

Different segments of the downtown have different economic uses and represent different points of access into the downtown. The Guiding Principles developed by the Parking Steering Group (PSC) emphasize that the heart or central core of downtown is an area in which the highest density of economic activity and access is intended to occur. There are also distinct areas of the downtown with differing levels/types of desired economic activity.

#### 1. Parking Management Zones

The desired uses in a particular area of downtown should drive the decision making for the type of parking required.<sup>1</sup> Parking, then, becomes a management tool that supports specific economic uses. Implementation of parking management strategies in publicly controlled parking supply is supportive of the economic development plan for the City of Spokane and its downtown.

**Figure 1A and 1B** shows five recommended *parking management zones* for Downtown Spokane.

These zones were derived from the PSC process and informed through work and analysis completed in Task 3 of the work scope (i.e. data collection and inventory). Zone boundaries were established based on the existing economic and transportation characteristics, as well as desired uses for the area, as identified by the PSC. As the shape and character of development in the downtown evolve, so too must the zones that help guide their management. Over time, management zones should be refined and redrawn to reflect the characteristics of development and uses appropriate to each zone. Each zone is summarized and its primary purpose and priority stated in this section below.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> It is also important to assure that parking in specific zones is managed to be consistent and supportive of current uses as well as to anticipate new uses as called out in *The Plan for a New Downtown*.



Figure 1A Recommended Parking Management Zones for South Study Area

Figure 1B Recommended Parking Management Zone for North Study Area



In short, these five zones represent "economic activity zones" in the downtown that are both reflective of existing land uses in addition to areas where future growth of specific economic development is anticipated and desired. From an access perspective, each zone will need to be managed in a manner that supports priority economic uses and users identified for that zone.

## 2. Operating Principles

Operating principles define the purpose and priority for parking in each of the Parking Management Zones. Operating Principles complement and reinforce the Guiding Principles established for the downtown. Within the context of the operating principles for each zone is a specific implementation framework through which decision making for that zone can occur. The implementation framework provides an on-going foundation for strategic decision making grounded in the operating priorities established for the zone and for the downtown as a whole.

With adoption of a parking management plan the City will work with stakeholders on ways to work toward reasonably attainable priorities as outlined in the Plan. This will facilitate strategies that support the purpose and priority for parking established in the Operating Principles.

Operating principles and an implementation framework have been developed for each parking management zone. It is important to recognize the principles and framework for each zone are intended to serve as neutral reference points from which parking decision making and strategy implementation are based over time. As 85 percent occupancy triggers are activated, these principles and framework guidelines will help future decision-makers through strategy development. Strategies will then be implemented to address specific demand and capacity issues in a manner appropriate to that particular point in time. In this manner, the parking management plan remains fluid and adaptable to changing conditions as the downtown develops and grows.

#### ZONE A - Core Zone

The core zone of downtown includes the highest density of commercial development and has a high concentration of retail, restaurant, and entertainment opportunities. The core zone is anchored by such projects as the River Park Square retail pavilion, Macy's, the Bank of America building and the Davenport Hotel, to name a few. **Figure 2** outlines the boundaries of the Core Zone.

## 1. Operating Principles (Zone A)

The <u>primary purpose</u> of parking in Zone A is to <u>serve patron and other short-term visitor needs</u> and support desired economic uses in the zone.<sup>2</sup>

- The purpose of, and priority for, public parking in Zone A is to support and enhance the vitality of the retail core.
- Parking for short-term users is the priority for on-street and off-street spaces in Zone A.
- Employees should be discouraged from parking in Zone A, particularly on-street.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> The Parking Steering Committee defines the "patron" as any trip to the downtown with a duration of less than four hours. Patrons then include retail shoppers, convention visitors; vendors, theater goers, commercial clients and guests of residential units.

- Parking will be provided to ensure convenient, economical, and user-friendly access for customers, clients, and visitors to downtown at all hours of the operating day (i.e., weekdays, evenings and weekends).
- All on-street parking in Zone A will be regulated (i.e., time stay and enforced).



# Figure 2

#### 2. Implementation Framework (Zone A)

- All on-street parking will be 1.5 hour parking based on the principle that: Α.
  - The 1.5 hour time stay allows adequate patron access to the retail core; and 1.
  - Uniform time stays foster a parking environment that is easy for the patron to 2. understand.
- Β. The on-going priority for on-street parking in Zone A will be 1.5 hour parking. As strategies within this plan are implemented, any on-street spaces of longer duration will be transitioned to off-street locations within the core and immediately adjacent to it.
- C. The priority for off-street parking in Zone A will be stays of less than 4 hours to accommodate customers, visitors and clients. Off-street facilities are intended to provide for a reasonably longer time stay than allowed on-street. Employee parking in the core is to be discouraged with opportunities to transition employees to peripheral areas encouraged as competing demand for off-street parking increases.
- D. The PSC will conduct periodic utilization and capacity studies to ascertain the actual peak hour utilization and average turnover of parking resources in the core area. If utilization of on and off-street parking in Zone A exceeds 85 percent and turnover meets desired rates, the City will work with the PSC to evaluate and possibly implement one, or

a combination of, the following implementation steps "triggered" by the 85 percent threshold:

- Manage level and/or duration of enforcement to assure desired rate of turnover and minimize/eliminate abuse (i.e., exceeding time stay, moving to evade).
- The City will work to transition overall mix of stalls to higher percentage of 1.5-hour stalls (i.e., reduce/eliminate excess passenger loading zones, add net new on street parking, evaluate angled parking opportunities, etc.).
- Transition employee parking in Zone A into other parking zones.
- Pursue shared-use agreements with private lots to provide for additional short-term parking in Zone A.
- Encourage implementation of valet programs (e.g., in partnership with restaurants) to enhance customer/visitor access by shuttling cars to areas with available capacity.
- Expand the boundaries of the Core management zone to increase the number of onstreet visitor spaces.
- Encourage an increase in non-SOV use (i.e., programs for shuttles, transit, ridesharing, etc.)
- E. The City will establish policy guidelines for exceptions to the short-term parking requirements in Zone A, to include: handicapped/disabled access, 15 30 minute zones, and loading zones.

## ZONE B – Convention Center Zone

The Convention Center Zone is located just east of the Core Zone. The Convention Center Zone includes a mix of development types, but at lower densities than in the core. The zone also is comprised of a number of surface parking facilities, which are anticipated to develop over time into mixed uses per *The Plan for a New Downtown*. Expansions of the economic land use characteristics of the Core Zone are expected to occur in the Convention Center Zone. Currently, parking in the zone is underutilized both on and off-street. As such, there is more flexibility in the near term for managing parking demand. The nature of demand within the zone can varies widely by time of day and day of week based on Convention Center operations and activity. **Figure 3** outlines the boundaries of the Convention Center Zone.

## 1. Operating Principles (Zone B)

The City's goal is to continue to encourage the mixed-use development of this zone, particularly as it supports the retail core and the Convention Center. Parking in the Convention Center Zone is <u>intended to serve a balanced mix of short-term and long-term parking needs</u>. It is the City's goal to actively manage the zone to meet a fluid user demand that changes by time of day and day of week. In the interim, surplus parking in the zone can be effectively utilized to meet unmet long-term demand.

- Most (if not all) on-street parking in this zone will be transitioned to serve short-term, visitor parking. Two-hour parking will form the base standard for all on-street parking.
- In the near term, underutilized on-street parking in this zone will be made available to provide longer-term stay opportunities for patron resulting in a balanced mix of short and long-term stay opportunities.
- Over time, long-term parking on-street will require transition into off-street supply.

- Off-street parking will continue to provide a mix of short and long-term stay opportunities.
- Off-street parking in this zone is intended to provide convenient and cost-effective employee parking supply as a measure to preserve higher access opportunities for customer and patron use in the core zones.



Figure 3 Zone B: Convention Center Zone

## 2. Implementation Framework (Zone B)

- A. The majority of on-street parking will be 2 hour parking, with an appropriate mix of longer-term parking based on capacity considerations (i.e., 85% Rule). This is based on the principle that:
  - 1. This mix of parking is conducive to both customers and employees and longer term visitor parking for the downtown;
  - 2. There is adequate on-street capacity in the zone to meet both short and long-term parking demand.
  - 3. The current economic uses in the zone do not as yet require the type of turnover ratios necessary in Zone A.
- B. The long-term priority for on street parking in Zone B will be 2 hour parking. As strategies within this plan are implemented, long-term parking (time stays and permits) will be transitioned to off-street locations within the zone and immediately adjacent to it.
- C. The priority for off-street parking in Zone B will be mixed-use parking to accommodate the full range of users, including employees, customers, visitors and clients. These facilities are intended to provide for a range of time stay opportunities.
- D. The PSC will conduct periodic utilization and capacity studies to ascertain the actual peak hour utilization and average turnover of parking resources in Zone B. If utilization of on and off-street parking in the Convention Center Zone exceeds 85 percent and turnover meets desired rates, the City will work with the PSC to evaluate and possibly
implement one, or a combination of, the following implementation steps "triggered" by the 85 percent threshold:

- Manage the level and duration of enforcement to assure desired rate of turnover and minimize/eliminate abuse (i.e., exceeding time stay, moving to evade).
- Increase mix of short-term time stays (2 and 3-hour) to increase turnover.
- Pursue shared-use agreements with private lots to provide for additional parking in Zone B or adjacent areas.
- The City will work to transition on-street employee parking in Zone B into available off-street locations within the parking zone or "satellite locations."
- Transition off-street employee parking into Zone D (Periphery Zone) or into "satellite locations" accessed by shuttle. This would be accomplished through reduction/elimination or pricing of monthly permits issued for parking in off-street locations.
- Expand the boundaries of the Convention Center Zone to increase the number of onstreet, short-term spaces (i.e., to Second Avenue between Washington and Division Streets).
- Encourage an increase non-SOV use by employees (i.e., programs for shuttles, transit, ridesharing).
- Recommend parking rates (on and/or off-street) to create greater efficiency in actual rate of turnover.
- Encourage new mixed-use parking supply within or adjacent to the zone.
- E. The City will establish policy guidelines for exceptions to the short-term parking requirements in Zone B, to include: handicapped/disabled access, 15 30 minute zones, and loading zones.

#### ZONE C – West End Zone

Zone C, the West End Zone, is primarily comprised of uses that attract strong patron activity (i.e. Spokane Club, proximity of The Big Easy and restaurants) and growing evening use. Time stay requirements are generally longer than those in the Core Zone but turnover is important to ensure maximum use and access into on street supply and support for land uses. Some residential need is evident in the zone, which will require better use of both the on and off-street supply. Off-street supply is limited though underutilized. Over time the Zone will continue to operate as a high use short-term parking area comprised of land uses that attract patron activity. **Figure 4** outlines the boundaries of the West End Zone.



#### 1. Operating Principles (Zone C)

The <u>primary purpose</u> of parking in Zone C is to <u>support the privately developed land uses within</u> <u>the zone and a growing demand for short-term access</u>. The PSC's goal is to manage the onstreet supply of parking in the zone within the objectives of the 85 percent occupancy standard. The PSC will strive to encourage the private development of parking in this zone that results in an increased supply of publicly available parking.

- On-street public parking should be managed to provide access opportunities for short-term demand.
- Consider the future use of a residential permit program that allows limited use of the onstreet supply can be implemented in the near-term to accommodate some residential demand.
- Off-street parking developed in this zone will likely be privately provided and managed to meet demand of the specific land uses for which the parking is associated.
- Programs may need to be developed in the future to balance residential access needs in this zone.
- Determination of appropriate time stay designations in on-street locations should be based on the 85% Rule.

#### 2. Implementation Framework (Zone C)

- A. All on-street parking will be 2 hour parking. This is based on the principle that:
  - 1. The 2.0-hour time stay allows adequate customer, visitor and client access to the uses within the zone.
  - 2. Uniform time stays foster a parking environment that is easy for the customer, visitor and client to understand.

- B. The on-going priority for on-street parking in Zone C will be 2.0 hour parking. As strategies within this plan are implemented, any on-street spaces of longer duration will be transitioned to off-street locations within the West End Zone and the Periphery Zone immediately adjacent.
- C. Investigate in the future, a limited residential permit program allowing residents the ability to park on street by special permit within the neighborhood zone and then managed to the 85% Rule. Development of residential off-street opportunities within the zone should be pursued (i.e. negotiate with off-street parking owners to market and make available residential off-street parking, possibly at a discounted monthly rate).
- D. The priority for off-street parking in Zone C will be private mixed-use parking to accommodate the full range of site-generated users (i.e., accessory short and long-term demand) including employees, customers, visitors, residents and clients.
- E. The PSC will conduct periodic utilization and capacity studies to ascertain the actual peak hour utilization and average turnover of parking resources in Zone C. If utilization of on-street parking in the West End Zone exceeds 85 percent and turnover meets desired rates, the City will work with the PSC to evaluate and possibly implement one, or a combination of, the following implementation steps "triggered" by the 85 percent threshold:
  - Manage the level and duration of enforcement to assure desired rate of turnover and minimize/eliminate abuse (i.e., exceeding time stay, moving to evade).
  - Expand the boundaries of the West End Zone to increase the number of on-street, short-term spaces (i.e., to Second Avenue between Monroe and Cedar Streets).
  - Pursue shared-use agreements with private lots to provide for additional parking in the West End Zone or adjacent areas.
  - Transition residential and employee demand to off-street lots within and adjacent to the zone.
  - Transition off-street employee parking into "satellite locations" accessed by shuttle. This would be accomplished through reduction/elimination or pricing of monthly permits issued for parking in off-street locations.
  - Encourage an increase non-SOV use by employees (i.e., programs for shuttles, transit, ridesharing)
  - Recommend rates for parking (on-street) to create greater efficiency in the actual rate of turnover.
  - Encourage new mixed-use public parking supply within or adjacent to the zone.
- F. The City will establish policy guidelines for exceptions to the short-term parking requirements in Zone C, to include: handicapped/disabled access, 15 30 minute zones, and loading zones.

#### ZONE D – Periphery Zone

This area currently represents a mix of development types of a scale that is low density and less intense than in any other zone. Many businesses in the zone maintain ample supplies of accessory parking, which directly serves their specific uses (i.e., car dealerships, restaurants, convenience stores). Currently, parking in this zone is significantly underutilized, with peak hour

parking occupancies of less than 55 percent. According to *The Plan for a New Downtown*, the City would like to see this zone develop additional retail and service opportunities. *In the near to mid-term, the zone may serve as a transitional area for increased employee parking from other zones as growth in Zones A, B & C absorb increasing and concentrated visitor demand.* 

Figure 5 outlines the boundaries of the Periphery Zone.

### 1. Operating Principles (Zone D)

Parking in Zone D is <u>intended to support growth in Zones A, B and C as well as to provide low-</u> <u>cost parking opportunities for employees and longer-term parking stays.</u>

- Underutilized on-street parking in this zone will be made available to provide longer-term stay opportunities for patrons of this zone and the greater downtown.
- Determination of appropriate time stay designations in on-street locations should be based on the 85% Rule.
- Off-street parking in this zone is intended to provide convenient and cost-effective employee parking supply as a measure to preserve higher access opportunities for customer and patron uses in the downtown.



Figure 5 Zone D: Periphery Zone

#### 2. Implementation Framework (Zone D)

- A. On-street parking will be an appropriate mix of 3 10 hour parking, managed to the 85% Rule. This is based on the principle that:
  - 1. There is adequate on-street capacity in the zone to meet both short and long-term parking demand.
  - 2. Providing long-term parking in this zone creates employee parking options that could mitigate parking conflicts between visitors and employees in other zones (particularly Zones A, B and C).
- B. The long-term priority for on-street parking in the Periphery Zone will be 3-hour parking. As strategies within this plan are implemented, longer time stays will be transitioned to off-street satellite locations.

- C. The priority for off-street parking in Zone D will be private mixed-use parking to accommodate a full range of users), including employees, customers, visitors and clients.
- D. The PSC will conduct periodic utilization and capacity studies to ascertain the actual peak hour utilization and average turnover of parking resources in Zone D. If utilization of on-street parking in the Periphery Zone exceeds 85 percent and turnover meets desired rates, the City will work with the PSC to evaluate and possibly implement one, or a combination of, the following implementation steps "triggered" by the 85 percent threshold:
  - Manage the level and duration of enforcement to assure desired rate of turnover and minimize/eliminate abuse (i.e., exceeding time stay, moving to evade).
  - Increase mix of short-term time stays (10- hours to 3-hours) to increase turnover.
  - Pursue shared-use agreements with private lots to provide for additional parking in the Periphery Zone.
  - Transition on-street employee parking in Zone D into available private off-street locations (shared use locations) within the parking Zone.
  - Transition off-street employee parking into "satellite locations" accessed by shuttle. This would be accomplished through reduction/elimination or pricing of monthly permits issued for parking in off-street locations.
  - Encourage an increase non-SOV use by employees (i.e., programs for shuttles, transit, ridesharing).
  - Recommend meter rates for parking (on-street) to create greater efficiency in the actual rate of turnover
- E. The City will establish policy guidelines for exceptions to the short-term parking requirements in Zone D, to include: handicapped/disabled access, 15 30 minute zones, and loading zones.

#### ZONE E – North Zone

This area is made up of a mix of development types including large governmental institutions, lower density, low-rise retail and sporadic surface parking lots. Several businesses in the zone maintain ample supplies of accessory parking, which directly serves their specific uses (i.e., antique dealers, restaurants, light industrial uses, etc.). However, an equivalent number of businesses do not have accessory parking, and are therefore reliant the on-street parking supply. Currently, parking in this zone is significantly underutilized, with peak hour parking occupancies just over 60 percent.

The North Zone operates with a convenient surplus of parking during its peak hours of operation. Adequate parking is available for both on-street and off-street access. Turnover is efficient and time stay designations in the zone are appropriate to serve the average duration of stay for patrons utilizing the zone. Parking violations (or abuse of time stays) is not significant in the district.

Figure 6 outlines the boundaries of the Periphery Zone.

#### 1. Operating Principles (Zone E)

Parking in Zone E is <u>intended to support a range of patron uses specific to the zone (short to</u> <u>long-term stay options) as well as to provide low-cost parking opportunities for employees of this</u> <u>zone.</u> Parking in this zone may be more varied (i.e., mix of time stays) than in other zones given the low occupancies now evident in the zone.

- Underutilized on-street parking in this zone will be made available to provide longer-term stay opportunities for patrons of this zone.
- When new parking supply is developed within the zone (off-street), it is intended that onstreet parking in this zone will transition to shorter-term parking to support and attract future retail, office and service-oriented businesses.
- Determination of appropriate time stay designations in on-street locations should be based on the 85% Rule.
- Off-street parking in this zone is intended to provide convenient and cost-effective long-term patron and employee parking supply as a measure to preserve higher access opportunities for customer and patron uses on-street.



Figure 6 Zone E: North Zone

#### 2. Implementation Framework (Zone E)

- A. On-street parking will be an appropriate mix of 1, 2, 3 and 10 hour parking, managed to the 85% Rule. This is based on the principle that:
  - 1. There is adequate on-street capacity in the zone to meet both short and long-term parking demand.
  - 2. Providing long-term parking in this zone creates patron and employee parking options that most effectively maximizes the available supply and provides flexibility and convenience.

- B. The long-term priority for on-street parking in the North Zone will be 3-hour parking. As strategies within this plan are implemented, longer time stays will be transitioned to off-street satellite locations.
- C. The priority for off-street parking in Zone E will be mixed-use parking to accommodate a full range of users, including employees, customers, visitors and clients.
- D. The PSC will conduct periodic utilization and capacity studies to ascertain the actual peak hour utilization and average turnover of parking resources in Zone E. If utilization of on-street parking in the North Zone exceeds 85 percent and turnover meets desired rates, the City will work with the PSC to evaluate and possibly implement one, or a combination of, the following implementation steps "triggered" by the 85 percent threshold:
  - Manage level and duration of enforcement to assure desired rate of turnover and minimize/eliminate abuse (i.e., exceeding time stay, moving to evade).
  - Increase mix of short-term time stays (10- hours to 3-hours) to increase turnover.
  - Transition on-street employee parking in Zone E into available private off-street locations (shared use locations) within the parking Zone.
  - Transition off-street employee parking into "satellite locations" accessed by shuttle. This would be accomplished through reduction/elimination or pricing of monthly permits issued for parking in off-street locations.
  - Encourage an increase non-SOV use by employees (i.e., programs for shuttles, transit, ridesharing)
  - Recommend meter rates for parking (on-street) to create greater efficiency in the actual rate of turnover.
- E. The City will establish policy guidelines for exceptions to the short-term parking requirements in Zone E, to include: handicapped/disabled access, 15 30 minute zones, and loading zones.

#### B. SUMMARY

The Operating Principles established here provide a guideline and framework for implementation of parking strategies within each parking management zone. The Operating Principles also allow for decision-making that responds to the unique qualities and parking dynamics of parking management zones over time. These principles are based on the 85% Rule, which assures that decision-making and strategy implementation occurs in the context of a strategic response to parking and demand rather than as a reaction to unexpected parking constraints.

Specific strategies for near and mid-term implementation are presented in Section IV.

#### Section IV: Parking Management Plan – Strategies for Implementation

As a result of the data inventory process and continuing discussions with the Parking Steering Committee (PSC), specific parking management strategies have been identified and are recommended for implementation. Recommendations for changes in current policy/code and several near-term strategies will optimize the efficiency of the *existing* parking inventory in Downtown Spokane. Additional mid and longer-term strategies are also recommended for consideration. The consultant team believes all of the recommendations presented in the report are consistent with the Guiding Principles and Operating Principles for parking in Spokane.

Mid and long-term strategies should be incorporated into a process through which such strategies are evaluated within the context of operating principles and zone based implementation frameworks (see A. 1, 2 & 3, below). Nonetheless, we believe all the strategies recommended in this report will assist the City to more effectively manage its parking supply.

These recommendations are organized as follows:

- Policy Level Actions
- Parking Management Strategies System-wide
- Parking Management Strategies Zone based
- Marketing and Communications

#### A. IMMEDIATE IMPLEMENTATION – POLICY LEVEL ACTIONS - (BY JUNE 2005)

The following policy elements have been included to ensure the goals of the parking management plan can be achieved by incorporating parking system management into the City's development policy. Application of the 85 percent full standard as the threshold for decision making (element 1 (a) (iv), below) becomes the unifying monitoring device connecting these various policy elements. Formalizing the policy recommendations assures that the life of the parking management plan extends beyond the first round of strategy implementation. As such, it is recommended that the Policy Recommendations be adopted immediately by the City of Spokane (no later than June 30, 2005).

1. Formalize and adopt a parking management framework which routinely addresses parking issues and plan implementation. The Parking Manager will act as a liaison to City Staff and the PSC provides advisory comments to the Mayor on parking issues in the Downtown. This framework would include the following elements:

#### a. Adopt Policies and Rules to Guide Parking Management

#### i. Guiding Principles for Parking Management as Council Resolution.

The Guiding Principles provide a framework for managing parking and decision making in the downtown over time. The Guiding Principles will serve to guide future management decision-making as well as development of future parking facilities. Adopting these guidelines by Council Resolution assures the intent and purpose for parking management, established through consensus in this study, is carried out over time.

## ii. Establish "Parking Management Zones" based on desired economic uses and user types.

Different segments of the downtown have different economic uses and represent different points of access into the downtown. The heart of downtown should represent the area in which the highest density of economic activity and access is intended to occur. Parking should be seen as a management tool that supports specific economic uses. The desired economic activity in a particular area of downtown should guide the decision making for the type of parking required.

It is recommended that Spokane establish five separate parking management zones, each having specific operational priorities. These zones are outlined in **Figures 1A** and **1B** in **Section V** of this report.

iii. Develop "Operating Principles" and an implementation framework that defines the priority purpose/use for parking in each parking management zone. Adopt the principles and framework by Council Resolution. The recommended Parking Management Zones should be established and the Operating Principles described in Section V should be used to guide the evaluation and management of day-to-day dynamics of parking activity. Operating principles are established to describe the primary purposes for parking within each parking management zone and to complement and reinforce the Guiding Principles established for the downtown.

#### iv. Adopt the 85% Rule to facilitate/direct parking management strategies.

The 85% Rule is a measure of parking utilization that acts as an objective benchmark against which parking management decisions are based. Within the parking industry, it is assumed that when an inventory of parking exceeds 85 percent occupancy in the peak hour, the supply becomes constrained and may not provide full and convenient access to its intended user. Once a supply of parking consistently exceeds 85 percent occupancy in the peak hour, the 85% Rule would recommend that parking management strategies be evaluated to bring peak hour occupancies to a level below 85 percent to assure intended uses are conveniently accommodated.

The parking inventory for Spokane revealed that existing peak hour occupancies in the Core Zone (Zone A) and West End Zone (Zone C) near 85 percent for onstreet parking. Other zones are generally operating at less than 85 percent at the time of this study. Having the 85% Rule in effect will assure that a process for evaluating and responding to future parking activity in the downtown is in place.

#### b. Appoint a Parking Steering Committee.

The City should formally appoint a Parking Steering Committee consisting of a representative cross section of downtown interests. The formal charge of the Committee would be to (a) assist a Parking Manager (see c., below) in the implementation of the parking plan: management (b) review parking issues over time; and (c) provide advisory comments to the Mayor and City Council on strategy implementation based on the Principles Guiding for parking management and Operating Principles and strategies adopted for each parking management zone.



A PSC would routinely review downtown parking activity and advise the City on strategies and programs.

c. Engage a Downtown Parking Manager to support and facilitate the work of the Parking Steering Committee.

The complexity of parking and access is increasing as the City and the downtown grows through redevelopment and increased demand for access. A single person designated as the Downtown Parking Manager should be assigned to coordinate the parking program. The Parking Manager would act as a liaison to City staff through the Parking Steering Committee. The Committee will in turn provide advisory comments to appropriate City Staff, Mayor, and City Council on parking issues in the Downtown. The Parking Manager would report to the Parking Steering Committee to routinely review overall parking activity in the downtown as well as by zone. Information developed through periodic update of the parking inventory (i.e. 85% Rule) would be used to evaluate "action triggers." The PSC would review and recommend appropriate strategies for possible implementation as necessary. The City "process" for establishing a Parking Manager should be completed immediately to facilitate formation of the Steering Committee and timely implementation of elements of this plan.

#### 2. Revise/refine existing meter bag policy, program and process.

It is apparent to the PSC and consultant team that meter bags are currently being used for purposes that conflict with the Guiding Principles, which prioritize metered areas of the downtown for customer/patron visits. Non-commercial vehicles routinely use meter bags and enforcement is difficult. The current annual cost of a meter bag is actually less than the current market rate for off-street parking, which can create an incentive to use a meter bag to avoid off-street parking.

The City should reaffirm (adopt) that the purpose and intent of a meter bag program is to provide a means for commercial users of the downtown to utilize existing parking meter stalls for:

- a) Durations in excess of the posted time stay
- b) Loading and unloading activity that requires an area greater than one parking stall

- c) Loading and unloading activity that requires near proximity to a building or site
- d) Use of a stall or stalls associated with a specific land use or project

The meter bag policy is intended to serve the following type of users:

- a) Permitted construction activities
- b) Moving companies
- c) Service contractors (i.e., phone, utility, maintenance, etc.)
- d) Other commercial uses as determined by the City of Spokane (i.e., approved valet uses, events, private tour bus loading/unloading, etc.)

A new procedure for use of the program would be implemented and include the following elements:

- A meter bag would only be issued for approved commercial uses by the City.
- A commercial vehicle must be licensed to a business and the business name must be displayed on the exterior of the vehicle.
- A meter bag will not be issued for personal use.
- Use of the meter bag is limited to a specifically defined time period, which would be printed onto a card that would be inserted into the meter bag for display at the meter removed from normal use.
- Use of the meter bag is to be limited to a specific meter or meters. These meters numbers would be noted on the card delimiting the time stay allowance.
- The cost of a meter bag would be determined based on the average annual gross revenue per meter in the downtown, prorated by hour, day, week, month and/or year, plus the City's reasonable cost of administration.

## 3. Initiate process to evaluate additional sources of funding for future parking development and parking system management.

The fiscal challenges of parking, transportation, and economic development in a downtown are common to many communities across the country. Rapid changes in development patterns over the past thirty years have resulted in significant changes to the urban landscape and many downtowns have had to re-examine services they provide and the revenue sources used to fund them. In most instances, communities use a combination of funding sources to cover transportation capacity needs. It is believed that some combination of the revenue sources (see **Section VI**) will be necessary to assure the feasibility of future structured parking in the downtown, particularly funding associated with a publicly owned facility. A single revenue source is unlikely to cover the cost of parking development.

### 4. Revise enforcement policy for metered parking to suspend enforcement on all federal holidays.

Survey work conducted by the DSP and discussions with the PSC indicated a lack of clarity as to actual days of enforcement in the downtown. The City currently enforces parking on Presidents Day and Veterans Day, which has created confusion among patrons. The PSC recommends that the City revise current policy to be consistent with the federal holiday schedule. The PSC believes this would reduce customer confusion and serve as a benefit to patrons using the downtown.

5. Initiate process to develop policy that would lead to a prohibition on the development of new surface lot parking in the downtown (or Core Zone). The downtown has a

significant number of surface parking lots. The recently completed inventory of found parking also that parking (particularly off-street) is significantly underutilized. As a means to (a) encourage the long-term feasibility to consolidate parking into structures, (b) discourage



razing older and historic build- Surface lots: Do they support vitality and *The Plan for a New Downtown*? ings and, (c) support the vision of *The Plan for a New Downtown*, the City should develop a policy that prohibits the creation of new surface lots in the downtown. The policy development process should consider existing buildings that might be exempted or "grandfathered" from such a prohibition due to unsafe structural conditions. Nonetheless, getting to strict limitations and, preferably, a prohibition on surface parking lot development is a critical support element for *The Plan for a New Downtown*.

#### B. PARKING MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES – SYSTEM-WIDE

Based on the recently completed capacity and usage survey of the parking inventory a number of parking strategies are recommended for near-term implementation. The strategies proposed here have system-wide impacts that will assist the City to optimize the use and accessibility of existing parking in Downtown Spokane.

A number of mid and longer-term recommendations have been developed as well, some of which are targeted at the development of new parking supply. The consultant team believes all of the recommendations presented in the report are consistent with the Guiding Principles and Operating Principles for parking in Spokane. Nonetheless, the mid and long-term recommendations should be reviewed and forwarded for implementation through the Parking Manager and Parking Steering Committee process recommended above.

Strategies targeted for particular parking management zones follow this section.

#### Near-Term Implementation - (by December 2006)

The following strategies are recommended for near-term implementation.

- 1. Initiate customer service training for on-street enforcement personnel.
  - The recently completed parking survey for downtown recorded a very high rate of customer violation of time zones, which translates into a particularly high issuance of parking tickets. This situation can lead to perceptions by customers of an unfriendly downtown. A common concern expressed by stakeholders through this process and

documented in customer surveys by the BID is the need for customer service training for enforcement personnel. The City should consider (a) developing a customer service policy and protocol for review and approval by the City Council and (b) implementing an on-going training program for enforcement personnel to establish a consistent and managed program of customer relations.

#### 2. Restrict/eliminate taxi zones in downtown by consolidating taxi with hotel zones.

Approximately 11 taxi zones are currently dispersed through the core of downtown. Taxi zones, which do not include the combined loading/taxi zones, are infrequently utilized in the downtown based on the observed pattern of use of existing zones in the downtown. It is doubtful the randomness of calls for taxi can be accommodated with services specifically dedicated taxi pickup/drop off zones. Conversion of taxi zones to metered parking stalls may result in additional parking downtown, particularly if spaces taxi operations were assumed to shift to existing hotel zones.

For this reason taxi zones should be restricted to maximize the availability of short-term customer/patron parking. If queuing/staging areas for taxis are necessary then taxi zones can be established in periphery areas of the



Inventory found little use of existing Taxi Zones

downtown where parking is underutilized. Pick-up and drop-off for taxis should be accommodated in conjunction with existing hotel parking zones. Creation of a taxi zone should be considered an exception to the City's adopted priority for use of on-street parking (i.e., customer/patron parking).

A new procedure for use of the program should be implemented and include the following elements:

- Evaluation of creating on-street taxi zones would be initiated at the request of the PSC and all interested stakeholders.
- A request for an on-street taxi zone should be considered an exception to the intended use for on-street parking stalls.
- The decision to create a taxi zone should be based on whether the zone is for the purpose of picking-up/dropping-off customers or queuing/staging of idle taxis.
- Queuing/staging of taxis should not be allowed in the core area of downtown. Such zones can be created, if necessary, in peripheral areas of the downtown where parking utilization has been demonstrated to be less than 85% in the peak hour.
- Pick-up and drop-off zones for taxi customers should be evaluated based on the quantity of calls for taxi pick-ups/drop-offs to a specific block face location in the downtown. A taxi zone should only be created when there is an actual demonstrated need for such a zone at a specific downtown location that would justify the loss of a metered, short-term parking stall.

3. Reduce/eliminate passenger loading zones.



Forty (40) passenger-loading zones are located throughout the downtown south of the river. In many cases, the passenger loading zones are associated with commercial loading zones. There appears to be confusion by customers on how to use the zones as evidenced by usage data. Recent field observations (**see Section II**) found very low and random use of the zones (averaging just 15%). If the current zones were converted to metered customer parking, about 72 metered customer stalls could be created. This would result in capacity for 367 new daily trips to the downtown,<sup>1</sup> approximately \$45,360 in annual revenue to the City and \$1.44 million in future parking development savings.

Passenger loading zones should be restricted to maximize the availability of short-term customer/patron parking. Creation of a passenger-loading zone should be considered an exception to the City's adopted priority for use of onstreet parking (i.e., customer/patron parking).

Passenger zones are currently underutilized

A new procedure for allowing passenger loading zones should be implemented and include the following elements:

- Evaluation of creation of on-street passenger loading zones would be initiated at the request of a building owner or business.
- A request for an on-street passenger-loading zone should be considered an exception to the intended use for on-street parking stalls.
- A determination to create a passenger loading zone should consider whether the zone provides a necessary service to an adjacent land use that cannot be accommodated by a metered parking stall.

#### 4. Strategically reduce the number of commercial loading zones

Within the boundaries of the South Study Zone area there are a total of 119 CLZ's. Of that total 47 are in the Core Zone, 13 are in the Convention Center Zone, 10 in the West End Zone and 49 in the Periphery Zone. Each CLZ differs in total size ranging from 20 to 140 feet. If these stalls were converted to standard on-street metered parking stalls, 207 metered stalls could be "added back" to the supply.<sup>2</sup>

Overall, the entire demonstrated use of CLZ's in the South Study Zone reaches an average of just 13% of all potential vehicle hours during which a patron vehicle could be

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This assumes an average turnover of 5.1 trips per day at a downtown parking stall over a 10 hour operating day.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Unlike PLZ's it is important to recognize the important and necessary function that CLZ's provide for business and the movement of freight and other services into and out of the downtown. It is doubtful that 100% conversion of CLZ's to on-street metered parking would occur (as it could with PLZ's). Nonetheless, an analysis of the actual utilization of CLZ's is important to the overall discussion of on-street parking. Strategic reduction of CLZ spaces, based on utilization, is clearly a relevant and cost-effective parking management strategy.

parked. In general, it is accurate to say that current CLZ zones may be overprovided based on actual demonstrated use (see **Section II)**.

The consultant team is not suggesting significant reductions in CLZ's given the need for on-going freight and delivery access in the downtown. This analysis demonstrates, however, that further investigation of underutilized or poorly placed CLZ's, particularly in the Core Zone, would be prudent and beneficial. The City should consider developing definitive criteria for citing future CLZ's in the downtown and make better use of combination zones that serve commercial loading and unloading in the morning hours while also serving customer/visitor needs (as metered parking) during the midday and afternoon peaks. The Parking Steering Committee could assist the City in developing business/customer-friendly standards for the placement of CLZ's as well as strategic reductions in the current number of underutilized loading areas.

#### 5. Continue periodic re-striping of on-street parking.

The majority of on-street parking within the study area is striped. Striping is effective because it assists the customer in identifying a parking stall, thereby creating a sense of order and convenience. (*On-street parking has been restriped in August/September 2004.*)

# 6. Re-capture parking in on-street areas by adding parking in currently designated no parking areas and/or through use of angled parking to maximize parking in existing metered areas.

The Downtown Spokane Partnership recently completed a detailed analysis of block faces in the downtown that are currently no parking zones. This report recommends transitioning these block faces to metered parking areas. Many of these block faces could "add back" metered parking with minimal impact to the traffic system, thereby cost effectively increasing on-street parking supply. Adding curbside parking (parallel and/or angled) will increase capacity, slow traffic speeds through the downtown and enhance the 'walkability' of affected block faces. Additionally, the DSP conducted another analysis that identifies areas where existing parallel parking stalls can be converted to angled parking, resulting in a net increase in total parking stalls.<sup>3</sup> Every stall recaptured will result in a savings of \$20,000 in potential parking construction costs and return the City an average of \$630 in parking revenue.

It is recommended that the Downtown Parking Manager and Parking Steering Committee thoroughly evaluate the DSP reports and move toward implementation of the recommendations in areas where metered and angled parking can be added to the supply recognizing traffic and/or safety impacts. This level of analysis would be beyond the scope of this study and require consultation with certified traffic engineers. Nonetheless, the opportunity to recapture on-street parking will add parking to the downtown supply and improve the pedestrian environment for future development/redevelopment.

7. Conduct an evaluation of existing signage in the downtown and remove/eliminate obsolete and confusing signage from the public right of way. The downtown currently has informational and/or directional signage in the public right of way that is confusing and obsolete. For instance, signage along Riverside prohibits parking between 10:00 p.m. and 6:00 a.m. Existing public parking directional signage is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See DSP report to Roger Flint (Director or Spokane Public Works), dated March 10, 2004.





Right of way signage: Portland

Right of way signage: Vancouver, WA

in the right of way but is not tied to any off-street parking. It is recommended that the Downtown Parking Manager and Parking Steering Committee conduct a thorough physical evaluation of signage related to parking and implement a process to remove unnecessary signage.

8. Develop and strategically place a new and unique wayfinding signage package in the right of way to direct visitors to publicly accessible off-street locations.

The PSC should develop distinct, recognizable and intuitive directional signage on the roadways that directs customers to specific parking publicly available facilities. This will be of greatest importance at primary portals into the downtown, at major traffic intersections and at primary points of ingress at targeted facilities. It is also recommended that the signage package be consistent with, and complementary of, the signage package developed for off-street facilities (see 9, below).

9. Develop a signage package of uniform design, logo and color for placement in publicly available off-street locations.

Creating a uniform signage package that incorporates a unique logo and color scheme for public parking facilities will establish a sense of recognition, identity and customer orientation for users of the downtown parking *system*. The challenge for Spokane will be to work in partnership with private owners and operators of parking to display a uniform and consistent "parking message" at key privately owned/operated facilities in the downtown.

The following is recommended:

- a. Develop a signage package that incorporates a uniform design, logo, and color scheme into all informational signage related to parking.
- b. Evaluate land use and code implications of the signage package program particularly size, design and placement issues associated with off-street facilities, and initiate changes as appropriate.
- c. Identify key locations throughout the downtown that would best serve as customer parking lots/garages (by location, size and proximity to visitor destinations).
- d. "Brand" each off-street public facility, open to public access, with the established "logo" package.

- e. Utilize signage to display clear and simple rate information by time of day, day of week and/or event.
- f. Investigate the purchase and installation of such signage for private owners as part of shared use parking agreements (see 10, below).
- 10. Negotiate shared use and/or lease agreements with owners of private surface lots and parking structures to provide for an interim supply of parking per desired use(s).

Twenty-eight private lots and garages were inventoried during the data survey. Eight of these facilities are located within the Core Zone and are significantly underutilized, even during peak times.<sup>4</sup> At the peak hour these lots have 1,879 empty stalls (1,102 in the Core Zone) and generally display signage that is inconsistent and confusing to customers and visitors. The ability of the parking system to "capture" as many of these stalls as are available in the peak hour for more active management will provide a relatively low cost and effective near-term strategy for mitigating existing access constraints during peak demand periods.

It is recommended that the PSC:

- a. Initiate an effort to work with owners of private lots to enter into shared use agreements to allow underutilized parking to be made available to customer/visitor or employee uses (as appropriate).
- b. Explore the development of incentives to encourage such agreements (i.e., signage, landscaping, lighting, sidewalk improvements, leasing, etc.)

### 11. Develop and implement minimum appearance standards for <u>existing</u> surface parking in the downtown.



Existing surface parking facilities in the downtown vary in quality and design. The Downtown Parking Manager and the Parking Steering Committee should develop a set of base appearance standards that would be applied over time to all existing surface parking facilities in the downtown. These standards would parallel those already in place for new surface parking lot development. Development of this policy should include discussions with all stakeholders including parking lot and building owners.

Standards now in place for new surface

parking that would be applied to existing surface lots include:

Older lot created before standards developed

- a. Quality of surface
- b. Location/orientation of pedestrian pathways and abutting sidewalks

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Peak hour occupancy in off-street facilities is 65.6% for the entire South Study area and 66.7% in the Core Zone.

c. Landscaping, signage and lighting standards

There are no current processes in place to require existing lots to meet specific

appearance standards. As such, the Parking Steering Committee should investigate possible incentives that could be adopted for use in leveraging private sector participation in surface lot upgrades. These could include limited reduction in City property taxes equal to the cost of upgrade, infrastructure grants, etc. The PSC should engage all stakeholders including lot and building owners in the process.



Lot developed using minimum uniform standards

12. Develop a mitigation plan for publicly available parking supply lost to development and/or redevelopment of existing parking sites.

The recently completed survey of parking in the downtown did not reveal an overall parking "deficit" in the downtown. Current data indicates that a significant number of parking stalls now exist (off-street) to meet growing demand. However, a large percentage of the parking supply that is currently "available" is located on surface parking lots.<sup>5</sup> The *Plan for a New* Downtown calls for significant development and redevelopment of many of these parcels in the downtown. As such, development of these sites would likely result in a net loss of supply unless policies, programs and strategies were in place to assure that existing demand is somehow accommodated as new development occurs.

The City should begin the process for outlining a definitive action plan for mitigating the possible loss of parking supply through development and redevelopment. In the mean time, several specific strategies for better managing existing supplies and identification of shared parking opportunities are outlined in this plan (see specifically items 2, 3, 4, 6, 8, 9 and 10, above), which would maximize and encourage use of existing "surpluses" of parking identified in the parking survey in the near to mid-term.

13. Develop a policy that encourages private sector development of publicly available parking in the downtown and/or implementation of Transportation Demand Management (TDM) programs to increase access capacity to the downtown. Developers generally provide and manage parking to serve exclusive accessory uses to their particular site. As such, sites are often developed without benefit of a process or policy that would allow for discussions to maximize both the accessory and public supply of parking in a given private project or to encourage employees to use alternative transportation modes.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> This is particularly true in the Convention Center and Periphery Zones.

Given the cost of parking development, it would be important and useful for the City to encourage the development of publicly available parking and TDM programs/infrastructure in future private development projects. The opportunity to incent either more flexible management of private supplies (allowing general public access) or additional supply for public use within a private project should be explored as well as TDM systems that could reduce overall development costs.

The first step to creating a "toolbox" of incentives requires development of a formal policy that would allow the City to offer incentives if specific public parking and transportation goals were met in the context of a private downtown development.

#### Mid–Term Implementation – (by June 2007)

The following strategies are recommended for mid-term implementation.

14. Begin implementation of a program for upgrading surface lots to provide a minimum appearance standard (i.e., lighting, quality of surface, signage and stall striping).

Upgrades to existing surface parking facilities should begin upon completion of a policy, program and plan developed as a result of efforts outlined in B. 11, above.

### 15. Create and implement a package of incentives for the private development of publicly available parking supply and TDM options in the downtown.

It is recommended that the City create and implement a package of incentives that would be made available to private developers that allow for or add publicly available parking into downtown development projects. Similar incentives would be created for privately initiated Transportation Demand Management programs. The package of incentives would follow adoption of a parking incentive policy described in B. 13, above.

Examples of development incentives currently available in other jurisdictions include (but are not limited to):

- Floor Area Ratio (FAR) bonuses
- Height bonuses
- Permit fee waivers
- Impact fee waivers
- Supply/revenue agreements<sup>6</sup>
- Property tax abatements

#### 16. Consider a strategy for future parking pricing.

The operating principles developed for each parking zone contain options for the implementation of on-street parking pricing as assets under the City's ownership/control. Options can range from pricing parking in specific areas (e.g., City-owned off-street parking) to pricing specific users (e.g., employees, all day parkers, etc.) to a comprehensive system of pricing that would include metering on- and off-street. At present, the City does not own any off-street parking. The City only controls pricing for on-street parking.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Revenue agreements are lease agreements whereby the City agrees to a guaranteed lease for spaces at a negotiated rate per stall.

Together with City staff, the Parking Steering Committee should begin discussion of a coordinated strategy for how parking pricing would be implemented as the demand for parking and new parking supply evolve in the mid- to long-term, specifically in facilities owned or controlled by the City. Once developed, the parking pricing strategy should be presented to the City Council for review and approval.

The outline of strategy issues presented below is intended to inform the City on major decision and management guidelines should pricing become necessary as a means to maximize and facilitate access capacity.

#### a. Pricing on-street parking and enforcement to increase efficiency and capacity.

As the 85% Rule triggers additional and more aggressive management of the supply, Spokane may at some future point consider more complex systems for pricing parking and enforcement. At that point pricing would be intended to (a) facilitate more efficient turnover, (b) encourage use of specific facilities in specific management zones (i.e., short-term vs. employee parking), (c) encourage use of alternative modes, (d) remain consistent with comparable cities and markets and (e) provide funding source for new supply and alternative mode options.

In the context of pricing, Spokane should also consider new technologies available and in place in other cities that allow for flexibility in the management of parking pricing and contribute and complement Spokane's existing and desired urban form. "Multi-space metering" and "pay-and-display" systems are an example of these types of technology, which allow a City to charge for parking without "cluttering" the pedestrian way with individual meters.

b. <u>Create varied rate structures to incent employee</u> parking in specific areas.

By creating rate structures that encourage off-street parking, the City can allow rate to influence employees' decisions on where to park (for instance, lower monthly rate to park in off-street location, higher rate in specific on-street locations).

17. Consider options that would establish a funding program to support future development of new supply. Given the existing "market rate" for parking in Spokane, it is doubtful that new parking supply will be self-supporting.



The cost of new development is expensive. Therefore, *collaborative efforts* must be initiated that recognize that multiple funding sources will need to be developed and implemented.

#### 18. Routinely conduct parking inventory analyses in the downtown.

The recently completed analysis of Spokane's parking inventory provides excellent information on parking utilization, turnover, and duration and peak hour capacity.

The need for this data is very important as a foundation piece for determining actions to maximize parking supply. Periodic monitoring of parking activity will allow Spokane to (a) better coordinate enforcement, (b) assure maximum utilization based on intended uses

and (c) provide solid evidence for the need to move to higher and/or more aggressive levels of parking management.

It is recommended that:

- a. A parking inventory analysis is conducted at least every two years. Information from these updates would be forwarded to the Parking Manager and the Parking Steering Committee for review, evaluation and development of strategy recommendations. Recommendations would be forwarded to the Mayor and City staff for consideration for implementation.<sup>7</sup>
- b. The City explore technology options that are available that would allow enforcement personnel to gather inventory data on a more frequent and/or targeted basis.

## 19. Consider a process that would identify strategically located land parcels that could be used as future off-street parking locations as a means to support the parking objectives of *The Plan for a New Downtown*.

The PSC should identify areas within each parking zone and in peripheral areas that would serve as strategic points of parking access in the downtown. This process should carefully consider the development and access needs envisioned in *The Plan for a New Downtown* to provide for convenient and efficient parking opportunities for patrons of the downtown. Strategically identifying future parking sites allows the PSC to work with stakeholders, the public and private sectors to effectively coordinate future parking supply needs (see 17, above, and Section VI on issues related to funding).

#### Long–Term Implementation – (by June 2009)

The following strategies are recommended for long-term implementation.

 20. Complete development and open new supply to serve priority patron uses. Completion of site identification, planning, outreach and funding efforts described in 12, 13, 15, 17 and 19, above, would be finalized and the project completed and opened to the public.

#### C. PARKING MANAGEMENT STRATEGIES – ZONE BASED



Upon completion of the parking inventory, several specific recommendations for implementation within the specific parking management zones were developed. The following strategies are recommended for near-term to mid-term implementation.

#### Core Zone (Zone A)

1. Convert all current 10 to 30-minute, 1-hour and 2-hour meters in the Core Zone to 90 minutes.

The inventory of downtown parking indicated that the average patron stay in the Core Zone is 1 hour and 28

minutes (or 1.46 hours). At this time, 75 percent of metered parking in the Core Zone is for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Inventory updates could be provided by using existing enforcement personnel to conduct random sampling and/or parking counts. This is done in other cities (i.e., Kirkland and Vancouver, WA) and can result in significant cost savings as compared to comprehensive inventories similar to the one that supports this report and plan.

stays of one hour or less. The result is an extremely high rate of time stay violations (20.7 percent). Standardizing all metered parking in this zone at 90 minutes will better correlate allowed time stay to actual patron need and simplify access for customers using the zone.

#### Convention Center Zone (Zone B)

2. Convert current 10 to 30-minute and 1-hour meters in the Convention Center Zone to a minimum of 2-hour parking. Continue to provide strategically located longer-term parking stays (3 to 10-hours) throughout the zone and manage these areas to the 85% Rule.

On-street parking in the Convention Center Zone is significantly underutilized at this time.<sup>8</sup> The prevalence of 2-hour meters (54 percent of all meters in the zone) is well coordinated to average patron time stays (1.74 hours). Approximately 46 meters are now for stays of less than 2-hours and should be converted to longer time stay allowances.

The nature of the zone is impacted by the Convention Center, which can at times generate demand for time stays in excess of 2 hours. Given the underutilization of the zone, the City can afford to allow a greater mix of on-street time stays in the zone. Additional 3 and 10-hour zones near the Convention Center may be useful and appropriate.

As demand in the zone increases over time, the 85% Rule would eventually recommend a transition of all on-street parking in the zone to 2-hours. Until such time, greater flexibility for managing this zone is suggested by recent utilization data. The Parking Manager and PSC should routinely monitor this parking zone and make timely recommendations to City staff for initiating appropriate transitions in parking time stays.

3. Conduct a policy and strategy development process to create a plan for managing capacity in this zone as surface parking transitions to new development. The majority of the available supply of off-street parking in this zone is on surface parking lots. In the near term, a large "surplus" of parking exists to accommodate new demand and growth within the district. However, future loss of surface parking to redevelopment could create conflicts/constraints between existing and future commercial, residential and convention/cultural uses. Expectations about responsibility

West End Zone (Zone C)

4. Standardize on-street parking to 2 hours using the 85% Rule as a "trigger" for implementation and consider implementation of limited residential parking permit program for West End residents within 300 feet of building's front door. On street parking in the West End Zone is heavily utilized throughout the day on weekdays, averaging 84.4 percent in the peak hour. The average time stay for the zone is 1.56 hours. Currently, about half the metered area is made up of 2-hour stalls, with a sizable supply (159 stalls) in 3 and 10-hour meters. Conflict for on street parking likely occurs between visitors, residents and employees. Also, publicly available off street parking in the zone is underutilized.

for creating new supply in the future should be discussed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Peak hour occupancy reaches 63.5% between 12:30 p.m. and 1:30 p.m.

As the district begins to exceed 85% of occupancy during the peak hour, attrition of 3 and 10-hour meters within the zone will need to occur. Over time, standardizing parking in the zone to 2 hours will create a more understandable system of access for customers using the zone at a time stay designation that is consistent with demonstrated patron demand. Overlaying a residential parking permit system, allowing residents of the West End to park longer than time stay designations within 300 feet of their address eliminates the need for 3 and 10 hour meters. Employees would be transitioned into available off-street supply. The 85% Rule provides a sound basis for determining the appropriate timing for initiating the conversion of the existing mix of on-street parking to a higher percentage of 2-hour meters.

#### Periphery Zone (Zone D)

5. Implement a higher mix of signed 3 & 10-hour parking stalls on-street in the Periphery Zone. Manage the Zone to the 85% Rule.

During the usage inventory, parking in the Periphery Zone never exceeded 38% in the peak hour, leaving capacity that could be used in the near and mid-term for longer-term stay opportunities. A large portion of on street parking in the zone is currently signed 2-hours (64 percent of stalls). In the near term, a greater proportion of parking in these zones should be signed for 3 and 10-hour parking, which will allow patrons willing to park just outside the Core Zone longer term stay opportunities as it will employees willing to park all day at 10 hour meters. In the long-term, transitioning the zone to stays to meters of less than 3 hours would be determined by future parking inventories measuring areas of usage that would exceed 85% occupancy in the peak hour. At this time, the zone should be managed with the highest level of flexibility to accommodate longer-term stay opportunities.

#### D. MARKETING AND COMMUNICATIONS

A successful parking system will require on-going marketing and communication. The foundation for a marketing and communication program is the signage and wayfinding package recommended in this report. Support of this system can be facilitated through informational maps and brochures about Spokane and its parking system distributed through Business Association, Visitor Services, Retail and Lodging networks.

It is recommended that the BID:

Partner with the City to continue and sustain a marketing and communication system for access in Spokane. The marketing/communication system would include (but not be limited to):

- 1. *Maps*. Develop maps that visually represent the parking zones (i.e., blue zone Core is customer parking, green zone is long-term parking) and identify the location of visitor versus employee facilities.
- 2. Validation program. Evaluate the feasibility of an expanded retail validation system more comprehensively available on lots throughout the downtown.
- *3. TDM alternatives.* Incorporate alternative mode options (i.e., shuttles, transit, and bicycle) into parking communications materials.



- 4. Valet Parking. Explore with restaurant owners the feasibility and costs associated with implementation of valet programs to move customer vehicles to underutilized public facilities.
- 5. City Ticket program. Continue and enhance efforts to transition downtown employees out of Core Zone parking stalls into peripheral parking areas.

#### E. SUMMARY

The City of Spokane is striving to promote growth that fits into the future vision of downtown. A strong parking management plan is one tool that can assist the City in attaining its vision.

A strong parking management plan:

- Defines the intended use and purpose of the parking system.
- Manages the supply
- Enforces parking policies
- Monitors use and responds to changes in demand
- Maintains the intended function of and priorities for the overall system.

This plan has been developed to support the guiding principles and operating principles for parking and access in the downtown. As such, the plan and its strategies reflect the fundamental values and objectives stakeholders have for Downtown Spokane.

The parking management strategies were developed to optimize the use of existing parking resources in Downtown Spokane and realistically prepare for future new supply. These strategies include policy recommendations, near-term management recommendations, and on-going (mid- and long-term) management recommendations.

The strategies are presented in a logical sequence of activities and decision-making that build upon each other. We believe the parking management plan presented in this report will support on-going and sustainable economic vitality for Spokane by assuring access for customers and visitors to downtown and strategies that effectively respond to changes in demand over time.

As with any parking management program, the success of the plan is dependent upon its adoption into City policy. Parking management is an on-going process that requires the commitment of time, resources and public/private effort. The plan and its associated policies and strategies need formal endorsement by the City Council to assure implementation and on-going management of the parking system.

#### Section V: Development of New Parking Supply

The PSC envisions development of a parking garage in the Core or Convention Center Zone as a long-term strategic priority within the parking management plan for downtown. The decision to create new parking supply in structures is an important element in Spokane's *Plan for a New Downtown* in its effort to continue to accommodate customer/visitor access and economic growth.

The cost of structured parking is significant. Planning for the timely development and successful financing of such projects requires combined efforts on the part of the public and private sectors. In this regard, the PSC recognizes the need for all downtown stakeholders to understand the realities of parking development and the impact such a decision can have on parking policy, financing and partnerships.

This section provides a summary of a hypothetical parking development in Downtown Spokane.

#### A. CURRENT PARKING ENVIRONMENT

Information from the parking and utilization study indicates that, within the entire study area, there is an adequate supply of available parking during the peak hours. The weekday average peak occupancy for the study area is approximately 62%. In the Core Zone, peak hour occupancies for the combined supply is approximately 67%, though on street occupancies approach 90% in the evening. In a status quo environment, it would be several years before "constraints" in the public supply were realized. However, the great majority of available parking supply is now located on surface parking lots. As successful implementation of *The Plan for a New Downtown* occurs, the loss of surface supply to new development could hasten the loss of available parking.

#### B. GARAGE DEVELOPMENT SCENARIO

Downtown Spokane's growing downtown area will ultimately require development of new parking supply. The timing for additional supply is contingent on a number of factors, which may include:

- New development and its associated parking demand.
- Losses of existing parking supply through redevelopment (particularly surface parking lots).
- Normal growth in customer, visitor, residential and employee parking demand.
- Successful and timely implementation of recommended parking management strategies.
- Implementation of Transportation Demand Management (TDM) strategies.

To facilitate Spokane's ability to move forward in planning for and financing future parking supply, Task 5 of the scope of work calls for development of a cursory pro forma analysis of parking development and operational costs. This report provides a review and evaluation of possible structured parking scenarios and cost/funding implications of such a development.

#### 1. Background

It is important to recognize that any development pro forma is only as good as the assumptions that are input into it. In the context of this work task, two garage scenarios were prepared. "Scenario A" represents a "mid-range" garage design and "Scenario B" represents a higher end garage design based on urban models developed in other Pacific Northwest cities. The models selected for evaluation were facilities that would meet with Guiding Principle standards for design and compatibility and consistency with the architectural integrity of the downtown.

All assumptions for construction costs/financing, design, demand, revenue generation and parking operation expenses were based on information from comparable parking projects recently developed in the Pacific Northwest. It is essential for purposes of future parking planning that stakeholders reach consensus on the design assumptions for parking structures to assure a clear understanding of the realities associated with development and costs of structured parking.<sup>1</sup> Changes to the assumptions will result in changes to the outputs of the consensus development scenario.

#### 2. Parking Development – Scenario A

This pro forma scenario calls for development of a 323-stall garage constructed on a 40,000 square foot development pad. The facility would be a freestanding parking facility with parking on three levels.<sup>2</sup> The design would be cast concrete, treated to provide an "urban feel." Revenue estimates for the facility assume paid parking for customers and visitors as well as employees in an attempt to maximize revenue. The operating format of the garage is assumed to favor short-term visitor parking in an attempt to maintain consistency with Guiding Principle priorities for future development of parking facilities.<sup>3</sup>



Example Garage Design - Scenario A

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The Downtown Plan includes design requirements for parking structures in the downtown.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Retail was not included in this pro forma analysis to provide an understanding g of the degree to which parking could stand alone in "pencilling" the project. <sup>3</sup> Increasing the number of monthly passes sold at the facility would change revenue projections, though not significantly.

Detailed pro forma work sheets for the PWG parking development scenario are attached to this report (**see Appendix D**). **Table 1** provides a summary of this scenario and the basic data input elements contained within it.

	Free-Standing Downtown Parking Garage
Site size (square footage)	40,000 SF
Number of total parking stalls	323
Retail square footage	0
Front end equity contribution(s)	0
Construction cost per stall (direct hard costs only)	\$13,300
Cost of land to project <sup>5</sup>	\$1,200,000
Development costs (indirect soft costs)	\$2,188,100
Total cost of garage development	\$8,432,640
Rate of finance/term	5%/20 years
Initial monthly parking rate	\$80 per month
Hourly and daily rates	\$1.00 per hour \$5.00 per day \$2.00 eves. /\$2.00 wknds.
Necessary rate of annual revenue growth <sup>6</sup>	3.0%
Annual debt service	\$667,373
Annual <u>Net</u> Income before debt service @ 20 years annualized	\$416,960
Average annual cash flow +/<-> @ 20 years annualized	<\$250,412>
Estimated gross revenue per stall (monthly)	\$125
Revenue per stall necessary to break even (monthly)	\$211

#### Table 1 PSC Parking Development Scenario Pro Forma Assumptions<sup>4</sup>

<sup>5</sup> Assumes land cost of \$30 per square foot.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The pro forma scenario is not intended to be representative of final construction costs for a specific parking project or a final operating format (i.e., mix of monthly, hourly and daily users). This exercise represents a <u>best-case</u> estimate of costs associated with a possible parking development. These costs are based on financing and operating assumptions derived from comparable projects in other jurisdictions in the Pacific Northwest. Overall, the purpose of the pro forma analyses was to test various options and to develop a solid foundation for the planning and financing of future parking supply. <u>New assumptions and additional information can be input into the draft pro forma models as necessary</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Revenue growth can be generated through increased traffic into the facility, through increased rates or a combination of traffic growth and rate increases.

#### A. Key Assumptions – Scenario A

- The 40,000 square foot pad size was assumed for its compatibility with downtown's urban scale. This pad size also allows other uses to be incorporated into the project (i.e. commercial, residential, etc.). A smaller pad would not significantly add to cost, but would add vertical size to the garage and minimize the ability to create a mix of uses.
- Cost of land is assumed at \$30 per foot and no assumptions regarding equity contributions to the project were made.
- Rates modeled in the pro forma are comparable to current rates for parking in the downtown (for hourly, daily, monthly and evening/weekend rates).
- Assumptions for demand, turnover and occupancy are modeled on data provided from the recently completed parking inventory for the downtown (for time of day and day of week).
- Growth in usage of the facility, or increases in rates, occurs at an average of 3% annually.
- This scenario assumes financing at 5% over 20 years and does not model for property taxes based on an expectation of public participation/incentive in the project.

#### B. Key Findings – Scenario A

- Revenue generated would not be sufficient to cover operating and financing costs associated with the development.
- Cash flow averages <\$250,412> annually through the first 20-years of operation. The garage does not show positive cash flow until Year 21.
- "Market" monthly revenue generation would need to be \$211 per stall to break even.

#### 3. Parking Development – Scenario B

This pro forma scenario calls for development of a 323-stall garage constructed on a 40,000 square foot development pad. The facility would be a freestanding parking facility with parking on three

levels. A 20,000 square foot ground level retail component was incorporated into the pro formal in an effort to activate the street level environment. The design standard would be "high-end" utilizing a brick façade and design components that would assure the garage complements and contributes to the architectural integrity of the downtown.

As with Scenario A, the operating format of the garage is assumed to favor short-term visitor parking in an attempt to maintain consistency with Guiding Principle priorities for future development of parking facilities.



Example Garage Design – Scenario B

Detailed pro forma work sheets for this scenario are attached to this report (**see Appendix D**). **Table 2** provides a summary of this scenario and the basic data input elements contained within it.

	Free-Standing Downtown Parking Garage
Site size (square footage)	40,000 SF
Number of total parking stalls	323
Retail square footage	20,000
Front end equity contribution(s)	0
Construction cost per stall (direct hard costs only)	\$14,700
Cost of land to project <sup>8</sup>	\$1,200,000
Total cost of garage development	\$5,040,000
Total cost of retail development	\$1,400,000
Development costs (indirect soft costs)	\$2,903,200
Total cost of development	\$11,184,960
Rate of finance/term	5%/20 years
Retail rent	\$15 per square foot (annual)
Initial monthly parking rate	\$80 per month
Hourly and daily parking rates	\$1.00 per hour / \$5.00 per day \$2.00 eves. / \$2.00 wknds.
Necessary rate of annual revenue growth <sup>9</sup>	3.0%
Annual debt service	\$885,196
Annual <u>Net</u> Income before debt service @ 20 years annualized	\$755,970
Average annual cash flow +/<-> @ 20 years annualized	<\$129,225>
Estimated gross revenue per stall (monthly)	\$130 parking revenue <u>\$84 per stall retail users of garage</u> \$214 per stall per month (combined)
Revenue per stall necessary to break even (monthly)	\$274

### Table 2. PSC Parking Development ScenarioPro Forma Assumptions7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> The pro forma scenario is not intended to be representative of final construction costs for a specific parking project or a final operating format (i.e., mix of monthly, hourly and daily users). This exercise represents a <u>best-case</u> estimate of costs associated with a possible parking development. These costs are based on financing and operating assumptions derived from comparable projects in other jurisdictions in the Pacific Northwest. Overall, the purpose of the pro forma analyses was to test various options and to develop a solid foundation for the planning and financing of future parking supply. <u>New assumptions and additional information can be input into the draft pro forma models as necessary</u>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Assumes land cost of \$30 per square foot.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Revenue growth can be generated through increased traffic into the facility, through increased rates or a combination of traffic growth and rate increases.

#### A. Key Assumptions – Scenario B

- The 40,000 square foot pad size was assumed for its compatibility with downtown's urban scale. This is also an efficient pad size for the inclusion of retail into the ground floor.
- Cost of land is assumed at \$30 per foot and no assumptions regarding equity contributions to the project were made.
- Rates modeled in the pro forma are comparable to current rates for parking in the downtown (for hourly, daily, monthly and evening/weekend rates).
- Assumptions for turnover and occupancy are modeled on data provided from the recently completed parking inventory for the downtown (for time of day and day of week).
- Assumptions for demand are augmented by 10% because of the retail component of the garage, which assumes an increased customer base accessing the retail through the garage.
- Growth in usage of the facility, or increases in rates, occurs at an average of 3% annually.
- The model assumes that retail rents would be used to cover costs associated with the parking garage component of the facility
- This scenario assumes financing at 5% over 20 years and does not model for property taxes based on an expectation of public participation/incentive in the project.

#### B. Key Findings – Scenario A

- Revenue generated would not be sufficient to cover operating and financing costs associated with the development.
- Cash flow averages <\$129,225> annually through the first 20-years of operation. The garage does not show positive cash flow until Year 19.
- The retail component of the development improves the overall cash flow of the project.
- "Market" monthly revenue generation would need to be \$274 per stall (combined retail rent and parking revenue) to <u>break even</u>.

#### C. SUMMARY

Given the negative cash flow identified in the pro forma analyses, it is clear that pursuit of a publicly initiated garage project will require additional revenue beyond the garage's ability to cover its own operating and financing costs. Assumed efficiencies in building design, operating format, financing and equity could be modeled to improve the pro forma outputs should the DSP and/or the PSC wish to engage in a more detailed evaluation of parking development scenarios.

#### Section VI: Funding Options for New Parking Supply and System Management

The fiscal challenges of parking, transportation, and economic development in a downtown are common to many communities across the country. This study recognizes the financial constraints currently facing the City of Spokane. New programs and strategies for managing and, possibly, developing parking supply may be difficult to consider in the near term if public funds are necessary to carry forward priority parking programs and strategies.

Nonetheless, rapid changes in development patterns over the past thirty years have resulted in significant changes to the urban landscape and many downtowns have had to re-examine services they provide and the revenue sources used to fund them. In most instances, communities use a combination of funding sources to cover transportation capacity needs. Per the scope of work and at the direction of the Parking Steering Committee, the Consultant Team reviewed several models to provide a basis for future discussions of funding options for the public parking system. It is believed that some combination of the revenue sources described below will be necessary to assure the feasibility of some parking management strategies called for in this plan and for future structured parking in the downtown envisioned in *The Plan for a New Downtown*.<sup>1</sup> A single revenue source is unlikely to cover the cost of parking management and development.

#### A. POTENTIAL REVENUE SOURCES

This review focuses on a range of parking options that might be available to the City of Spokane. Several of the outlined options may already be in place in the City of Spokane. The options outlined attempt to represent *options most commonly used in other jurisdictions* as well as options that are allowable under Washington State statute. This review borrows heavily from the work of E.D. Hovee and Associates, an economic and development services consultant based in Vancouver, Washington.

#### 1. Most Frequently Used Options

#### A. Options Affecting Customers

**User Revenues** – Represent the foundation of any parking facility's revenue structure, albeit with important questions regarding the degree to which parking fees should be discounted to support other downtown business and revitalization activity. Where the City does have user fees (meters), the average monthly revenue generated is approximately \$53 per metered parking stall per month.<sup>2</sup> Recently published information on the River Park Square garage estimated revenue of approximately \$135 per month, per stall.<sup>3</sup>

**Event Surcharges** – Encompassed within the SSB 5514 public facilities district legislation providing for automobile parking charges in conjunction with regional center facilities. Fees are generally buried in the cost of event ticketing.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> This list of funding options is not intended to be all-inclusive, but rather a sampling of mechanisms in use in other jurisdictions for the purpose of developing public parking supplies.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Data provided by the City of Spokane

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See The Spokesman-Review, Sunday, April 4, 2004, pages A1, A10-A11.

**On-Street Parking Fees** – Many cities elect to collect on-street revenues through parking meters and/or sale of permits. *The Spokane parking meter revenue is encumbered and not available to the parking system for the foreseeable future.* 

**Parking Fine Revenues** – Collected for violations related to overtime and improper parking, and illegal parking in handicapped spaces. *Parking fine revenues are currently encumbered from Municipal Court operations and General Fund obligations.* 

#### B. Options Affecting Businesses

**Parking & Business Improvement District (BID)** – An assessment of businesses rather than property owners. The assessment formula can be based on a number of measurable factors such as assessed values, gross sales, square footage, number of employees, or other factors established by the local legislative authority. In Washington, a BID requires 60% of merchants to agree to the assessment.

#### C. Options Affecting Property Owners

**Local Improvement District (LID)** – A well-established mechanism whereby benefiting property owners are assessed to pay the cost of a major public improvement (including parking). An LID is a property tax assessment that requires "buy-in" by property owners within a specifically identified boundary. LIDs usually result as a consequence of a petition process requiring a majority of owners to agree to an assessment for a specific purpose.

#### D. Options Affecting Developers

**Fee-in-Lieu** – Usually an option given to developers to pay the local jurisdiction an "in-lieu" fee as a way to opt-out of providing parking with a new development (usually the fee-in-lieu option is associated with minimum parking standards). Fees-in-lieu can range from a fee assessed at less than the actual cost of construction, to the full cost of parking construction. The City of Spokane does not have a fee-in-lieu provision for development because parking in the downtown is not a requirement of new development.

**Public / Private Development Partnerships** – Public parking can be an effective tool to facilitate downtown development. This is particularly the case in the state of Washington due to fairly stringent constitutional prohibitions against lending of the state's credit and limited applicability of tax increment financing.

#### E. Options Affecting the General Public

**General Obligation (GO) Bonds** – Involving use of local jurisdiction issued non-voted or voted bonds to develop parking facilities, subject to overall debt limit requirements.

The legal limit for all voter-approved debt in a municipality is 7.5% of assessed value; the legal limit for non-voted debt is 1.5% of assessed value. With GO bonding, the municipality pledges its full faith and credit to repayment of the debt from general fund resources. In effect, general fund revenues would be reserved to repay debt that could not be supported by parking revenues alone.

**Refinancing GO Bonds** - Involves refinancing existing debt and pushing the savings from the general fund to debt coverage for a new parking facility.

**Revenue Bonds** – Pledging parking fee and other designated revenue sources to the repayment of bonds but without the need to pledge full faith and credit of the issuing authority.

Revenue bonding is not appropriate in situations where a local jurisdiction's overall debt limit is a factor and projected revenues are inadequate or not deemed of sufficient certainty to cover required debt service (plus a debt coverage factor). Interest rates also are typically higher for revenue than GO bond financing.

**63-20 Financing** – Identified as a potential alternative to traditional GO, revenue bond and LID bond financing in the post Initiative 695 era. 63-20 financing (after the IRS Revenue Ruling 63-20) which allows a qualified non-profit corporation to issue tax-exempt bonds on behalf of a government. Financed assets must be "capital" and must be turned over free and clear to the government by the time that bonded indebtedness is retired.

When a municipality uses this technique to finance a public facility, it can contract for the services of a non-profit corporation (as the "issuer") and a builder. The issuer acts on behalf of the municipality, but has no real business interest in the asset being acquired.

**Public Facilities Districts (PFD)** – As authorized by SSB 5514 in the 2002 Legislature to fund "regional centers" and "related parking facilities." A PFD is defined as an independent taxing authority and district under Washington statute. Currently, PFD legislation also allows for what amounts to a sales and use tax rebate of 0.033% from the State of Washington for regional center projects commencing construction by January 1, 2004. This sales tax revenue may serve as the source of repayment for bonding over up to a 25-year period – with matching funds equal to at least 33% of the sales tax revenue coming from other public or private sources.

**Downtown & Neighborhood Commercial Districts** – Also authorized by the 2002 Legislature with SHB 2437 allowing use of incremental increases in local sales and use tax revenue to finance community revitalization projects including "publicly owned or lease facilities."

The amount of funding available is the incremental increase in local sales and use tax over the amount generated from within the boundaries of a geographically defined downtown or neighborhood commercial district – above and beyond the amount of revenues generated prior to the creation of the district.

**Community Renewal** – As enacted with SHB 2357 by the 2002 Legislature to update the state's urban renewal laws including authorization for public improvement financing from multiple revenue sources including tax-exempt, non-recourse revenue bonds. Requires determination of blight, which may render this option unusable in Spokane.

**Parking Fund** – State of Washington statute enables local municipalities to establish parking commissions and funding mechanisms for parking. The parking fund may encompass all pertinent revenue and expense items, and therefore offers a convenient mechanism for management of parking operations and budgeting.

**State & Federal Grants** – In the past, a variety of state and federal grant programs have been applied to funding downtown parking structures. In the current environment of more limited state/federal funding, there are no longer any readily identifiable programs as suitable for parking facility development.

This listing of potential sources is not necessarily exhaustive, as other communities have used yet additional sources – which may or may not be applicable to Spokane's situation. Nor are these sources intended to be mutually exclusive. Funding for parking facilities often requires application of multiple sources – for what might be considered as layered financing.

#### B. SUMMARY

It is apparent that as Downtown Spokane grows, so too will demand for parking. New development, a faster pace of trip growth, losses of current parking supply on surface lots, parking and transportation demand management programs and/or other events can work to accelerate or moderate the need for new parking supply.

The current parking market in downtown Spokane suggests the feasibility of a new parking structure will require additional sources of revenue beyond anticipated parking revenue generated by a facility. To this end, the process for considering how a new parking facility will eventually be developed in the downtown needs to be initiated if the downtown is to be prepared to meet future demand and support existing business' continued growth. Similarly, a "package" of funding options will need to be developed and implemented. This process is recommended as a near to mid-term strategy in the overall parking management plan for the downtown to be implemented by a new Parking Steering Committee.

#### Section VII: Summary

Spokane has done a good job in managing its parking assets to this point in time. What is lacking is a clear, flexible and consensus based blueprint for using parking management to support and facilitate the longer-term strategic vision. This plan provides that blueprint. It will serve as a guide to maximizing the City's existing parking resources and as a means to assure cost effective solutions for access, which includes new parking supply and transportation demand management programs and strategies.

This parking management plan defines the intended use and purpose of the parking system; manages the supply and enforces the parking policies; monitors the use and responds to changes in demand; and, maintains the intended function of the overall system.

In addition, the City of Spokane is striving to promote growth that fits into the future vision of *The Plan for a New Downtown* and is consistent with future transportation goals. In light of these issues, the parking management plan is intended to promote sustainable economic vitality through sound parking management for customers and visitors to Downtown, while also providing a framework that is supportive of other alternative mode programs for access.

This plan has been developed to build upon guiding principles and operating principles that are based on the fundamental values and objectives for Downtown Spokane. The parking management strategies were identified to optimize the use of existing parking in Downtown Spokane. These strategies include policy, zone specific and on-going area wide strategy recommendations. The success of the plan is dependent upon its adoption, including the guiding principles and operating principles. Adoption of the plan will be essential to implementation.

It is apparent that as Downtown Spokane grows, so too will demand for parking. New development, a faster pace of trip growth, losses of current parking supply on surface lots, parking and transportation demand management programs and/or other events can work to accelerate or moderate the need for new parking supply.

In summary, the plan developed through this process recognizes the importance of parking and access in the success of downtown's economic development future. The plan and its associated strategies provide a context from which coordinated and strategic parking management can begin.

#### APPENDIX A Parking Inventory Analysis – Existing Conditions

In every downtown the issue of parking is central to stakeholders as they plan for the downtown's on-going economic success. The need to understand both the perception *and* reality of parking is essential if a comprehensive and successful parking management strategy is to be developed and implemented. This section focuses on establishment of a clear understanding of the reality of current parking dynamics in Downtown Spokane.

#### A. PURPOSE OF THE PARKING INVENTORY ANALYSIS

The purpose of a parking utilization study is to derive a comprehensive and detailed understanding of actual use dynamics and access characteristics associated with parking in the downtown. Important elements of this section include:

- (1) Development of a data template for all parking in the study area, denoting all parking stalls, by time stay type, for on and off-street facilities.
- (2) A complete survey of parking use over two "typical days." This included a single Thursday and Saturday in May 2004.
- (3) Analysis of parking utilization and turnover that included:
  - a. Quantification of total study area parking inventory.
  - b. Hourly occupancy counts (10:30 a.m. 9:30 p.m.) for on and off-street inventory.
  - c. Parking turnover analysis (on and off-street).
  - d. Parking duration of stay analysis (on and off-street).
  - e. Time stay abuse analysis.
  - f. Loading and Passenger Zone utilization analysis.
- (4) Identification of parking surpluses and constraints in the parking supply.

In short, the purpose of the parking utilization study was to produce a succinct analysis of existing parking dynamics in Downtown Spokane that can be employed over time to support and inform decision-making related to development and parking.<sup>1</sup>

#### B. STUDY AREA

The parking inventory study area was determined in the initial project scoping process. Two study zones were defined, the South and North Study Zones. **Figures 1 & 2** provide a detailed visual map of the study zones with the sub zones for which data was analyzed (in the South Study area). The boundaries of the South and North Study Zones were developed in consultation with the DSP and the PSC prior to initiation of the data gathering effort.

The South Study Zone is a large area of the downtown generally comprised of the parking area bounded by Spokane Falls Boulevard (on the north), Third Avenue (on the south), Cedar (on the west) and Division (on the east).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Copies of all data templates have been provided to the Downtown Spokane Partnership for future use. The data templates incorporate hourly parking counts for every stall, by block face and publicly accessible garage, in the study area.


Figure 1: South Study Area w/ Sub Zones

Figure 2: North Study Area



The North Study Zone is generally comprised of the parking area bounded by Cedar and Post (on the west and east, respectively) and Mallon and Bridge (on the North and South, respectively).

# C. METHODOLOGY

Melvin Mark Development Company (MMDC), Nelson/Nygaard (N/N) and Robinson Research (RR) conducted the capacity/utilization and turnover inventory on two separate days, Thursday, May 20, 2004 and Saturday, May 22, 2004. The survey days were selected in consultation with the DSP, the City and the PSC. Overall, both days displayed consistent parking activity in all sectors of the downtown. The Thursday parking inventory was conducted between 10:30 a.m. and 9:30 p.m. The Saturday parking inventory was conducted between 11:30 a.m. and 10:30 p.m.

The project team's methodological approach to gathering parking utilization/capacity/turnover data began with a physical compilation of all public parking assets (on and off-street) within the study area and the activity zones. This physical assessment was conducted in advance of the survey days and documented all parking by location and type. This was used to create a data template necessary to conduct the utilization assessment.

The survey itself involved an hourly accounting of each occupied on-street parking stall in the study area using the last four digits of the parked vehicle's license plate. All public off-street facilities were similarly documented. "Publicly available" parking stalls in private parking facilities were assessed for capacity only. They were not surveyed for turnover or duration given that time stay limitations in these lots were not in place. In addition, private facilities were only surveyed during hours when they were posted and available for actual public use.

The first level of data analysis for each study area (South and North) combined all parking data for the larger study area. Due to the size of the South Study Zone, a more detailed analysis of the data was then conducted. This led to development of four distinct parking "activity" zones within the South Study Zone area for which inventory data was sorted and analyzed.<sup>2</sup> These "sub zones" are identified on the Figure 1 South Study Zone boundary map. These data collection zones are reflective of the PSC's understanding of current parking activity and land use densities in the downtown. These zones allowed for a more comprehensive look at parking patterns, trends and surpluses/deficits in the downtown.

# D. INVENTORY OF PARKING - SOUTH STUDY ZONE (WEEKDAY)

Data findings for the South Study Zone will be presented here from five perspectives. This will include:

- <u>Entire study area</u>. Data findings for the entire South Study Zone, which analyzes parking activity as it occurs throughout the entire study area. Findings from this perspective may understate high activity areas within the downtown as periphery area data is combined with data from higher activity zones.
- <u>Core Zone</u>. Data findings for the Core Zone of the downtown. Findings from this perspective present a clear picture of on and off-street utilization in the commercial core of the downtown.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> See Section IV of this report for further discussion of zones.

- <u>Convention Center Zone.</u> Data will be presented for parking activity in the eastern end of the downtown, which incorporates on and off-street parking use adjacent to the convention center.
- <u>West End Zone</u>. Data will be presented for parking activity in the western sector of the downtown.
- <u>Periphery Zone</u>. Data will be presented for parking activity in the southern most sector of the downtown.

# 1. Data Findings - Entire Study Zone

# A. Composition of the Supply

The South Study Zone maintains a total of **8,878** parking stalls. MMDC conducted actual hourly counts of 7,421 of these stalls (or 84% of the total supply).<sup>3</sup> Of surveyed stalls, 1,965 stalls were located on-street and 5,456 were located in 29 off-street lots/garages.<sup>4</sup> **Table 1** presents a breakout of the surveyed parking supply in the South Study Zone. Detailed graphs illustrating usage for this study zone are provided as **Graph A** at the end of this chapter.

South Study Area Parking Stall Breakout									
On-Street Meters by Type	On-Street Meters by Type Number of Stalls								
0.25	35	2%							
0.5	107	5%							
1	398	20%							
1.5	23	1%							
2	920	47%							
3	231	12%							
6	0	-							
10	251	13%							
Sub-Total On-Street Parking Stalls	1,965	100%							
Off-Street Parking Stalls (Sub-Total)	5,456								
Total Surveyed Supply	7,421								

 TABLE 1

 SOUTH STUDY ZONE: COMPOSITION OF SURVEYED PARKING SUPPLY

Overall, the South Study Zone maintains a high percentage of 2.0 hour parking stalls, nearly half the on-street supply (47%) is made up of these types of stalls. One-hour stalls make up approximately 20% of the on-street supply. Interestingly, nearly seven percent of on-street stalls are for stays of 30-minutes or less (142 total stalls).

# B. Use of On-Street Metered Supply

*On-street* parking in the study zone operates with a "dual peak" hour. As **Table 2**, below, indicates the mid-day peak hour for parking demand in this zone occurs between 11:30 a.m. – 12:30 p.m. At that time, 61.5% of all on-street parking stalls in the zone are occupied. During

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> MMDC was able to survey 100% of all on-street stalls and 79% of all off-street stalls available for public use (5,456 of 6,913).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> MMDC conducted a detailed physical inventory of off-street parking locations in the downtown. Within the South study zone, MMDC identified 62 total lots/garages available to general public parking. Additional lots exist within the zone, but are not available to general public use.

this peak hour of demand, 757 stalls are empty and available for use in the South Study Zone. Another "evening peak" occurs between 6:30 p.m. – 7:30 p.m. when the on-street supply reaches 62% occupancy, most likely representative of a build up of patrons visiting evening activities associated with restaurants and entertainment. At the evening peak, 746 stalls on-street stalls are empty and available for use within the study area.

On- Street Parking ( <u>1,965</u> total stalls)		10:30. – 11:30 a.m.	11:30 – 12:30 p.m. PEAK	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 - 2:30 p.m.	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m. PEAK	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
Metered (1,714 stalls)	Stalls Occupied by Hour	777	968	926	838	717	817	948	1,049	1,057	938	739
10 hour (251 stalls)	Stalls Occupied by Hour	87	120	127	122	103	112	110	80	81	56	38
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour											
	$\rightarrow$	48.4%	61.5%	60.1%	55.1%	47.0%	53.0%	59.4%	61.5%	62.0%	53.4%	41.5%
	Empty Stalls Available by Hour	1,014	757	785	883	1,042	924	797	756	746	915	1,150

 TABLE 2

 SOUTH STUDY ZONE: ON-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

# C. General Characteristics of Use – On-Street Metered Supply

Over the course of the entire study day (i.e., 10:30 a.m. to 9:30 p.m.), approximately 6,235 unique license plates were recorded using the 1,965 metered parking stalls within the study zone.<sup>5</sup> These vehicles logged a total of 9,768 parked hours. If only the period between 10:30 a.m. and 5:30 p.m. is considered (i.e., hours during which enforcement is in effect), 3,846 unique license plates were recorded (or 62% of all vehicles recorded).

The average duration of stay for a vehicle parked at a meter during hours of enforcement was 1 hour and 32 minutes (1.56 hours). As such, over the course of an 8-hour day, a metered stall will turn just over five times (8 hour day/1.56 hours duration = 5.1 turns). If the intended use for a meter is one hour, then the stall should turn 8 times over an eight-hour period. If the intended use for a meter is two hour parking then turnover should be no less than four turns over an eight-hour period. Given that the majority of metered stalls in the district allow for time stays of two hours or more, turnover in the *larger* study zone is generally efficient.

Interestingly, time stay violations occur in nearly 16.0% of the stalls surveyed. Stated differently, more than one in ten patrons overstays the posted limit for the stall they are using. This is a very high rate for time stay violations and could be the result of several factors that will be considered later in this section (see Section 2, C, below).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> It is important to note that this does not represent all vehicles in the downtown on May 20, 2004 as license plate numbers were not recorded in off-street facilities or at un-metered parking stalls and the study did not capture use prior to 10:30 a.m. The unique vehicle total allows us to calculate turnover.

Table 3, below, summarizes the characteristics of use for the study zone.

USE CHARACTERISTIC	DATA FINDING
Number of unique vehicles (entire study day)	6,235
Number of total vehicle hours (total hours that cars parked in the study zone)	9,768
Number of unique vehicles (10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	3,846
Average duration per unique vehicle (entire study day)	1.57 hrs (1 hour and 34 minutes)
Average duration per unique vehicle during enforcement period (10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	1.56 hrs (1 hour and 32 minutes)
Turnover (number of cars to use a single occupied stall over an 8 hour period)	5.1 times
% of all vehicles violating the posted time stay	15.9%

 TABLE 3

 GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF USE - METERED STALLS

#### D. Use of Off-Street Supply

The *off-street* supply of parking reaches peak capacity between 1:30 p.m. and 2:30 p.m. Use of the facilities remains constant between the hours of 10:30 a.m. and 3:30 p.m., exceeding 60% occupancy in each of those hours, which is consistent with patterns for commuter parking typical of off-street use in other urban areas.

Off-Street Parking		10:30. - 11:30 a.m.	11:30 - 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 - 2:30 p.m. PEAK	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
29 lots/	Stalls											
garages	Occupied											
stalls)		3330	3399	3558	3577	3465	3153	2622	1731	1534	1357	1160
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	61.0%	62.3%	65.2%	65.6%	63.5%	57.8%	48 1%	31 7%	28.1%	24.9%	21.3%
	Empty	01.070	02.070	00.2 /0	00.070	00.070	57.070	40.170	51.770	20.170	24.570	21.070
	Available											
	By Hour	2126	2057	1898	1879	1991	2303	2834	3725	3922	4099	4296

 TABLE 4

 SOUTH STUDY ZONE OFF-STREET PARKING SUMMARY<sup>6</sup>

As **Table 4**, above, indicates the off-street supply reaches 65.6% of capacity at the peak hour. As such, at the peak hour of demand 1,879 stalls are empty and available for use off-street in the South Study Zone.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> MMDC has usage data for each individual off-street lot/garage surveyed. Through agreement with property owners of these facilities, MMDC has grouped the data together to assure confidentiality of use.

# E. Use of the Combined Supply (On and Off-Street)

When both on and off-street supplies are combined, the peak hour for parking in the South Study Zone occurs between 12:30 p.m. and 1:30 p.m. During this peak hour 63.8% of the parking supply is occupied, leaving approximately 2,683 empty parking stalls available for use. **Table 5** below, summarizes the use characteristics of the combined parking supply.

COMBINED AREA TOTAL (7.421 Stalls)		10:30. _ 11:30 a.m.	11:30 - 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m. PEAK	1:30 - 2:30 p.m.	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
On-street	Stalls											
(1,965	Occupied	054	4 000	4 4 9 9	4 000	000	4.044	4 4 0 0	4 000	4 0 4 0	4 050	045
stalls)		951	1,208	1,180	1,082	923	1,041	1,168	1,209	1,219	1,050	815
Off-street (5,456 stalls)		3330	3399	3558	3577	3465	3153	2622	1731	1534	1357	1160
Combined occupied stalls		4281	4607	4738	4659	4388	4194	3790	2940	2753	2407	1975
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	57.7%	62.1%	63.8%	62.8%	59.1%	56.5%	51.1%	39.6%	37.1%	32.4%	26.6%
	Empty Stalls Available											
	by Hour	3140	2814	2683	2762	3033	3227	3631	4481	4668	5014	5446

TABLE 5 SOUTH STUDY ZONE: COMBINED ON & OFF-STREET PARKING AREA SUMMARY

# *F.* General Conclusions for the Combined South Study Zone

The South Study Zone operates with a convenient surplus of parking during its peak hours of operation. As such, surpluses of parking exist in both the on-street and off-street supply within the boundaries of the entire study zone. Turnover is efficient in the larger context of stalls designated for stays of two hours or more, which represents the majority of parking in the study area. However, the high percentage of time stay violations indicates that the overall mix of time stay designations (i.e., stays of less than 1.5 hours) may not be appropriate to serve the average duration of stay for patrons utilizing the zone.

In general, the South Study Zone appears to have adequate capacity to meet current and future levels of demand.

# 2. Data Findings – <u>Core Parking Zone</u>

For purposes of this analysis, MMDC defined the Core Zone as the area comprised of parking located between Spokane Falls Boulevard (north), First Avenue (south), Monroe (west) and Washington (east). **Figure 3**, below, provides a map of this study zone.



# A. Composition of the Supply

MMDC surveyed a total of 3,795 stalls in the Core Zone. Of surveyed stalls, 486 stalls were located on-street and 3,309 were located in nine off-street lots/garages. **Table 6** presents a breakout of the surveyed parking supply in the Core Zone. Detailed graphs illustrating usage for this study zone are provided as **Graph B** at the end of this chapter.

Core Zone Parking Stall Breakout									
On-Street Meters by Type	Number of Stalls	% of Total On-Street Stalls							
0.25	27	6%							
0.5	65	13%							
1	299	62%							
1.5	23	4%							
2	72	15%							
3	0	0%							
6	0	0%							
10	0	0%							
Sub-Total On-Street Parking Stalls	486	100%							
Off-Street Parking Stalls (Sub-Total)	3,309								
TOTAL Core Zone Parking Supply	3,795								

# TABLE 6 CORE ZONE: COMPOSITION OF THE PARKING SUPPLY

Overall, the Core Zone maintains a high percentage of 1.0 hour parking stalls, with over 62% of the on-street supply made up of these types of stalls. This is consistent with an operating intent to support high turnover in an area supportive of ground level retail and short-term visits. A number of stalls (102 stalls or 19%) are dedicated to stays of 30 minutes or less. The remainder of the zone (95 total stalls) provides a mix of 1.5 - 2.0 hour parking meters.

# B. Use of On-Street Metered Supply

Consistent with results from the entire South Study Zone (see above), *on-street* parking in the Core Zone operates with a "dual peak" hour. As **Table 7**, below, indicates the "mid-day peak hour" for parking demand in this zone occurs between 11:30 a.m. – 12:30 p.m. At that time, 84.4% of all on-street parking stalls in the zone are occupied, which is close to the parking industry "optimum" standard of 85%. During this peak hour of demand, only 76 on-street stalls are empty and available for use in the Core Zone.

On- Street Parking CORE ZONE		10:30. – 11:30 a.m.	11:30 - 12:30 p.m. PEAK	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 - 2:30 p.m.	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m. PEAK	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
Metered (486 stalls)	Stalls Occupied by Hour	302	410	363	347	303	359	409	436	399	368	298
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	62.1%	84.4%	74.7%	71.4%	62.3%	73.9%	84.2%	89.7%	82.1%	75.7%	61.3%
	Empty Stalls Available											
	by Hour	184	76	123	139	183	127	77	50	87	118	188

 TABLE 7

 CORE ZONE: ON-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

Another "evening peak" occurs between 5:30 p.m. - 6:30 p.m. when the on-street supply reaches 89.7% occupancy, which exceeds the industry standard of 85% occupancy for a facility that is "effectively full" or at "optimum utilization" for retail customer uses. At this hour, only 50 on-street stalls are empty and available for customer use.

Using 85% occupancy as the generally accepted industry standard for optimum utilization of a parking supply, the *on-street* system in the Core Zone operates at a deficit of approximately 23 stalls, the number of stalls necessary to bring the system to an operating capacity of 85 percent.

#### C. General Characteristics of Use – On-Street Metered Supply

Over the course of the entire study day (i.e., 10:30 a.m. to 9:30 p.m.), approximately 2,604 unique license plates were recorded using the 486 metered parking stalls within the Core Zone. This represents 42% of all unique vehicles recorded during the study day. If only the period between 10:30 a.m. and 5:30 p.m. is considered (i.e., hours during which enforcement is in effect), 1,704 unique license plates were recorded (or 44% of all vehicles recorded during enforcement hours).

The average duration of stay for a vehicle parked at a meter during hours of enforcement was 1 hour and 28 minutes (1.46 hours). As such, over the course of an 8-hour day, a metered stall will turn approximately 5.5 times. Given that the majority of parking in the Core Zone is one hour parking, the intended turnover rate for the zone would be closer to eight turns a day. At 5.5 turns, the Core Zone is not operating as intended.

This may be a direct reflection of the high rate of time stay violations that occur in the Core Zone. Violations are at nearly 21.0% of all stalls surveyed. Stated differently, one in five

patrons parked on-street in the Core Zone overstay the posted limit for the stall they are using. The question for the City regarding the Core Zone is whether the 1-hour meter (and the 30-minute meter) is the optimum time stay "mix" or whether a meter stay that more closely reflects observed customer behavior in the zone (i.e., an actual average stay of 1.46 hours) is necessary.

SENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF USE - METERED STALES							
USE CHARACTERISTIC	DATA FINDING						
Number of unique vehicles (entire study day)	2,604						
Number of total vehicle hours (total hours that cars parked in the study zone)	3,994						
Number of unique vehicles (10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	1,704						
	1.53 hrs						
Average duration per unique vehicle (entire study day)	(1 hour and 32 minutes)						
Average duration per unique vehicle during enforcement	1.46 hrs						
period (10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	(1 hour and 28 minutes)						
Turnover (number of cars to use a single occupied stall over an 8 hour period)	5.5 times						
% of all vehicles violating the posted time stay	20.7%						

**Table 8**, below, summarizes usage characteristics of the Core Zone.

#### TABLE 8 GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF USE - METERED STALLS

# D. Use of Off-Street Supply

The *off-street* supply of parking in the Core Zone reaches peak capacity between 1:30 p.m. and 2:30 p.m. This is consistent with the pattern of off-street usage for the entire South Study Zone. As **Table 9**, below, indicates the off-street supply reaches 66.7% of capacity at the peak hour. As such, at the peak hour of demand 1,102 off-street stalls are empty and available for use in the Core Zone.

# E. Use of the Combined Supply (On and Off-Street)

When both on and off-street supplies are combined, the peak hour for parking in the Core Zone occurs between 1:30 p.m. and 2:30 p.m., an hour later than the peak for the entire South Study Zone. During the Core Zone peak hour, 67.3% of the parking supply is occupied, leaving approximately 1,241 empty parking stalls available for use. **Table 10**, below, summarizes the use characteristics of the combined parking supply.

 TABLE 9

 CORE ZONE OFF-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

Off-Street Parking		10:30. _ 11:30 a.m.	11:30 _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 - 2:30 p.m. PEAK	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
8 lots/ garages <u>(3,309</u> total stalls)	Stalls Occupied	1.939	2.045	2.167	2.207	2.131	1.937	1.626	1.112	907	872	721
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	58.6%	61.8%	65.5%	66.7%	64.4%	58.5%	49.1%	33.6%	27.4%	26.4%	21.8%
	Empty Stalls Available By Hour	1,370	1,264	1,142	1,102	1,178	1,372	1,683	2,197	2,402	2,437	2,588

 TABLE 10

 CORE ZONE: COMBINED ON & OFF-STREET PARKING AREA SUMMARY

TOTAL ( <u>3,795</u> Stalls)		10:30. – 11:30 a.m.	11:30 - 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 - 2:30 p.m. PEAK	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
On-street (486 stalls)	Stalls Occupied	302	410	363	347	303	359	409	436	399	368	298
Off-street (3,309 stalls)		1,939	2,045	2,167	2,207	2,131	1,937	1,626	1,112	907	872	721
Combined occupied stalls		2,241	2,455	2,530	2,554	2,434	2,296	2,035	1,548	1,306	1,240	1,019
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	59.1%	64.7%	66.7%	67.3%	64.1%	60.5%	53.6%	40.8%	34.4%	32.7%	26.9%
	Empty Stalls Available by Hour	1 554	1 340	1 265	1.241	1 361	1 499	1 760	2 247	2 219	2 285	2 506

# F. General Conclusions for the Combined Core Zone

The Core Zone operates with a small deficit of parking *on-street* (i.e., approximately 23 stalls). However, a substantial surplus of parking exists in publicly available off-street lots and garages located within the zone. This would suggest a need for better communicating the availability of the off-street supply to patrons of the Core Zone (i.e., wayfinding, signage and/or pricing).

On-street turnover (at a rate of 5.5) is currently less efficient than the intended turnover ratio for a one-hour meter (i.e., 8.0). The high percentage of time stay violations indicates that patrons desire an opportunity to park on-street for visits closer to 1.5 hours.

In general, the Core Zone appears to have an adequate capacity of parking to meet current and future levels of demand. More focused systems for directing patrons to available supply will need to be designed and implemented.

#### 3. Data Findings – <u>Convention Center Zone</u>

For purposes of this analysis, MMDC defined the Convention Center Zone as the area comprised of parking located between Spokane Falls Boulevard (north), First Avenue (south), Washington (west) and Division (east). **Figure 4**, below, provides a map of this study zone.



Figure 4 Convention Center Zone

# A. Composition of the Supply

MMDC surveyed a total of 1,188 stalls in the Convention Center Zone. Of surveyed stalls, 329 stalls were located on-street and 859 were located in eight off-street lots/garages. **Table 11** presents a breakout of the surveyed parking supply in the Convention Center Zone. Detailed graphs illustrating usage for this study zone are provided as **Graph C** at the end of this chapter.

Conver	Convention Center Zone Study Area Parking Stall Breakout									
On-Street Meters by Type	Number of Stalls	% of Total On-Street Stalls								
0.25	3	1%								
0.5	5	2%								
1	41	12%								
1.5	0	0%								
2	179	54%								
3	50	15%								
6	0	0%								
10	51	16%								

 TABLE 11

 CONVENTION CENTER ZONE: COMPOSITION OF THE PARKING SUPPLY

Sub-Total On-Street Parking Stalls	329	100%
Off-Street Parking Stalls (Sub-Total)	859	
TOTAL Convention Center Zone Parking Supply	1,188	

Overall, the Convention Center Zone maintains a high percentage of 2-hour parking stalls, with approximately 54% of the on-street supply made up of these types of stalls. An additional 101 stalls are evenly divided between 3-hour (50 stalls/15%) and 10-hours (51 stalls/16%). The remainder of the zone (48 total stalls) provides a mix of 15-minute, 30-minute and 1-hour parking meters.

# B. Use of On-Street Metered Supply

Consistent with results from the entire South Study Zone and Core Zone (see above), *on-street* parking in the Convention Center Zone operates with a "dual peak" hour. As **Table 12**, below, indicates the "mid-day peak hour" for parking demand in this zone occurs between 12:30 p.m. – 1:30 p.m., one hour later than the on-street peak for the entire South Study area.

On-Street Parking CONVENTION CENTER ZONE		10:30. _ 11:30 a.m.	11:30 _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m. PEAK	1:30 - 2:30 p.m.	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m. PEAK	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
Metered (329 stalls)	Stalls Occupied by Hour	137	193	209	159	138	176	175	180	187	192	129
, ,	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	41.6%	58.7%	63.5%	48.3%	41.9%	53.5%	53.2%	54.7%	56.8%	58.4%	39.2%
	Empty Stalls Available	100										
	by Hour	192	136	120	170	191	153	154	149	142	137	200

 TABLE 12

 CONVENTION CENTER ZONE: ON-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

At the mid-day peak, 63.5% of all on-street parking stalls in the zone are occupied. During this peak hour of demand, 120 on-street stalls are empty and available for use in the Convention Center Zone.

Another "evening peak" occurs between 7:30 p.m. – 8:30 p.m. when the *on-street* supply reaches 58.4% occupancy. At this hour, 137 on-street stalls are empty and available for customer use. Interestingly, the zone actually shows a gradual increase in parking usage beginning at 3:30 p.m. and continues to the 7:30 - 8:30 p.m. evening peak. This is likely due to the number of restaurants/pubs in the eastern end of the zone.

# C. General Characteristics of Use – On-Street Metered Supply

Over the course of the entire study day (i.e., 10:30 a.m. to 9:30 p.m.), approximately 891 unique license plates were recorded using the 329 metered parking stalls within the Convention Center Zone. This represents 14% of all unique vehicles recorded during the study day. If only the period between 10:30 a.m. and 5:30 p.m. is considered (i.e., hours during which enforcement is

in effect), 555 unique license plates were recorded (also 14% of all vehicles recorded during enforcement hours).

The average duration of stay for a vehicle parked at a meter during hours of enforcement was 1 hour and 38 minutes (1.64 hours). As such, over the course of an 8-hour day, a metered stall will turn approximately 4.9 times. Given that the majority of parking in the Convention Center Zone is 2-hour parking, the intended turnover rate for the zone would be in the range of 4.0. At 4.9 turns, the Convention Center Zone is operating within its intended parameters.

Nevertheless, as with the Core Zone, a high rate of time stay violations is evident in this zone. Violations are at 13.5% of all stalls surveyed. Stated differently, nearly one in seven patrons parked on-street in the Convention Center Zone overstays the posted limit for the stall they are using. Given peak occupancies of less than 65%, it does not appear that time stay violations are jeopardizing or constraining customer access to on-street stalls. **Table 13**, below, summarizes the characteristics of use for the Convention Center Zone.

USE CHARACTERISTIC	DATA FINDING
Number of unique vehicles (entire study day)	891
Number of total vehicle hours (total hours that cars parked in the study zone)	1,550
Number of unique vehicles (10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	555
Average duration per unique vehicle (entire study day)	1.74 hrs (1 hour and 44 minutes)
Average duration per unique vehicle during enforcement period (10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	1.64 hrs (1 hour and 38 minutes)
Turnover (number of cars to use a single occupied stall over an 8 hour period)	4.9 times
% of all vehicles violating the posted time stay	13.5%

TABLE 13 GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF USE - METERED STALLS

# D. Use of Off-Street Supply

The *off-street* supply of parking in the Convention Center Zone reaches peak capacity between 1:30 p.m. and 2:30 p.m. This is consistent with the pattern of off-street usage for the entire South Study Zone. As **Table 14**, below, indicates the off-street supply reaches 67.4% of capacity at the peak hour. As such, at the peak hour of demand 280 stalls are empty and available for use off-street in the Convention Center Zone. The majority of these stalls are located on surface parking lots.

It is interesting to note that utilization of off-street lots in the Convention Center Zone remains very consistent between the hours of 10:30 a.m. and 4:30 p.m., remaining in the range of approximately 61% - 67%. This is consistent with off-street parking operations serving commuter uses.

Off-Street Parking		10:30. – 11:30 a.m.	11:30 _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m. PEAK	1:30 - 2:30 p.m.	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
8 lots/ garages	Stalls Occupied											
<u>(859</u> total stalls)		572	570	570	579	529	515	400	182	192	149	132
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	66.6%	66.4%	66.4%	67.4%	61.6%	60.0%	46.6%	21.2%	22.4%	17.3%	15.4%
	Empty Stalls Available											
	By Hour	287	289	289	280	330	344	459	677	667	710	727

 TABLE 14

 CONVENTION CENTER ZONE OFF-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

# *E.* Use of the Combined Supply (On and Off-Street)

When both on and off-street supplies are combined, the peak hour for parking in the Convention Center Zone occurs between 12:30 a.m. and 1:30 p.m., consistent with the peak for the entire South Study Zone. During the Convention Center Zone peak hour 65.6% of the parking supply is occupied, leaving approximately 409 empty parking stalls available for use. **Table 15**, below, summarizes the use characteristics of the combined parking supply.

# F. General Conclusions for the Combined Convention Center Zone

The Convention Center Zone operates with a convenient surplus of parking during its peak hours of operation. As such, surpluses of parking exist in both the on-street and off-street supply within the boundaries of this study zone. It is important to note, however, that the majority of the available supply of off-street parking in this zone is on surface parking lots. As such, development of these sites would likely result in a net loss of supply unless policies, programs and strategies were in place to assure that existing demand is somehow accommodated as new development occurs.

SUMMARY												
TOTAL ( <u>1,188</u> Stalls)	·	10:30. – 11:30 a.m.	11:30 - 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m. PEAK	1:30 - 2:30 p.m.	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
On-street (329 stalls)	Stalls Occupied	137	193	209	159	138	176	175	180	187	192	129
Off-street (859 stalls)		572	570	570	579	529	515	400	182	192	149	132
Combined occupied stalls		709	763	779	738	667	691	575	362	379	341	261
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	59.7%	64.2%	65.6%	62.1%	56.1%	58.2%	48.4%	30.5%	31.9%	28.7%	22.0%
	Empty Stalls Available											
	by Hour	479	425	409	450	521	497	613	826	539	577	657

# TABLE 15 CONVENTION CENTER ZONE: COMBINED ON & OFF-STREET PARKING AREA SUMMARY

Turnover in this zone is efficient in the larger context of stalls designated for stays of two hours or more, which represents the majority of parking in the study area. On-street turnover (at a rate of 4.9) is currently in excess of the intended turnover ratio for a 2-hour meter (i.e. 4.0 turns). The zone does maintain a high percentage of time stay violations, though this does not appear, as yet, to have had an effect on customer access to available stalls.

Given that the majority of the available supply of off-street parking in this zone is on surface parking lots, a large "surplus" of parking exists in the near term to accommodate new demand and growth within the district. However, future loss of surface parking to redevelopment could create conflicts/constraints between existing and future commercial, residential and convention/cultural uses. Expectations about responsibility for creating new supply in the future should be discussed.

# 4. Data Findings – <u>West End Zone</u>

For purposes of this analysis, MMDC defined the West End Zone as the area comprised of parking located between Spokane Falls Boulevard (north), First Avenue (south), Monroe (east) and Cedar (west).

Figure 4, below, provides a map of this study zone.

# A. Composition of the Supply

MMDC surveyed a total of 583 stalls in the West End Zone. Of surveyed stalls, 365 stalls were located on-street and 218 were located in three off-street lots. **Table 16** presents a breakout of the surveyed parking supply in the West End Zone. Detailed graphs illustrating usage for this study zone are provided as **Graph D** at the end of this chapter.



#### Figure 4 West End Zone Boundaries

Overall, nearly half (48%) of the on-street parking in the West End Zone is comprised of 2-hour parking stalls. Another 159 stalls are divided between 3-hour (60 stalls/16%) and 10-hour stalls (99 stalls/27%). The remainder of the zone (32 total stalls) provides a mix of 15-minute, 30-minute and 1-hour parking meters.

WEST END ZON	IE: COMPOSITION OF THE P	ARKING SUPPLY
N	lest End Zone Area Parking Stall Break	out
On-Street Meters by Type	Number of Stalls	% of Total On-Street Stalls
0.25	1	<1%
0.5	7	2%
1	24	7%
1.5	0	0%
2	174	48%
3	60	16%
6	0	0%
10	99	27%
Sub-Total On-Street Parking Stalls	365	100%
Off-Street Parking Stalls (Sub-Total)	218	

TABLE 16WEST END ZONE: COMPOSITION OF THE PARKING SUPPLY

# B. Use of On-Street Metered Supply

TOTAL West End Zone Parking Supply

*On-street* parking in the West End Zone operates similar to the Core Zone with a "dual peak" hour and consistently high occupancy. As **Table 17**, below, indicates the "mid-day peak hour" for parking demand in this zone occurs between 11:30 a.m. – 12:30 p.m. At that time, 84.4% of all on-street parking stalls in the zone are occupied. This is the same as the Core Zone during the same peak hour, which is operating near an 85% optimum utilization for on-street parking. During the midday peak hour of demand, only 57 on-street stalls are empty and available for use in the West End Zone.

583

www.downtown.spokane.net

The "evening peak" occurs between 4:30 p.m. -5:30 p.m., an hour earlier than in the Core Zone. At this time the on-street supply reaches 80.5% occupancy, leaving 71 stalls empty and available for customer use. Another occupancy spike occurs between 6:30 p.m. and 7:30 p.m. when 79.2% of the supply is occupied.

Overall, on-street parking in the West End Zone remains active throughout the day and into the evening.

On- Street		10:30. _	11:30 _	12:30 - 1:30	1:30 - 2:30	2:30 – 3:30	3:30 - 4:30	4:30 - 5:30	5:30 – 6:30	6:30 – 7:30	7:30 – 8:30	8:30 - 9:30
Parking		11:30 a.m.	12:30 p.m.	p.m.	p.m.	p.m.	p.m.	p.m.	p.m.	p.m. USAGE	p.m.	p.m.
WEST END ZONE			PEAK					PEAK		SPIKE		
Metered (365 stalls)	Stalls Occupied by Hour	218	308	280	287	241	215	294	238	289	225	211
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	59.7%	84.4%	76.7%	78.6%	66.0%	58.9%	80.5%	65.2%	79.2%	61.6%	57.8%
	Empty Stalls Available by Hour	147	57	85	78	124	150	71	127	76	140	154

TABLE 17 WEST END ZONE: ON-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

# *C.* General Characteristics of Use – On-Street Metered Supply

Over the course of the entire study day (i.e., 10:30 a.m. to 9:30 p.m.), approximately 1,185 unique license plates were recorded using the 365 metered parking stalls within the West End Zone. This represents 19% of all unique vehicles recorded during the study day. If only the period between 10:30 a.m. and 5:30 p.m. is considered (i.e., hours during which enforcement is in effect), 642 unique license plates were recorded (or 17% of all vehicles recorded during enforcement hours). **Table 18**, below, summarizes the characteristics of use for the West End Zone.

The average duration of stay for a vehicle parked at a meter during hours of enforcement was 1 hour and 34 minutes (or 1.56 hours). As such, over the course of an 8-hour day, a metered stall will turn approximately 5.1 times. Given that the majority of parking in the West End Zone is 2 hour parking, the intended turnover rate for the zone is 4.0. At 5.1 turns, the West End Zone is operating as intended.

Of note is that time stay violations in the West End Zone are the lowest recorded for any zone evaluated. Violations were recorded at 9.0% of all stalls surveyed. As with the Convention Center Zone, it does not appear that time stay violations are limiting patron access to on-street parking.

# TABLE 18 GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF USE - METERED STALLS

USE CHARACTERISTIC	DATA FINDING
Number of unique vehicles (entire study day)	1,185
Number of total vehicle hours (total hours that cars parked in the study zone)	1,660
Number of unique vehicles (10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	642
	1.40 hrs
Average duration per unique vehicle (entire study day)	(1 hour and 24 minutes)
Average duration per unique vehicle during enforcement period (10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	1.56 hrs (1 hour and 34 minutes)
Turnover (number of cars to use a single occupied stall over an 8 hour period)	5.1 times
% of all vehicles violating the posted time stay	9.0%

# D. Use of Off-Street Supply

The *off-street* supply of parking in the West End Zone reaches peak capacity between 12:30 a.m. and 1:30 p.m. The West End Zone peak occurs an hour earlier than that or the entire South Study Zone.

As **Table 19**, below, indicates the off-street supply reaches 55.5% of capacity at the peak hour. As such, at the peak hour of demand 97 stalls are empty and available for patron use off-street in the West End Zone.

Off-Street Parking WEST END ZONE		10:30. _ 11:30 a.m.	11:30 _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m. PEAK	1:30 - 2:30 p.m.	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
3 lots/	Stalls											
garages	Occupied											
(218 total	Occupieu											
stalls)		104	110	121	119	113	101	77	70	69	66	53
Stanoy		104	110	121	110	110	101		10	00		
	% Stalls											
	Occupied											
	by Hour	47.7%	50.5%	55.5%	54.6%	51.8%	46.3%	35.3%	32.1%	31.7%	30.3%	24.3%
	Empty Stalls Available											
	By Hour	114	108	97	99	105	117	141	148	149	152	165

 TABLE 19

 WEST END ZONE: OFF-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

# *E.* Use of the Combined Supply (on and off-street)

When both on and off-street supplies are combined, the West End Zone demonstrates the highest peak hour occupancy of any zone analyzed. Also, the West End Zone displays a dual peak hour for parking for combined supply. A midday peak of 71.7% occupancy occurs between 11:30 a.m. and 12:30 p.m., leaving 165 available stalls. The evening peak occurs between 4:30 p.m. and 5:30 p.m. (63.6% with 212 available stalls) and spikes once again at

61.4% between 6:30 p.m. and 7:30 p.m. **Table 20**, below, summarizes the use characteristics of the combined parking supply.

TOTAL ( <u>583</u> Stalls)		10:30. – 11:30 a.m.	11:30 - 12:30 p.m. PEAK	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 - 2:30 p.m.	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m. PEAK	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m. USAGE SPIKE	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
On-street (365 stalls)	Stalls Occupied	218	308	280	287	241	215	294	238	289	225	211
Off-street (218 stalls)		104	110	121	119	113	101	77	70	69	66	53
Combined occupied stalls		322	418	401	406	354	316	371	308	358	291	264
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	55.2%	71.7%	68.8%	69.6%	60.7%	54.2%	63.6%	52.8%	61.4%	49.9%	45.3%
	Empty Stalls Available by Hour	261	165	182	177	229	267	212	275	225	292	319

 TABLE 20

 WEST END ZONE: COMBINED ON & OFF-STREET PARKING AREA SUMMARY

# F. General Conclusions for the Combined West End Zone

The West End Zone operates at the highest level of activity in the downtown and displays the highest peak hour occupancy for its combined supply of on and off-street parking. An adequate surplus of parking is available on-street and in publicly available off-street lots and garages located within the zone.

On-street turnover (at a rate of 5.1) is supportive of an intended turnover ratio for a 2-hour meter (i.e. 8.0 turns). The low percentage of time stay violations indicates that the mix of parking in the area is supportive of, and consistent with, patron demand (currently at 1.56 hours per visit).

In general, the West End Zone appears to have an adequate capacity of parking to meet current and future levels of demand.

# 5. Data Findings – <u>Periphery Zone</u>

For purposes of this analysis, MMDC defined the Periphery as the large area comprised of parking located between First Avenue (north), Third Avenue (south), Division (east) and Cedar (west). **Figure 5**, below, provides a map of this study zone.

					Leuk		one bu	Junua	1162				
Ģ	_		First	2		eg			ard			.E	
	61	C. 65	63	64 64	65	66 66	67	Bost Bost	69 H	70	71	72	ń"
	0		Second									83	dawayar ug
VALANT	84	85	86	87	88	89	90	91	92	93	94	95	55
			Third	-									

Figure 5 Periphery Zone Boundaries

# A. Composition of the Supply

MMDC surveyed a total of 1,737 stalls in the Periphery Zone. Of surveyed stalls, 757 stalls were located on-street and 980 were located in eight off-street lots. **Table 21** presents a breakout of the surveyed parking supply in the Periphery Zone Detailed graphs illustrating usage for this study zone are provided as **Graph E** at the end of this chapter.

Peri	Periphery Zone Study Area Parking Stall Breakout											
On-Street Meters by Type	Number of Stalls	% of Total On-Street Stalls										
0.25	3	0%										
0.5	30	4%										
1	34	4%										
1.5	0	0%										
2	468	62%										
3	121	16%										
6	0	0%										
10	101	13%										
Sub-Total On-Street Parking Stalls	757	100%										
Off-Street Parking Stalls (Sub-Total)	980											
TOTAL Periphery Zone Parking Supply	1,737											

 TABLE 21

 PERIPHERY ZONE: COMPOSITION OF THE PARKING SUPPLY

Overall, the majority of the on-street parking in the Periphery End Zone is comprised of 2-hour parking stalls, accounting for 62% of the supply. Another 333 stalls are divided between 3-hour (121 stalls/16%) and 10-hour stalls (101 stalls/13%). The remainder of the zone (67 total stalls) provides a mix of 15-minute, 30-minute and 1-hour parking meters.

B. Use of On-Street Metered Supply

*On-street* parking in the Periphery Zone generates a modest "dual peak" hour, with the highest peak of the day occurring at the evening peak. As **Table 22**, below, indicates the "mid-day peak hour" for parking demand in this zone occurs between 12:30 a.m. – 1:30 p.m. At that time, only 37.6% of all on-street parking stalls in the zone are occupied. During the midday peak hour of demand, only 472 on-street stalls are empty and available for use in the Periphery Zone. The "evening peak" occurs between 5:30 p.m. – 6:30 p.m. At this time the on-street supply reaches 42.1% occupancy, leaving 438 stalls empty and available for patron use.

Overall, on-street parking in the Periphery is substantially underutilized throughout the day and into the evening.

On-Street Parking PERIPHERY ZONE		10:30. _ 11:30 a.m.	11:30 _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m. PEAK	1:30 - 2:30 p.m.	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m. PEAK	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
Metered (757 stalls)	Stalls Occupied by Hour	262	248	285	255	210	258	245	319	306	229	148
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	34.6%	32.8%	37.6%	33.7%	27.7%	34.1%	32.4%	42.1%	40.4%	30.3%	19.6%
	Empty Stalls Available											
	by Hour	495	509	472	502	547	499	512	438	451	528	609

 TABLE 22

 PERIPHERY ZONE: ON-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

#### *C. General Characteristics of Use – On-Street Metered Supply*

Over the course of the entire study day (i.e., 10:30 a.m. to 9:30 p.m.), approximately 1,496 unique license plates were recorded using the 757 metered parking stalls within the Periphery Zone. This represents 24% of all unique vehicles recorded during the study day. If only the period between 10:30 a.m. and 5:30 p.m. is considered (i.e., hours during which enforcement is in effect), 913 unique license plates were recorded (or 23% of all vehicles recorded during enforcement hours).

The average duration of stay for a vehicle parked at a meter during hours of enforcement was 1 hour and 39 minutes (1.65 hours). As such, over the course of an 8-hour day, a metered stall will turn approximately 4.8 times. Given that the majority of parking in the Periphery Zone is 2-hour parking, the intended turnover rate for the zone is 4.0. At 4.8 turns, the Periphery Zone is operating as intended.

Time stay violations in the Periphery Zone were recorded at 12.7% of all stalls surveyed, meaning one in eight patrons overstay the posted time stay for use of their stall. However, as with the West End and Convention Center Zones, it does not appear that time stay violations are limiting patron access for on-street parking. **Table 23**, below, summarizes the characteristics of use for the Periphery Zone.

USE CHARACTERISTIC	DATA FINDING
Number of unique vehicles (entire study day)	1,496
Number of total vehicle hours (total hours that cars parked in the study zone)	2,433

TABLE 23

# **GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF USE - METERED STALLS**

Number of unique vehicles (10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	913					
	1.63 hrs					
Average duration per unique vehicle (entire study day)	(1 hour and 38 minutes)					
Average duration per unique vehicle during enforcement	1.65 hrs					
period (10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	(1 hour and 39 minutes)					
Turnover (number of cars to use a single occupied stall over an 8 hour period)	4.8 times					
% of all vehicles violating the posted time stay	12.7%					

# D. Use of Off-Street Supply

The *off-street* supply of parking in the Periphery Zone reaches peak capacity between 10:30 a.m. and 11:30 p.m. The Periphery Zone peak occurs a full three hours earlier than that of the average for the entire South Study Zone. The pattern of use also stays consistently in the high 60% range until 3:30 p.m. Like the Convention Center Zone, discussed above, this pattern is consistent with use of these lots by employee commute parkers.

As **Table 24**, next page, indicates the off-street supply reaches 67.1% of capacity at the peak hour. As such, at the peak hour of demand 322 stalls are empty and available for use off-street in the Periphery Zone.

Off-Street Parking PERIPHERY ZONE		10:30. – 11:30 a.m. PEAK	11:30 _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 - 2:30 p.m.	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
8 lots/ garages <u>(980</u> total stalls)	Stalls Occupied	658	630	651	623	643	553	488	354	361	265	248
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	67.1%	64.3%	66.4%	63.6%	65.6%	56.4%	49.8%	36.1%	36.8%	27.0%	25.3%
	Empty Stalls Available By Hour	322	350	329	357	337	427	492	626	619	715	732

 TABLE 24

 PERIPHERY ZONE OFF-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

# E. Use of the Combined Supply (on and off-street)

When both on and off-street supplies are combined, the peak hour for parking in the Periphery Zone occurs between 12:30 a.m. and 1:30 p.m., consistent with the peak for the entire South Study Zone. During the Periphery Zone peak hour 53.9% of the parking supply is occupied, leaving approximately 801 empty parking stalls available for use. **Table 25**, below, summarizes the use characteristics of the combined parking supply.

TOTAL ( <u>1,737</u> Stalls)		10:30. _ 11:30 a.m.	11:30 - 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m. PEAK	1:30 - 2:30 p.m.	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
On-street (757 stalls)	Stalls Occupied	262	248	285	255	210	258	245	319	306	229	148
Off-street (980 stalls)		658	630	651	623	643	553	488	354	361	265	248
Combined occupied stalls		920	878	936	878	853	811	733	673	667	494	396
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	53.0%	50.5%	53.9%	50.5%	49.1%	46.7%	42.2%	38.7%	38.4%	28.4%	22.8%
	Empty Stalls Available by Hour	817	859	801	859	884	926	1,004	1,064	800	973	1,071

 TABLE 25

 PERIPHERY ZONE: COMBINED ON & OFF-STREET

# F. General Conclusions for the Combined Periphery Zone

The Periphery Zone operates at the lowest level of activity in the downtown. A large surplus of parking exists on-street in the peak hours (between 438 and 472 stalls) while a moderate supply (322 stalls) of publicly accessible off-street parking is available.

On-street turnover (at a rate of 4.8) is supportive of an intended turnover ratio for a 2-hour meter (i.e. 8.0). Time stay violations (at 12.7%) are high but do not appear to have had an impact on the availability of on-street parking. The low percentage of time stay violations indicates that the mix of parking in the area is supportive of, and consistent with, patron demand (current at approximately 1.56 hours per visit).

In general, the Periphery Zone appears to have an adequate capacity of parking to meet current and future levels of demand. Like the Convention Center Zone, off-street parking surplus is on surface parking lots, which would need to be monitored and managed as development on such sites occurs.

# 6. Summary - South Study Zone

Data findings for the South Study Area can be summarized as follows.

- Overall occupancy of the South Study Area reaches a peak capacity of 63.8% in the peak hour (i.e., 12:30 p.m. – 1:30 p.m.).
- At the peak hour, the downtown maintains an available supply of approximately 2,683 on and off-street parking stalls.
- The *on-street* parking systems in the Core and West End Zones operate with high turnover and utilization. The Core Zone reaches 89.7% occupancy at its maximum peak hour and the West End reaches 84.4%.

- While on-street occupancies are high in the Core and West End Zones, both zones have low utilization of *off-street* facilities. Off-street facilities in the Core Zone do not exceed peak hour utilization in the mid-60% range, while off-street facilities surveyed in the West End Zone do not exceed the mid-50% range. At its highest peak hour, the Core Zone maintains a minimum of 1,102 available off-street stalls. This relationship underscores the need for a better system of wayfinding/signage, communication, lighting/landscaping and pricing that draws patrons into off-street facilities.
- Time stay violations are high in the downtown study area. This is particularly evident in the Core Zone. The situation in the Core Zone is likely the result of the high number of 1-hour meters (and 30-minute meters) in the zone, which is out of sync with a patron's average time stay of approximately 1.5 hours. A review and reconsideration of the mix of time stay allowances in the Core Zone is recommended.
- It appears that the available supply of parking in the peak hours is adequate to accommodate current and future levels of demand.
- A large portion of available off-street supply is located on surface parking lots. Managing this surplus of parking as demand increases will impact decisions regarding future parking development requirements (for both the private and public sectors) as surface facilities in the study area redevelop into desired new uses.

# E. INVENTORY OF PARKING - NORTH STUDY ZONE (WEEKDAY)

The North Study Zone is generally comprised of the parking area bounded by Cedar and Post (on the west and east, respectively) and Mallon and Bridge (on the North and South, respectively). **Figure 6** provides a visual map of this study zone. The boundaries of the North Study Zone were developed in consultation with the DSP and the PSC prior to initiation of the data gathering effort. A single "typical day" was surveyed each hour over an eleven-hour period (10:30 a.m. – 9:30 p.m.). The survey day selected was Thursday, May 20, 2004.

Figure 6 North Study Zone



# 1. Data Findings – North Study Zone

#### A. Composition of the Supply

The North Study Zone maintains a total of 899 parking stalls within the study boundaries. Of those stalls 454 stalls are located on street and 445 are located in off-street lots. **Table 26** presents a breakout of the parking supply in the North Study Zone.

North Study Area Parking Stall Breakout									
On-Street Meters by Type	Number of Stalls								
0.25	2								
0.5	5								
1	18								
1.5	0								
2	79								
3	57								
6	143 <sup>7</sup>								
10	150								
Sub-Total On-Street Parking Stalls	454								
Off-Street Parking Stalls (Sub-Total)	445								
TOTAL North Zone Parking Supply	899								

TABLE 26COMPOSITION OF THE PARKING SUPPLY – NORTH STUDY ZONE

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Six hour stalls are actually 143 metered spaces on a surface lot across the street from the Courthouse. MMDC treated these stalls as "on-street" because we were able to track turnover and duration.

# B. Use of on-street metered supply

The character of metered parking operates somewhat differently than the off-street system. As **Table 27**, below, indicates the peak hour for parking demand in this zone occurs between 1:30 p.m. – 2:30 p.m. At that time, 61.2% of all on-street parking stalls in the zone are occupied. Viewed another way, at the peak hour of demand 176 stalls are empty and available for use in the North Study Zone. **Table 27** also summarizes the use of passenger loading zones (PLZ) and commercial loading zones (CLZ) in the study zone. Survey data indicates low use of the two PLZ stalls and moderate use of the three CLZ in the study zone.

On- Street Parking ( <u>454</u> total stalls)		10:30. – 11:30 a.m.	11:30 – 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 - 2:30 p.m. PEAK	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
Metered (304 stalls)	Stalls Occupied by Hour	182	149	138	188	166	135	53	55	83	80	58
10 hour (158 stalls)	Stalls Occupied by Hour	75	73	70	90	85	56	43	50	46	45	38
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	56.6%	48.9%	45.8%	61.2%	55.3%	42.1%	21.1%	23.1%	28.4%	27.5%	21.1%
	Empty Stalls Available											
DI 7	Usage by	197	232	246	176	203	263	358	349	325	329	358
2 Zones	Hour	1	0	0	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
CLZ 3 Zones	Usage by Hour	0	0	2	0	1	0	0	0	1	1	1

TABLE 27ON-STREET PARKING STALL SUMMARY – 454 TOTAL STALLS

# C. Use of off-street supply

The off-street supply of parking reaches peak capacity between 10:30 a.m. and 11:30 a.m. As **Table 28**, below, indicates the off-street supply reaches 65.6% of capacity at the peak hour. As such, at the peak hour of demand 153 stalls are empty and available for use in the North Study Zone.

TABLE 28
<b>OFF-STREET PARKING STALL SUMMARY – 445 TOTAL STALLS</b>

Off- Street Parking (445 total stalls)		10:30. _ 11:30 a.m. PEAK	11:30 _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 - 2:30 p.m.	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
Lot 327 (108 stalls)	Stalls Occupied	33	23	28	32	26	19	8	10	4	4	4
Lot 323 (25 stalls)		12	7	4	9	11	8	11	2	0	0	1
Lot 323 (32 stalls)		24	23	21	18	15	8	12	3	5	5	3
Lot 333 (60 stalls)		45	41	37	36	40	37	38	6	3	2	0
Lot 334 (100 stalls)		85	83	80	80	74	63	59	19	17	15	5
Lot 335 (120 stalls)		93	106	95	86	91	74	77	68	66	54	5
	% Stalls Occupie d by Hour	65.6%	63.6%	59.6%	58.7%	57.8%	47.0%	46.1%	24.3%	21.3%	18.0%	4.0%
	Empty Stalls Available By Hour	153	162	180	184	188	236	240	337	350	365	427

# D. Use of the combined supply

When both on and off-street supplies are combined, the peak hour for parking in the North Study Zone occurs between 10:30 a.m. and 11:30 a.m. During this peak hour 61.1% of the parking supply is occupied, leaving approximately 350 empty parking stalls available for use. **Table 29**, below, summarizes the use characteristics of the combined parking supply.

# 2. General Characteristics of Use – On street/Metered Parking

Over the course of the study day, approximately 790 unique license plates were recorded using metered parking stalls. These vehicles logged a total of 1,288 hours parked in the study zone. The average duration of stay for a vehicle parked at a meter was 1 hour and 38 minutes (or 1.63 hours). As such, over the course of an 8-hour day, a metered stall will turn over approximately five times. Given that the majority of metered stalls in the district allow for time stays of two hours or more, turnover in the zone is efficient. This is supported by the very low rate of time stay violations recorded in the zone over the course of the study day. Only 2.6% of vehicles parked in the study zone were recorded violating the posted time stay at their parking stall. **Table 30,** below, summarizes the characteristics of use for the study zone.

TABLE 29COMBINED ON & OFF STREET PARKING AREA SUMMARY – 899 STALLS

TOTAL		10:30. - 11:30	11:30 - 12:30	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 - 2:30 p.m.	2:30 – 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.
Stalls)		a.m. PEAK	p.m.			•	•		P.111	•	•	•
On-street (454 stalls)	Stalls Occupied	257	222	208	278	251	191	96	105	129	125	96
Off-street (445 stalls)		292	283	265	261	257	209	205	108	95	80	18
Combined occupied stalls		549	505	473	539	508	400	301	213	224	205	114
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	61.1%	56.2%	52.6%	60.0%	56.5%	44.5%	33.5%	23.7%	24.9%	22.8%	12.7%
	Empty Stalls Available by Hour	350	394	426	360	391	499	598	686	675	694	785

# TABLE 30 GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF USE - METERED STALLS

USE CHARACTERISTIC	DATA FINDING
Number of unique vehicles	790
Number of total vehicle hours (total hours cars parked in the study zone)	1,288
	1.63 hrs
Average duration per unique vehicle	(1 hour and 38 minutes)
Turnover (number of cars to use a single occupied stall over an 8 hour period)	4.9 times
% of all vehicles violating the posted time stay	2.6%

# 3. Summary – North Study Zone

The North Study Zone operates with a convenient surplus of parking during its peak hours of operation. Adequate parking is available for both on-street and off-street access. Turnover is efficient and time stay designations in the zone are appropriate to serve the average duration of stay for patrons utilizing the zone. Parking violations (or abuse of time stays) is not significant in the district.

In general, the North Zone appears to have adequate capacity to meet current and future levels of demand.

# F. FORECASTING – IMPACTS TO THE SUPPLY

To facilitate future discussions regarding the parking supply, the consultant team developed a trend analysis to track growth in peak hour parking stall demand at two different levels of annual demand growth – 3 percent and 5 percent.<sup>8</sup>

To facilitate this exercise, the consultant team initiated the analysis using the following assumptions:

- 1. All existing publicly available parking in the downtown will remain in place, both on and offstreet.
- 2. Stall demand generated at this time will not account for future new development.
- 3. 85 percent occupancy is considered optimum operating efficiency within a parking inventory.

By holding assumption (1) and (2) constant, base level demand (or status quo) for parking was calculated.<sup>9</sup>

#### 1. Growth Forecast Scenarios – South Zone Study Area

**Figure 7**, next page, baselines current peak hour demand for the <u>entire South Zone</u> study area. As illustrated, the 2004 supply reaches a peak hour occupancy of 63.8 percent, based on 2004



Figure 7: Estimated Peak Hour Stall Absorbtion for entire South Zone (7,421 Stalls) @ 3% and 5% Growth Rates

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Percentage growth estimates are arbitrary for purposes of illustrating the impact of different levels of demand growth on the downtown parking supply.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Over the course of the next several years it is likely that changes will occur in the downtown that can and will impact the parking supply and how it is used. This can include increases/decreases to the supply itself; demand created by

parking inventory data. At this point in time 4,738 parking stalls in the downtown are occupied and 2,683 stalls are empty and available. The figure then trends the absorption of occupied parking for the ensuing ten years at either 3 percent (low) or 5 percent (high) growth in demand, tracking occupancy against an 85% optimum occupancy standard.

This exercise provides a glimpse of how the entire supply might transition into a constrained situation over time. Using the low growth scenario (3 percent annual absorption), downtown Spokane surpasses the 85 percent threshold in 2014. In contrast, under the high growth scenario (5 percent annual absorption), the downtown surpasses 85 percent occupancy in 2011. If parking demand grows at 3 percent annually, the rate of peak hour stall absorption averages about 163 stalls per year over ten years. At 5 percent, available peak parking stalls are absorbed at an average rate of 268 stalls per year over six years.

In short, when the supply exceeds 85 percent occupancy, the expectation would be that new supply or alternative access options would need to be developed to absorb new demand and maintain an optimum level of overall access.

# 2. Growth Forecast – Core Zone

A similar trend forecast was developed for the Core Zone, using both the 3 and 5 percent growth scenarios. The information displayed in **Figure 8**, below, illustrates possible stall absorption forecasts for the Core Zone.





The zone begins with 2004 peak hour occupancy of 67.3 percent. Currently, 2,554 stalls are occupied during the peak hour, leaving 1,241 stalls available for public use. Under the low growth scenario (3 percent), peak hour stall absorption would occur at an average rate of 85 stalls per year. At this rate of growth in demand, the 85 percent threshold would be exceeded in

new development and/or parking and transportation demand management strategies designed to influence parking activity.

2012. At the high growth rate, peak hour stall absorption would occur at an average rate of 141 per year over a five-year period, exceeding the 85 percent threshold in 2009.

As with the analysis for the entire supply, when the supply in the Core Zone exceeds 85 percent occupancy, the expectation would be that new supply or alternative access options would need to be developed to absorb new demand and maintain an optimum level of overall access.

#### G. CONCLUSION

It is apparent from the data inventories that downtown Spokane's parking supply has room to absorb parking demand. Surplus supply is available throughout the downtown in both the South and North study zones. Nonetheless, it is important to recognize that a large portion of the available parking is currently located on surface parking lots that are likely to develop at some point in the future, which would remove parking supply from existing users. This is particularly relevant in the South study zone.

The data inventory also clearly indicates that basic strategies for managing parking are necessary. More effective utilization of the supply will occur as signage programs, time stay mix refinements and coordination strategies are implemented. A range of recommended strategies to enhance the parking supply and improve parking management have been developed with this plan and are detailed in **Section IV** of this report.







Time Periods



Time Periods


# APPENDIX B Summary of South Study Zone Data Collection Effort – SATURDAY DATA

The following is intended to provide a summary and analysis of data gathered for the South Study Zone area of the Downtown Spokane Parking Demand Analysis Study on Saturday, May 22, 2004. This memorandum follows information already provided in Technical Memorandum #3A, which summarized weekday data recently gathered for the South Study Zone area.

# I. BACKGROUND AND CONTEXT

The South Study Zone is a large area of the downtown generally comprised of the parking area bounded by Spokane Falls Boulevard (on the north), Third Avenue (on the south), Cedar (on the west) and Division (on the east). **Figure 1** provides a detailed visual map of this study zone and four sub zones for which data was analyzed.

The boundaries of the South Study Zone were developed in consultation with the DSP and the PSC prior to initiation of the data gathering effort. Data collection efforts occurred over two days, a "typical" weekday and a Saturday. Data for the selected Saturday survey was conducted on Saturday, May 22, 2004. Surveyors collected license plate data at each metered on-street parking stall located in the study area for every hour over an eleven-hour period (11:30 a.m. – 10:30 p.m.). Hourly capacity counts were taken over the same time frame at 26 publicly available off-street facilities in the study zone. This memorandum will focus on results from the Saturday survey. Final results for the weekday survey are incorporated into Section I of the Final Report for the *Spokane Parking Demand Study*.

Initial data findings will be presented here from five perspectives. This will include:

- <u>Entire study area</u>. Data findings for the entire South Study Zone, which analyzes parking activity as it occurs throughout the entire study area. Findings from this perspective may understate high activity areas within the downtown as periphery area data is combined with data from higher activity zones.
- <u>Core Zone</u>. Data findings for the Core Zone of the downtown. Findings from this perspective present a clear picture of on and off-street utilization in the commercial core of the downtown.
- <u>Convention Center Zone.</u> Data will be presented for parking activity in the eastern end of the downtown, which incorporates on and off-street parking use adjacent to the convention center.
- <u>West End Zone</u>. Data will be presented for parking activity in the western sector of the downtown.
- <u>Periphery Zone</u>. Data will be presented for parking activity in the southern most sector of the downtown.

FIGURE 1 SOUTH STUDY ZONE BOUNDARIES



# 2. DATA FINDINGS - Entire Study Zone

# A. Composition of the Supply

The South Study Zone maintains a total of **8,878** parking stalls. MMDC conducted actual hourly counts of 6,671 of these stalls (or 75% of the total supply).<sup>1</sup> Of surveyed stalls, 1,965 stalls were located on street and 4,706 were located in 27 off-street lots/garages.<sup>2</sup> **Table 1** presents a breakout of the surveyed parking supply in the South Study Zone. Detailed graphs illustrating usage for this study zone are included as **Graph A** at the end of this technical memorandum.

South Study Area Parking Stall Breakout											
On-Street Meters by Type	Number of Stalls	% of Total On-Street Stalls									
0.25	35	2%									
0.5	107	5%									
1	398	20%									
1.5	23	1%									
2	920	47%									
3	231	12%									
6	0	-									
10	251	13%									
Sub-Total On-Street Parking Stalls	1,965	100%									
Off-Street Parking Stalls (Sub-Total)	4,706										
Total Surveyed Supply	6,671										

TABLE 1SOUTH STUDY ZONE: COMPOSITION OF SURVEYED PARKING SUPPLY

Overall, the South Study Zone maintains a high percentage of 2.0 hour parking stalls, nearly half the on-street supply (47%) is made up of these types of stalls. One-hour stalls make up approximately 20% of the on-street supply. Interestingly, nearly seven percent of on-street stalls are for stays of 30-minutes or less (142 total stalls).

#### B. Use of On-Street Metered Supply

*On-street* parking in the study zone operates at a fairly low level on Saturdays throughout the operating day. As **Table 2** below indicates, mid-day parking demand remains fairly constant (mid to high 30% range) between 11:30 a.m. and 4:30 p.m. During this period between 1,183 and 1,271 stalls are empty and available for use in the South Study Zone.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> MMDC was able to survey 100% of all on-street stalls and 68% of all off-street stalls available for public use (4,706 of 6,913). The off-street number differs from the Thursday survey, as some off street facilities are not open and available to the public on Saturdays.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> MMDC conducted a detailed physical inventory of off-street parking locations in the downtown. Within the South study zone, MMDC identified 60 total lots/garages available to general public parking on Saturdays. Additional lots exist within the zone, but are not available to general public use.

An "evening peak" occurs between 7:30 p.m. - 8:30 p.m. when the on-street supply reaches 56.2% occupancy. There is a gradual build up to the evening peak, which begins at 4:30 p.m. This is representative of a build up of patrons visiting evening activities associated with restaurants and entertainment. At the evening peak, 860 on-street stalls are empty and available for use within the study area.

On- Street Parking ( <u>1,965</u> total stalls)		11:30. _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m. PEAK	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
Metered (1,714 stalls)	Stalls Occupied by Hour	560	583	556	611	630	710	875	838	961	809	543
10 hour (251 stalls)	Stalls Occupied by Hour	67	71	85	81	76	81	87	82	72	45	37
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	35.3%	36.9%	36.9%	39.3%	39.8%	44.4%	53.4%	51.0%	56.2%	45.8%	31.4%
	Empty Stalls Available											
	Empty Stalls Available by Hour	1271	1240	1239	1192	1183	1093	916	963	860	1066	

 TABLE 2

 SOUTH STUDY ZONE: ON-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

# *C.* General Characteristics of Use – On-Street Metered Supply

Over the course of the entire study day (i.e., 11:30 a.m. to 10:30 p.m.), approximately 4,737 unique license plates were recorded using the 1,965 metered parking stalls within the study zone.<sup>3</sup> These vehicles logged a total of 7,665 hours parked. If only the period between 11:30 a.m. and 5:30 p.m. is considered (i.e., hours during which enforcement is in effect), 2,243 unique license plates were recorded (or 47% of all vehicles recorded). Stated differently, 53% of observed vehicles arrived during evening hours.

The average duration of stay for a vehicle parked at a meter during hours of enforcement was 1 hour and 37 minutes (or 1.62 hours). As such, over the course of an 8-hour day, a metered stall will turn 4.9 times (8 hour day/1.62 hours duration = 4.9 turns). If the intended use for a meter is one hour, then the stall should turn 8 times over an eight-hour period. If the intended use for a meter is two hour parking then turnover should be no less than four turns over an eight-hour period. Given that the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> It is important to note that this does not represent all vehicles in the downtown on May 22, 2004 as license plate numbers were not recorded in off-street facilities or at un-metered parking stalls and the study did not capture use prior to 11:30 a.m. The Saturday unique vehicle total contrasts with 6,235 unique license plates recorded during the weekday survey (i.e. Thursday, May 20, 2004).

majority of metered stalls in the district allow for time stays of two hours or more, turnover in the *larger* study zone is generally efficient.

Time stay violations occurred in 19.2% of the stalls surveyed. Stated differently, about one in five patrons overstay the posted limit for the stall they are using. This is a very high rate for time stay violations and could be the result of several factors that will be considered later in this memorandum (see Section 2, C, below).

**Table 3**, below, summarizes the characteristics of use for the study zone.

USE CHARACTERISTIC	DATA FINDING				
Number of unique vehicles (entire study day)	4,737				
Number of total vehicle hours (total hours that cars parked in the study zone)	7,665				
Number of unique vehicles (11:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	2,243				
Average duration per unique vehicle (entire study day)	1.62 hrs (1 hour and 37 minutes)				
Average duration per unique vehicle during enforcement period (11:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	1.62 hrs (1 hour and 37 minutes)				
Turnover (number of cars to use a single occupied stall over an 8 hour period)	4.9 times				
% of all vehicles violating the posted time stay	19.2%				
% of total parked hours in violation	17.9%				

TABLE 3 GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF USE - METERED STALLS

# D. Use of Off-Street Supply

The *off-street* supply of parking reaches peak capacity between 7:30 p.m. and 8:30 p.m. on Saturday. As with the on street supply, the South Study Zone experiences a gradual "ramp up" to the evening peak, beginning at about 4:30 p.m. As **Table 4** below indicates, the off-street supply reaches 43.3% of capacity at the peak hour. At the peak hour of demand 2,667 stalls are empty and available for use off-street in the South Study Zone.

TABLE 4
SOUTH STUDY ZONE <u>OFF-STREET</u> PARKING SUMMARY <sup>4</sup>

Off-Street Parking		11:30. _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m. PEAK	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
27 lots/garages <u>(4,706</u> total stalls)	Stalls Occupied	913	1,230	1,388	1,663	1,869	1,960	1,905	2,009	2,039	2,012	1,849
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	19.4%	26.1%	29.5%	35.3%	39.7%	41.6%	40.5%	42.7%	43.3%	42.8%	39.3%
	Empty Stalls Available By Hour	3.793	3.476	3.318	3.043	2.837	2.746	2.801	2.697	2.667	2.694	2.857

#### E. Use of the Combined Supply (on and off-street)

When both on and off-street supplies are combined, the peak hour for parking in the South Study Zone occurs between 7:30 p.m. and 8:30 p.m. During this peak hour 47.1% of the parking supply is occupied, leaving approximately 3,527 empty parking stalls available for use. **Table 5**, below, summarizes the use characteristics of the combined parking supply.

#### TABLE 5 SOUTH STUDY ZONE: <u>COMBINED ON & OFF-STREET</u> PARKING AREA SUMMARY

COMBINED AREA TOTAL <u>6,671</u> Stalls		11:30. _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m. PEAK	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
On-street (1,965 stalls)	Stalls Occupied	694	725	726	773	782	872	1,049	1,002	1,105	899	617
Off-street (4,706 stalls)		913	1,230	1,388	1,663	1,869	1,960	1,905	2,009	2,039	2,012	1,849
Combined occupied stalls		1,607	1,955	2,114	2,436	2,651	2,832	2,954	3,011	3,144	2,911	24,66
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	24.1%	29.3%	31.7%	36.5%	39.7%	42.5%	44.3%	45.1%	47.1%	43.6%	37.0%
	Empty Stalls Available											
	by Hour	5,064	4,716	4,557	4,235	4,020	3,839	3,717	3,660	3,527	3,760	4,205

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> MMDC has usage data for each individual off-street lot/garage surveyed. Through agreement with property owners of these facilities, MMDC has grouped the data together to assure confidentiality of use.

#### *F.* General Conclusions for the Combined South Study Zone

The South Study Zone operates with a convenient surplus of parking during its peak hours of operation. The highest level of activity occurs in the evening hours. Surpluses of parking exist in both the on-street and off-street supply within the boundaries of the entire study zone. Turnover is efficient in the larger context of stalls designated for stays of two hours or more, which represents the majority of parking in the study area. However, the high percentage of time stay violations indicates that the overall mix of time stay designations (i.e., stays of less than 1.5 hours) may not be appropriate to serve the average duration of stay for patrons utilizing the zone.

In general, the South Study Zone appears to have adequate capacity to meet current and future levels of demand for weekend parking uses.

### 3. DATA FINDINGS – <u>Core Parking Zone</u>

For purposes of this analysis, MMDC defined the Core Zone as the area comprised of parking located between Spokane Falls Boulevard (north), First Avenue (south), Monroe (west) and Washington (east). **Figure 2,** below, provides a map of this study zone.



#### A. Composition of the Supply

MMDC surveyed a total of 3,045 stalls in the Core Zone. Of surveyed stalls, 486 stalls were located on street and 2,559 were located in six off-street lots/garages.<sup>5</sup> **Table 6** presents a breakout of the surveyed parking supply in the Core Zone. Detailed graphs

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Again, it is important to note that the number of publicly available off-street parking facilities is fewer on Saturdays than during weekday operations. This results in differing totals of surveyed off street stalls between the May 20 and May 22, 2004 inventories.

illustrating usage for this study zone are included as **Graph B** at the end of this technical memorandum.

	Core Zone Parking Stall Breakout	
On-Street Meters by Type	Number of Stalls	% of Total On-Street Stalls
0.25	27	6%
0.5	65	13%
1	299	62%
1.5	23	4%
2	72	15%
3	0	0%
6	0	0%
10	0	0%
Sub-Total On-Street Parking Stalls	486	100%
Off-Street Parking Stalls (Sub-Total)	2,559	
TOTAL Core Zone Parking Supply	3045	

# TABLE 6CORE ZONE: COMPOSITION OF THE PARKING SUPPLY

Overall, the Core Zone maintains a high percentage of 1.0 hour parking stalls, with over 62% of the on-street supply made up of these types of stalls. This is consistent with an operating intent to support high turnover in an area supportive of ground level retail and short-term visits. A number of stalls (102 stalls or 19%) are dedicated to stays of 30 minutes or less. The remainder of the zone (95 total stalls) provides a mix of 1.5 - 2.0 hour parking meters.

#### B. Use of On-Street Metered Supply

Saturday on-street parking in the Core Zone operates with a "dual peak" hour. As **Table 7** below indicates, the "mid-day peak hour" for parking demand in this zone occurs between 2:30 a.m. – 3:30 p.m. At that time, 61.1% of all on-street parking stalls in the zone are occupied. During this peak hour of demand, 189 on-street stalls are empty and available for use in the Core Zone. At 4:30 p.m. occupancy reaches 63.2%, which begins a gradual ramp up to a more significant evening peak hour.

The evening peak occurs between 7:30 p.m. - 8:30 p.m. when the on-street supply reaches 84.2% occupancy, very near the parking industry "optimum" standard of 85% for a facility that is "effectively full" or at peak utilization for retail customer uses. This peak is compatible with Core Zone uses for restaurant, pub and theater uses. At this hour, 77 on-street stalls are empty and available for customer use.

On- Street Parking CORE ZONE		11:30. – 12:30 p.m.	12:30 – 1:30 p.m.	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m. PEAK	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m. PEAK	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
Metered (486 stalls)	Stalls Occupied by Hour	270	271	271	297	282	307	363	343	409	314	240
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	55.6%	55.8%	55.8%	61.1%	58.0%	63.2%	74.7%	70.6%	84.2%	64.6%	49.4%
	Empty Stalls Available by Hour	216	215	215	189	204	179	123	143	77	172	246

 TABLE 7

 CORE ZONE: ON-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

### C. General Characteristics of Use – On-Street Metered Supply

Over the course of the entire study day (i.e., 11:30 a.m. to 10:30 p.m.), approximately 2,304 unique license plates were recorded using the 486 metered parking stalls within the Core Zone. This represents 49% (or nearly half) of all unique vehicles recorded within the South Zone Study Area on Saturday. If only the period between 11:30 a.m. and 5:30 p.m. is considered (i.e., hours during which enforcement is in effect), 1,165 unique license plates were recorded (or 52% of all vehicles recorded during enforcement hours).

The average duration of stay for a vehicle parked at a meter during hours of enforcement was 1 hour and 28 minutes (or 1.46 hours).<sup>6</sup> As such, over the course of an 8-hour day, a metered stall will turn approximately 5.5 times. Given that the majority of parking in the Core Zone is one hour parking, the intended turnover rate for the zone would be closer to eight turns a day. At 5.5 turns, the Core Zone is not operating as intended.

This may be a direct reflection of the high rate of time stay violations that occur in the Core Zone. Violations are at 21.5% of all stalls surveyed, slightly higher than the Thursday violation rate of 20.7%. Stated differently, one in five patrons parked on-street in the Core Zone overstay the posted limit for the stall they are using. As with findings from the Thursday survey of the Core Zone, the question for Spokane is whether the 1-hour meter (and/or 30 minute meters) is the optimum time stay "mix" or whether a meter stay more closely correlated to observed customer behavior in the zone (i.e. an average actual stay of 1.46 hours) is necessary.

**Table 8**, below, summarizes the characteristics of use for the Core Zone.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> This is identical to the Core Zone time stay recorded during the Thursday survey.

# TABLE 8 GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF USE - METERED STALLS

USE CHARACTERISTIC	DATA FINDING
Number of unique vehicles (entire study day)	2,304
Number of total vehicle hours (total hours that cars parked in the study zone)	3,367
Number of unique vehicles (11:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	1,165
Average duration per unique vehicle (entire study day)	1.46 hrs (1 hour and 28 minutes)
Average duration per unique vehicle during enforcement period (11:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	1.46 hrs (1 hour and 28 minutes)
Turnover (number of cars to use a single occupied stall over an 8 hour period)	5.5 times
% of all vehicles violating the posted time stay	21.5%
% of total parked hours in violation	19.2%

### D. Use of Off-Street Supply

The *off-street* supply of parking in the Core Zone reaches a peak capacity of 57.6% between 4:30 p.m. and 5:30 p.m. From this point forward occupancies remain consistent, in the mid-50 percent range, until 9:30 p.m. **Table 9**, below, summarizes this trend. At the peak hour of demand 1,084 stalls are empty and available for use off-street in the Core Zone.

Off-Street Parking		11:30. - 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m. PEAK	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
6 lots/ garages <u>(2,559</u> total stalls)	Stalls Occupied	437	755	935	1,208	1,373	1,475	1,407	1,435	1,433	1,416	1,314
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	17.1%	29.5%	36.5%	47.2%	53.7%	57.6%	55.0%	56.1%	56.0%	55.3%	51.3%
	Empty Stalls Available By Hour	2,122	1,804	1,624	1,351	1,186	1,084	1,152	1,124	1,126	1,143	1,245

 TABLE 9

 CORE ZONE OFF-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

#### *E.* Use of the Combined Supply (on and off-street)

When both on and off-street supplies are combined, the peak hour for parking in the Core Zone occurs between 7:30 p.m. and 8:30 p.m., a peak hour definitely correlated to an active downtown evening trade. During the Core Zone peak hour, 66.4% of the

parking supply is occupied, leaving approximately 1,203 empty parking stalls available for use. **Table 10**, below, summarizes the use characteristics of the combined parking supply in the Core Zone for Saturday.

TOTAL ( <u>3,045</u> Stalls)		11:30. - 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m. PEAK	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
On-street (486 stalls)	Stalls Occupied	270	271	271	297	282	307	363	343	409	314	240
Off-street (2,559 stalls)		437	755	935	1,208	1,373	1,475	1,407	1,435	1,433	1,416	1,314
Combined occupied stalls		707	1,026	1,206	1,505	1,655	1,782	1,770	1,778	1,842	1,730	1,,554
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	23.2%	33.7%	39.6%	49.4%	54.4%	58.5%	58.1%	58.4%	66.4%	62.3%	56.0%
	Empty Stalls Available											
	by Hour	2,338	2,019	1,839	1,540	1,390	1,263	1,275	1,267	1,203	1,315	1,491

 TABLE 10

 CORE ZONE: COMBINED ON & OFF-STREET PARKING AREA SUMMARY

# *F.* General Conclusions for the Combined Core Zone

On Saturday, the Core Zone operates with an abundant supply of parking during the morning and afternoon hours. Beginning at approximately 4:30 p.m., parking activity steadily ramps up to an evening peak hour at 7:30 p.m. On-street parking during the evening peak hour is close to the "optimum" utilization of 85%. Nonetheless, a substantial surplus of parking is available in publicly available off-street lots and garages located within the zone. This would suggest a need for increased communication of the availability of the off-street supply to patrons of the Core Zone (i.e. wayfinding, signage and/or pricing).

On-street turnover (at a rate of 5.5) is currently less efficient than the intended turnover ratio for a one-hour meter (i.e., 8.0). The high percentage of time stay violations indicates that patrons may desire an opportunity to stay on-street for visits in the range of 1.5 hours.

In general, the Core Zone appears to have an adequate capacity of parking to meet current and future levels of Saturday parking demand. More focused systems for directing patrons to available supply will need to be designed and implemented.

#### 4. DATA FINDINGS – <u>Convention Center Zone</u>

For purposes of this analysis, MMDC defined the Convention Center Zone as the area comprised of parking located between Spokane Falls Boulevard (north), First Avenue (south), Washington (west) and Division (east). **Figure 3**, below, provides a map of this study zone.

#### A. Composition of the Supply

MMDC surveyed a total of 1,188 stalls in the Convention Center Zone. Of surveyed stalls, 329 stalls were located on-street and 859 were located in eight off-street lots/garages. **Table 11** presents a breakout of the surveyed parking supply in the Convention Center Zone. Detailed graphs illustrating usage for this study zone are included as **Graph C** at the end of this technical memorandum.



FIGURE 3 Convention Center Zone

# TABLE 11 CONVENTION CENTER ZONE: COMPOSITION OF THE PARKING SUPPLY

Conven	Convention Center Zone Study Area Parking Stall Breakout										
On-Street Meters by Type	On-Street Meters by Type Number of Stalls % of Total On-Street										
0.25	3	1%									
0.5	5	2%									
1	41	12%									
1.5	0	0%									
2	179	54%									

3	50	15%
6	0	0%
10	51	16%
Sub-Total On-Street Parking Stalls	329	100%
Off-Street Parking Stalls (Sub-Total)	859	
TOTAL Convention Center Zone Parking Supply	1,188	

Overall, the Convention Center Zone maintains a high percentage of 2.0 hour parking stalls, with approximately 54% of the on-street supply made up of these types of stalls. An additional 101 stalls are evenly divided between 3-hour (50 stalls/15%) and 10-hours (51 stalls/16%). The remainder of the zone (48 total stalls) provides a mix of 15 minute, 30 minute and 1.0-hour parking meters.

#### B. Use of On-Street Metered Supply

The Convention Center Zone's peak hour for parking is between 7:30 p.m. and 8:30 p.m. This correlates with the evening peak hour for the Core Zone and is likely due to the number of restaurants/pubs in the eastern end of the zone.

On-street parking is significantly underutilized between 11:30 a.m. and 5:30 p.m., never exceeding 45% occupancy during this time. At the evening peak, 59.0% of all on-street parking stalls in the zone are occupied. During this peak hour of demand, 135 on-street stalls are empty and available for use in the Convention Center Zone.

**Table 12**, below, summarizes Saturday parking for the Convention Center Zone.

On-Street Parking CONVENTION CENTER ZONE		11:30. _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m. PEAK	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
Metered (329 stalls)	Stalls Occupied by Hour	123	138	130	120	147	122	148	181	194	186	104
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	37.4%	41.9%	39.5%	36.5%	44.7%	37.1%	45.0%	55.0%	59.0%	56.5%	31.6%
	Empty Stalls Available by Hour	206	191	199	209	182	207	181	148	135	143	225

 TABLE 12

 CONVENTION CENTER ZONE: ON-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

#### *C.* General Characteristics of Use – On-Street Metered Supply

Over the course of the entire study day (i.e., 11:30 a.m. to 10:30 p.m.), approximately 685 unique license plates were recorded using the 329 metered parking stalls within the Convention Center Zone. This represents 15% of all unique vehicles recorded within the entire South Zone Study Area on Saturday. If only the period between 11:30 a.m. and 5:30 p.m. is considered (i.e., hours during which enforcement is in effect), 359 unique license plates were recorded (16% of all vehicles recorded during enforcement hours).

The average duration of stay for a vehicle parked at a meter during hours of enforcement was 1 hour and 42 minutes (or 1.70 hours). As such, over the course of an 8-hour day, a metered stall will turn approximately 4.7 times. Given that the majority of parking in the Convention Center Zone is 2.0 hour parking, the intended turnover rate for the zone would be in the range of 4.0. At 4.7 turns, the Convention Center Zone is operating within its intended parameters.

Nevertheless, as with the Core Zone, a high rate of time stay violations is evident in this zone. Violations are at 16.4% of all stalls surveyed. Nearly one in six patrons parked on-street in the Convention Center Zone overstays the posted limit for the stall they are using. However, given peak occupancies of less than 60%, it does not appear that time stay violations are jeopardizing or constraining customer access to on-street stalls.

 Table 13, below, summarizes the characteristics of use for the Convention Center

 Zone.

USE CHARACTERISTIC	DATA FINDING
Number of unique vehicles (entire study day)	685
Number of total vehicle hours (total hours that cars parked in the study zone)	1,253
Number of unique vehicles (11:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	359
Average duration per unique vehicle (entire study day)	1.83 hrs (1 hour and 50 minutes)
Average duration per unique vehicle during enforcement period (11:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	1.70 hrs (1 hour and 42 minutes)
Turnover (number of cars to use a single occupied stall over an 8 hour period)	4.7 times
% of all vehicles violating the posted time stay	16.4%
% of total parked hours in violation	16.2%

# TABLE 13

#### **GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF USE - METERED STALLS**

# D. Use of Off-Street Supply

The *off-street* supply of parking in the Convention Center Zone reaches peak capacity between 11:30 a.m. and 12:30 p.m. As **Table 14** below indicates, the off-street supply reaches 27.7% of capacity at the peak hour. As such, at the peak hour of demand 621

stalls are empty and available for use off-street in the Convention Center Zone. In general, off-street parking in the zone is significantly underutilized.

Unlike the Core Zone, off-street parking in the Convention Center Zone does not "ramp up" in the evening hours after 5:30 p.m. In fact, parking use actually begins a consistent decline beginning at 4:30 p.m. This is not surprising, given the low utilization rates for <u>on-street</u> parking in this zone, which covers demand for evening uses that peak at between 7:30 p.m. and 8:30 p.m.

 TABLE 14

 CONVENTION CENTER ZONE OFF-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

Off-Street Parking		11:30. _ 12:30 p.m. PEAK	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
8 lots/ garages <u>(859</u> total stalls)	Stalls Occupied	238	213	197	192	199	144	127	120	109	106	93
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	27.7%	24.8%	22.9%	22.4%	23.2%	16.8%	14.8%	14.0%	12.7%	12.3%	10.8%
	Empty Stalls Available By Hour	621	646	662	667	660	715	732	739	750	753	766

#### *E.* Use of the Combined Supply (on and off-street)

When both on and off-street supplies are combined, the peak hour for parking in the Convention Center Zone occurs between 11:30 a.m. and 12:30 p.m. During the Convention Center Zone peak hour 30.4% of the parking supply is occupied, leaving approximately 827 empty parking stalls available for use. **Table 15**, below, summarizes the use characteristics of the combined parking supply.

 TABLE 15

 CONVENTION CENTER ZONE: COMBINED ON & OFF-STREET PARKING AREA

 SUMMARY

TOTAL <u>1,188</u> Stalls		11:30. - 12:30 p.m. PEAK	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
On-street 329 stalls	Stalls Occupied	123	138	130	120	147	122	148	181	194	186	104
Off-street 859 stalls		238	213	197	192	199	144	127	120	109	106	93
Combined occupied		361	351	327	312	346	266	275	301	303	292	197

stalls												
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour											
	$\rightarrow$	30.4%	29.5%	27.5%	26.3%	29.1%	22.4%	23.1%	25.3%	25.5%	24.6%	16.6%
·	Empty Stalls Available by Hour	827	837	861	876	842	922	913	887	885	896	991

### F. General Conclusions for the Combined Convention Center Zone

On Saturday, parking use in the Convention Center Zone is significantly underutilized. As such, large surpluses of parking exist in both the on-street and off-street supply within the boundaries of this study zone. Turnover is efficient in the larger context of stalls designated for stays of two hours or more, which represents the majority of parking in the study area. On-street turnover (at a rate of 4.7 turns per day) is currently in excess of the intended turnover ratio for a 2.0-hour meter (i.e. 4.0 turns). The zone has a very high percentage of time stay violations though this does not appear, as yet, to have had an effect on customer access to available stalls.

In general, the Convention Center Zone appears to have adequate capacity to meet current and future levels of Saturday parking demand.

# 5. DATA FINDINGS – <u>West End Zone</u>

For purposes of this analysis, MMDC defined the West End Zone as the area comprised of parking located between Spokane Falls Boulevard (north), First Avenue (south), Monroe (east) and Cedar (west). **Figure 4**, below, provides a map of this study zone.



#### A. Composition of the Supply

MMDC surveyed a total of 583 stalls in the West End Zone. Of surveyed stalls, 365 stalls were located on-street and 218 were located in three off-street lots. **Table 16** presents a breakout of the surveyed parking supply in the West End Zone. Detailed graphs illustrating usage for this study zone are included as **Graph D** at the end of this technical memorandum.

V	Nest End Zone Area Parking Stall Break	cout
On-Street Meters by Type	Number of Stalls	% of Total On-Street Stalls
0.25	1	<1%
0.5	7	2%
1	24	7%
1.5	0	0%
2	174	48%
3	60	16%
6	0	0%
10	99	27%
Sub-Total On-Street Parking Stalls	365	100%
Off-Street Parking Stalls (Sub-Total)	218	
TOTAL West End Zone Parking Supply	583	

TABLE 16 WEST END ZONE: COMPOSITION OF THE PARKING SUPPLY

Overall, nearly half (48%) of the on-street parking in the West End Zone is comprised of 2.0 hour parking stalls. Another 159 stalls are divided between 3.0 hour (60 stalls/16%) and 10 hour stalls (99 stalls/27%). The remainder of the zone (32 total stalls) provides a mix of 15 minute, 30 minute and 1.0-hour parking meters.

#### B. Use of On-Street Metered Supply

Unlike data for Thursday, on-street parking in the West End Zone does not display a "dual peak" hour, nor does use reach near optimum levels. As **Table 17** below illustrates, the peak hour for parking demand in this zone occurs between 8:30 p.m. – 9:30 p.m.<sup>7</sup> At that time, 57.5% of all on-street parking stalls in the zone are occupied, leaving 155 on-street stalls empty and available for use in the West End Zone.

Overall, on-street parking in the West End Zone achieves only moderate levels of use throughout the course of the day on Saturday.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> This is one hour later than the Core Zone peak hour for on-street parking.

 TABLE 17

 WEST END ZONE: ON-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

On- Street Parking WEST END ZONE		11:30. _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m. PEAK	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
Metered (365 stalls)	Stalls Occupied by Hour	94	106	102	99	95	140	195	142	206	210	166
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	25.8%	29.0%	27.9%	27.1%	26.0%	38.4%	53.4%	38.9%	56.4%	57.5%	45.5%
	Empty Stalls Available by Hour	271	259	263	266	270	225	170	223	159	155	199

#### C. General Characteristics of Use – On-Street Metered Supply

Over the course of the entire study day (i.e., 11:30 a.m. to 10:30 p.m.), approximately 696 unique license plates were recorded using the 365 metered parking stalls within the zone. This represents 15% of all unique vehicles recorded within the entire South Study Zone Area on Saturday. If only the period between 11:30 a.m. and 5:30 p.m. is considered (i.e., hours during which enforcement is in effect), 246 unique license plates were recorded during enforcement hours).

The average duration of stay for a vehicle parked at a meter during hours of enforcement was 1 hour and 56 minutes (or 1.94 hours).<sup>8</sup> As such, over the course of an 8-hour day, a metered stall will turn approximately 4.1 times. Given that the majority of parking in the West End Zone is 2.0 hour parking, the intended turnover rate for the zone is 4.0 turns. At 4.1 turns, the West End Zone is generally operating as intended.

Of note is that time stay violations in the West End Zone rose significantly on Saturday as compared to the same zone during the Thursday survey. Saturday violations were 16.7% as compared to 9.0% on Thursday. However, as with other zones already described above, it does not appear that the Saturday increase in time stay violations is limiting patron access to on-street parking.

**Table 18**, below, summarizes the characteristics of use for the West End Zone.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> This is the longest time stay duration recorded for any zone during the Thursday and Saturday inventories.

# TABLE 18 GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF USE - METERED STALLS

USE CHARACTERISTIC	DATA FINDING
Number of unique vehicles (entire study day)	696
Number of total vehicle hours (total hours that cars parked in the study zone)	1,261
Number of unique vehicles (11:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	246
Average duration per unique vehicle (entire study day)	1.81 hrs (1 hour and 49 minutes)
Average duration per unique vehicle during enforcement period (11:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	1.94 hrs (1 hour and 56 minutes)
Turnover (number of cars to use a single occupied stall over an 8 hour period)	4.1 times
% of all vehicles violating the posted time stay	16.7%
% of total parked hours in violation	16.4%

# D. Use of Off-Street Supply

The *off-street* supply of parking in the West End Zone reaches peak capacity between 12:30 a.m. and 1:30 p.m. As **Table 19** below indicates, the off-street supply reaches 35.5% of capacity at the peak hour. As such, at the peak hour of demand 140 stalls are empty and available for patron use off-street in the West End Zone.

As with the Convention Center Zone, off-street parking demand does not "ramp up" in the evening hours. In fact, parking use actually begins a consistent decline beginning at 4:30 p.m. This is not surprising, given the low utilization rates for <u>on-street</u> parking in this zone, which covers demand for evening uses that peak at between 8:30 p.m. and 9:30 p.m. Overall, publicly available off-street parking is significantly underutilized in the West End Zone on Saturday.

#### E. Use of the Combined Supply (on and off-street)

For the combined supply, the West End Zone demonstrates a very modest dual peak. A midday peak of 31.6% occupancy occurs between 12:30 a.m. and 1:30 p.m., leaving 399 available stalls. The evening peak occurs between 8:30 p.m. and 9:30 p.m. (42.0% with 338 available stalls). **Table 20**, below, summarizes the use characteristics of the combined on and off-street parking supply.

TABLE 19
WEST END ZONE: OFF-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

Off-Street Parking WEST END ZONE		11:30. _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m. PEAK	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.	9:30 _ 10:30 p.m.
3 lots/ garages <u>(218</u> total stalls)	Stalls Occupied	74	78	74	74	67	50	43	38	37	35	15
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	33.9%	35.8%	33.9%	33.9%	30.7%	22.9%	19.7%	17.4%	17.0%	16.1%	6.9%
	Empty Stalls Available By Hour	144	140	144	144	151	168	175	180	181	183	203

 TABLE 20

 WEST END ZONE: COMBINED ON & OFF-STREET PARKING AREA SUMMARY

TOTAL ( <u>583</u> Stalls)	· ·	11:30. _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m. PEAK	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m. PEAK	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
On-street	Stalls											
365 stalls	Occupied	94	106	102	99	95	140	195	142	206	210	166
Off-street												
218 stalls		74	78	74	74	67	50	43	38	37	35	15
Combined occupied stalls		168	184	176	173	162	190	238	180	243	245	181
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	28.8%	31.6%	30.2%	29.7%	27.8%	32.6%	40.8%	30.9%	41.7%	42.0%	31.0%
	Empty Stalls Available	415	399	407	410	421	303	345	403	340	338	402

# F. General Conclusions for the Combined West End Zone

The West End Zone operates much differently on Saturday than it does during the general weekday (i.e. Thursday) when it is the most active parking zone. The zone maintains very moderate peak hour occupancies throughout the entire operating day, peaking at 42% for the combined parking supply.

On-street turnover (at a rate of 4.1) is supportive of an intended turnover ratio for a 2.0hour meter (i.e. 4.0). Time stay violations are much higher on Saturday than Thursday in this zone, reaching levels more consistent with patterns displayed in the rest of the downtown. As with other zones, the rate of time stay violations does not constrain or impact customer access to available on-street parking supply.

In general, the West End Zone appears to have an adequate capacity of parking to meet current and future levels of demand.

#### 6. DATA FINDINGS – <u>Periphery Zone</u>

For purposes of this analysis, MMDC defined the Periphery as the large area comprised of parking located between First Avenue (north), Third Avenue (south), Division (east) and Cedar (west).

Figure 5, below, provides a map of this study zone.



Figure 5 Periphery Zone Boundaries

A. Composition of the Supply

MMDC surveyed a total of 1,737 stalls in the Periphery Zone. Of surveyed stalls, 757 stalls were located on-street and 980 were located in eight off-street lots. **Table 21** presents a breakout of the surveyed parking supply in the Periphery Zone. Detailed graphs illustrating usage for this study zone are included as **Graph E** at the end of this technical memorandum.

Periphery Zone Study Area Parking Stall Breakout								
On-Street Meters by Type	Number of Stalls	% of Total On-Street Stalls						
0.25	3	0%						
0.5	30	4%						
1	34	4%						
1.5	0	0%						
2	468	62%						
3	121	16%						
6	0	0%						

TABLE 21PERIPHERY ZONE: COMPOSITION OF THE PARKING SUPPLY

10	101	13%
Sub-Total On-Street Parking Stalls	757	100%
Off-Street Parking Stalls (Sub-Total)	980	
TOTAL Periphery Zone Parking Supply	1,737	

Overall, the majority of the on-street parking in the Periphery End Zone is comprised of 2.0 hour parking stalls, accounting for 62% of the supply. Another 333 stalls are divided between 3.0 hour (121 stalls/16%) and 10 hour stalls (101 stalls/13%). The rest of the zone (67 stalls) provides a mix of 15 minute, 30 minute and 1.0-hour parking meters.

### B. Use of On-Street Metered Supply

*On-street* parking in the Periphery Zone gradually increases use over the course of the day culminating in a modest peak hour that occurs between 5:30 p.m. and 6:30 p.m. As **Table 22** below indicates, the highest level of demand in this zone reaches just 36.5, leaving 481 on-street stalls empty and available for use in the Periphery Zone. Overall, on-street parking in the Periphery Zone is substantially underutilized throughout the day and into the evening on Saturday.

On-Street Parking PERIPHERY ZONE		11:30. _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m. PEAK	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
Metered	Stalls Occupied											
757 Stalls	by Hour	152	148	158	192	195	233	276	273	233	161	78
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	20.1%	19.6%	20.9%	25.4%	25.8%	30.8%	36.5%	36.1%	30.8%	21.3%	10.3%
	Empty Stalls Available											
	by Hour	605	609	599	565	562	524	481	484	524	596	679

 TABLE 22

 PERIPHERY ZONE: ON-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

#### *C.* General Characteristics of Use – On-Street Metered Supply

Over the course of the entire study day (i.e., 11:30 a.m. to 10:30 p.m.), approximately 1,021 unique license plates were recorded using the 757 metered parking stalls within the zone. This represents approximately 22% of all unique vehicles recorded within the entire South Study area on Saturday. If only the period between 11:30 a.m. and 5:30 p.m. is considered (i.e., hours during which enforcement is in effect), 457 unique license plates were recorded (or 20% of all vehicles recorded during enforcement hours).

The average duration of stay for a vehicle parked at a meter during hours of enforcement was 1 hour and 49 minutes (or 1.81 hours). As such, over the course of an 8-hour day, a metered stall will turn approximately 4.4 times. Given that the majority

of parking in the Periphery Zone is 2.0 hour parking, the intended turnover rate for the zone is 4.0 turns. At 4.4 turns, the Periphery Zone is operating as intended.

Time stay violations in the Periphery Zone were recorded at 16.6% of all stalls surveyed, meaning one in six patrons overstay the posted time stay for use of their stall. This is somewhat higher than Thursday time zone violations rate of 12.7%. However, as with the West End and Convention Center Zones, it does not appear that time stay violations are limiting patron access to on-street parking.

Table 23, below, summarizes the characteristics of use for the Periphery Zone.

USE CHARACTERISTIC	DATA FINDING
Number of unique vehicles (entire study day)	1,021
Number of total vehicle hours (total hours that cars parked in the study zone)	1,728
Number of unique vehicles (11:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	457
Average duration per unique vehicle (entire study day)	1.69 hrs (1 hour and 41 minutes)
Average duration per unique vehicle during enforcement period (11:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	1.81 hrs (1 hour and 49 minutes)
Turnover (number of cars to use a single occupied stall over an 8 hour period)	4.4 times
% of all vehicles violating the posted time stay	16.6%
% of total parked hours in violation	16.9%

 TABLE 23

 GENERAL CHARACTERISTICS OF USE - METERED STALLS

#### D. Use of Off-Street Supply

The *off-street* supply of parking in the Periphery Zone operates at a much lower level than recorded during the Thursday survey of this zone. On Thursday, the Periphery Zone had off-street occupancies of 70.7% between 10:30 a.m. and 11:30 p.m., the highest in the downtown. Saturday peak occupancy occurs between 8:30 p.m. and 9:30 p.m. when the off-street supply is at just 45.2% occupied.

As **Table 24** below indicates, at the Saturday peak hour of demand 537 stalls are empty and available for use off-street in the Periphery Zone.

 TABLE 24

 PERIPHERY ZONE OFF-STREET PARKING SUMMARY

Off-Street Parking PERIPHERY ZONE		11:30. – 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m. PEAK	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m.	8:30 – 9:30 p.m. PEAK	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
8 lots/garages <u>980</u> total stalls	Stalls Occupied	149	166	163	170	213	270	307	395	442	443	416
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	15.2%	16.9%	16.6%	17.3%	21.7%	27.6%	31.3%	40.3%	45.1%	45.2%	42.4%
	Empty Stalls Available By Hour	831	814	817	810	767	710	673	585	538	537	564

#### *E.* Use of the Combined Supply (on and off-street)

When both on and off-street supplies are combined, the peak hour for parking in the Periphery Zone occurs between 7:30 p.m. and 8:30 p.m., consistent with the peak for the entire South Study Zone. During the Periphery Zone peak hour 38.9% of the parking supply is occupied, leaving approximately 1,062 empty parking stalls available for use.

Table 25, below, summarizes the use characteristics of the combined parking supply.

TOTAL <u>1,737</u> Stalls		11:30. _ 12:30 p.m.	12:30 - 1:30 p.m.	1:30 – 2:30 p.m.	2:30 - 3:30 p.m.	3:30 – 4:30 p.m.	4:30 – 5:30 p.m.	5:30 – 6:30 p.m.	6:30 – 7:30 p.m.	7:30 – 8:30 p.m. PEAK	8:30 – 9:30 p.m.	9:30 – 10:30 p.m.
On-street 757 stalls	Stalls Occupied	152	148	158	192	195	233	276	273	233	161	78
Off-street 980stalls		149	166	163	170	213	270	307	395	442	443	416
Combined occupied stalls		301	314	321	362	408	503	583	668	675	604	494
	% Stalls Occupied by Hour	17.3%	18.1%	18.5%	20.8%	23.5%	29.0%	33.6%	38.5%	38.9%	34.8%	28.4%
	Empty Stalls Available	1 4 3 6	1 4 2 3	1 4 1 6	1 375	1 329	1 234	1 154	1 069	1 062	1 133	1 243

TABLE 25 PERIPHERY ZONE: COMBINED ON & OFF-STREET PARKING AREA SUMMARY

#### *F.* General Conclusions for the Combined Periphery Zone

A large surplus of parking exists both on and off-street in this zone on Saturday. The overall use of parking is low, with a moderate build up of evening activity beginning at 7:30 p.m.

On-street turnover (at a rate of 4.4 turns) is supportive of an intended turnover ratio for a 2.0-hour meter (i.e. 4.0 turns). Time stay violations (at 16.6%) are high but do not appear to create adverse impacts on the availability of on-street parking.

In general, the Periphery Zone appears to have an adequate capacity of parking to meet current and future levels of Saturday demand.

### 7. SUMMARY

Saturday data findings for the South Study Area can be summarized as follows.

- Overall occupancy of the South Study Area reaches a peak capacity of 49.1% in the peak hour (i.e., 7:30 p.m. – 8:30 p.m.).
- At the peak hour, the downtown maintains an available supply of approximately 3,257 on and off-street parking stalls.
- The *on-street* parking system in the Core Zone reaches 84.2% during an evening peak hour, the highest level of demand of any zone on Saturday.
- Unlike data found during the Thursday survey, the West End Zone is not as active on Saturday, maintaining abundant parking availability both on and off-street.
- While the on-street occupancy in the Core approaches an optimum standard of 85% at the evening peak hour, there is low utilization of *off-street* facilities in the same zone. Off-street facilities in the Core Zone do not exceed peak hour utilization of greater than 58%. At its highest peak hour, the Core Zone maintains a minimum of 1,084 available off-street stalls. As with the Thursday survey, this relationship underscores the need for a better system of wayfinding/signage, communication, lighting/landscaping and pricing that draws patrons into off-street facilities during peak hours.
- Time stay violations are high in the downtown study area. The situation in the Core Zone is likely the result of the high number of 1.0 hour meters (and 30 minute meters) in the zone, which is out of sync with a patron's average time stay of approximately 1.5 hours. A review and reconsideration of the mix of time stay allowances in the Core Zone is recommended.

• It appears that the available supply of parking in the peak hours is adequate to accommodate current and future levels of Saturday demand in all of the parking zones surveyed











#### Appendix C Inventory Analysis – Passenger and Commercial Loading Zones

#### A. BACKGROUND

One of the most important elements for creating an active, vibrant downtown environment is the availability of convenient, accessible on-street parking for the customer/visitor/patron of the downtown. Increasing the number of available on-street parking opportunities for patrons will maximize the number of customers/visitors accessing the downtown. Efficient and optimal use of *on-street* parking also helps to reduce the overall amount of *off-street* parking stalls (potentially in parking structures) that need to be built. Off-street parking, while necessary, is much more expensive to provide.

The first level of review in a parking management plan is an evaluation of potential opportunities to "add back" parking on-street. This can be accomplished by providing parking at block faces that currently have no parking (pending review of traffic and safety impacts) and/or converting existing parking (i.e., loading zones, 15-minute zones, taxi zones, etc.) that is underutilized to more appropriate use designations (i.e., metered with appropriate time stay allowances).

To this end, the Parking Steering Committee (PSC) requested a more specific analysis of Passenger Loading Zones (PLZ) and Commercial Loading Zones (CLZ) in the downtown using actual usage data derived from the Parking Demand Analysis inventory conducted in downtown on May 20 and 22, 2004.

The basic question asked by the PSC was: Are there spaces currently designated as PLZ or CLZ that would better serve the downtown as metered patron stalls if it was demonstrated that PLZ or CLZs were significantly underutilized?



Information gained through this analysis assisted the PSC in its deliberation of strategies and management programs designed to improve overall access for patrons and users of the downtown. The following analysis addresses some of the potential add back opportunities for Downtown Spokane regarding loading zones.

#### B. METHODOLOGY

During the course of the downtown-parking inventory, surveyors counted the number of vehicles occupying passenger and commercial loading zones during each hour of the study. Counts were conducted between 10:30 a.m. and 9:30 p.m. on Thursday, May 20, 2004 and 11:30 a.m. and 10:30 p.m. on Saturday, May 22, 2004.<sup>1</sup> Since restrictions on the use of PLZs and CLZs

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> For the purposes of this analysis, data from the May 20, 2004 survey was used (versus Saturday, May 22, 2004) because the Thursday study day provided higher percentages of use, thereby ensuring a more conservative representation of parking activity in passenger and commercial loading zones. Stated differently, if Saturday data were used for the analysis, use of these zones would be understated.

are in effect until 6:00 p.m. (except for a few cases) this analysis summarizes usage only until 6:00 p.m., assuming that after 6:00 p.m. these zones generally operate no differently than a metered stall.

To be consistent with information already provided in Section I of this report, data for loading zones has been summarized for the entire South Study Zone area as well as four sub-zones that include:

- Core Zone
- Convention Center Zone
- West End Zone
- Periphery Zone

#### C. PASSENGER LOADING ZONES (PLZ)

Within the boundaries of the South Study Zone area there are a total of 40 PLZs. Of that total 25 are in the Core Zone, two are in the Convention Center Zone, four in the West End Zone and nine in the Periphery Zone. Each PLZ differs in total size ranging from 20 to 140 feet. If these stalls were converted to standard on-street metered parking stalls, 72 metered stalls could be "added back" to the supply.

Table 1,	below,	summarizes	actual	use data	from the	e on-street	parking	inventory	
----------	--------	------------	--------	----------	----------	-------------	---------	-----------	--

	# of Existing PLZs	# of <u>Potential</u> Metered Stalls if Converted	Possible Vehicle Hours (10:30 a.m. – 5:30 p.m.)	Actual Vehicle Hours in Use on Survey Day	Actual Usage as Percent of Possible Vehicle Hours <sup>2</sup>
Core Zone	25	48	336	54	16%
Convention Center Zone	2	3	21	1	5%
West End Zone	4	6	42	3	7%
Periphery Zone	9	15	105	17	16%
Totals (South Study Area)	40	72	504	75	15%

Table 1 Passenger Loading Zones

For each of the four parking data zones in the downtown, the following conclusions can be derived as regards utilization of PLZs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> It is important to note that these utilization numbers are very low, considering that the on-street peak utilization of metered stalls was significantly higher in each zone observed during the survey days.

#### Core Zone

- ✓ There are 25 passenger-loading zones distributed across the Core Zone.
- ✓ Based on the size of the current zones, there is the potential to create up to 48 metered on-street stalls.
- $\checkmark$  Those 48 potential stalls had 336 possible vehicle hours for use during the survey day.<sup>3</sup>
- ✓ Only 54 actual vehicle hours were recorded during the course of the survey day, which represents 16 percent utilization across all stalls.

#### Convention Center Zone

- ✓ There are two passenger-loading zones located in the Convention Center Zone.
- ✓ Based on the size of the current zones, there is the potential to create up to three metered on-street stalls.
- ✓ Those three potential stalls had 21 possible vehicle hours for use during the survey day.
- ✓ Only one vehicle hour was recorded during the course of the survey day, which represents just 5 percent utilization of these stalls in the Convention Center Zone.

#### West End Zone

- ✓ There are four passenger-loading zones located in the West End Zone.
- ✓ Based on the size of the current zones, there is the potential to create up to six metered on-street stalls.
- ✓ Those six potential stalls had 42 possible vehicle hours for use during the survey day.
- ✓ Only three vehicle hours were recorded during the course of the survey day, which represents just 7 percent utilization of these stalls in the West End Zone.

#### Periphery Zone

- ✓ There are nine passenger-loading zones located in the Periphery Zone.
- ✓ Based on the size of the current zones, there is the potential to create up to 15 metered on-street stalls.
- ✓ Those 15 potential stalls had 105 possible vehicle hours for use during the survey day.
- ✓ Only 17 vehicle hours were recorded during the course of the survey day, which represents 16 percent utilization of these stalls in the Periphery Zone.

Overall, the entire demonstrated use of PLZs in the South Study Zone reaches an average of just 15% of all potential vehicle hours during which a patron vehicle could be parked. This is of particular relevance in the Core Zone where a small deficit of on-street stalls (28 stalls) has been established during the peak hour.

In summary, it appears that PLZs receive very minimal use by patrons of the downtown. Conversion of PLZs to metered stalls would "add back" 72 potential parking stalls to the South Zone study area. Given that the parking inventory established an average daily turnover rate in the downtown of 5.1 turns per metered stall per day, adding back underutilized PLZs would create capacity for an additional 367 vehicle trips during the course of a typical enforcement day. In the Core Zone alone, which currently has 486 metered stalls, the conversion of the 25

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> 48 potential stalls each with 7 observable enforcement hours (10:30 a.m. to 5:30 p.m.) yields 336 possible vehicle hours.

PLZs into 48 metered stalls represents a potential 10 percent increase in the number of onstreet spaces that would be available to patrons. This would be a simple and efficient solution to the current on-street parking deficit in the Core Zone and a significant accomplishment at little to no cost to the city.

#### D. COMMERCIAL LOADING ZONES (CLZ)

Within the boundaries of the South Study Zone area there are a total of 119 CLZs. Of that total 47 are in the Core Zone, 13 are in the Convention Center Zone, 10 in the West End Zone and 49 in the Periphery Zone. Each CLZ differs in total size ranging from 20 to 140 feet. If these stalls were converted to standard on-street metered parking stalls, 207 metered stalls could be "added back" to the supply.<sup>4</sup>

**Table 2**, below, summarizes actual use data from the on-street parking inventory.

	# of CLZs	# of Potential Stalls	Possible Vehicle Hours	Actual Vehicle Hours	Percent Usage
Core Zone	47	88	616	106	17%
Convention Center Zone	13	21	147	15	10%
West End Zone	10	18	126	12	10%
Periphery Zone	49	80	560	60	11%
Totals	119	207	1449	193	13%

Table 2 **Commercial Loading Zones** 

For each of the four parking data zones downtown, the following conclusions can be derived as regards utilization of CLZs.

#### Core Zone

- $\checkmark$ There are 47 commercial loading zones distributed across the Core Zone.
- 1 Based on the size of the current zones, there is the potential to create up to 88-metered on-street stalls.
- Those 88 potential stalls had 616 possible vehicle hours for use during the survey day.<sup>5</sup>
- Only 106 actual vehicle hours were recorded during the course of the survey day, which represents 17 percent utilization across all stalls.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Unlike PLZs it is important to recognize the important and necessary function that CLZs provide for business and the movement of freight and other services into and out of the downtown. It is doubtful that 100% conversion of CLZs to on-street metered parking would occur (as it could with PLZs). Nonetheless, an analysis of the actual utilization of CLZs is important to the overall discussion of on-street parking. Strategic reduction of CLZ spaces, based on utilization, is clearly a relevant and cost-effective parking management strategy. <sup>5</sup> 88 potential stalls each with 7 observable enforcement hours (10:30 a.m. to 5:30 p.m.) yields 616 possible vehicle

hours.

#### Convention Center Zone

- ✓ There are 13 commercial loading zones located in the Convention Center Zone.
- ✓ Based on the size of the current zones, there is the potential to create up to 21 metered on-street stalls.
- ✓ Those 21 potential stalls had 147 possible vehicle hours for use during the survey day.
- ✓ Only 15 vehicle hours were recorded during the course of the survey day, which represents just 10 percent utilization of these stalls in the Convention Center Zone.

#### West End Zone

- ✓ There are 10 passenger loading zones located in the West End Zone.
- ✓ Based on the size of the current zones, there is the potential to create up to 18 metered on-street stalls.
- Those 18 potential stalls had 126 possible vehicle hours for use during the survey day.
- Only 12 vehicle hours were recorded during the course of the survey day, which represents just 10 percent utilization of these stalls in the West End Zone.

#### Periphery Zone

- ✓ There are 49 passenger loading zones located in the Periphery Zone.
- ✓ Based on the size of the current zones, there is the potential to create up to 80 metered on-street stalls.
- ✓ Those 80 potential stalls had 560 possible vehicle hours for use during the survey day.
- ✓ Only 60 vehicle hours were recorded during the course of the survey day, which represents 11 percent utilization of these stalls in the Periphery Zone.



Overall, the entire demonstrated use of CLZs in the South Study Zone reaches an average of just 13% of all potential vehicle hours during which a patron vehicle could be parked. In general, it is accurate to say that current CLZ zones may be overprovided based on actual demonstrated use.

While the consultant team would not suggest significant reductions in CLZs given the need for on-going freight and delivery access, *this analysis demonstrates that further investigation of underutilized or poorly placed CLZs, particularly in the Core Zone where patron parking demand is most prevalent.* The City should consider developing definitive criteria for citing future CLZs in the downtown and <u>make better use of combination zones</u> that serve commercial loading and unloading in the morning hours while also serving customer/visitor needs (as metered parking) during the midday and afternoon peaks.

#### V. SUMMARY

Based on information derived from the on-street data survey, it is clear that PLZs and CLZs in the downtown are underutilized. It appears that significant reductions or even elimination of PLZs would result in benefits to both the downtown (in terms of net new parking access) and to downtown patrons (in terms of increased parking availability). The "add back" of PLZs to metered patron parking supply would also likely result in increased revenue to the City and a reduction in the cost of future off-street parking development. The analysis also calls for a strategic investigation of areas and block faces in the downtown that could convert some CLZ space to metered patron supply.
## SPOKANE PARKING ANALYSIS - B Prototype Garage 343 STALLS

343	3 Stalls														
REVENUES			22	20	21	22	23	20	22	22	20	23	19	21	
	DAILY (M - F)	Usage	<u>Jan</u>	<u>Feb</u>	Mar	<u>Apr</u>	May	<u>Jun</u>	<u>Jul</u>	Aug	<u>Sep</u>	<u>Oct</u>	Nov	Dec	<u>Total</u>
Hourly Rate	1.00	961	21,148	19,226	20,187	21,148	22,109	19,226	21,148	21,148	19,226	22,109	18,264	20,187	245,126
Daily Max	5.00	34	3,771	3,429	3,600	3,771	3,943	3,429	3,771	3,771	3,429	3,943	3,257	3,600	43,714
Monthly Pass	80.00	51	4,114	4,114	4,114	4,114	4,114	4,114	4,114	4,114	4,114	4,114	4,114	4,114	49,371
Sub-Total: - Daily (M-F) 1,047			29,034	26,768	27,901	29,034	30,167	26,768	29,034	29,034	26,768	30,167	25,636	27,901	338,211
	EVE/WKND														
Evening	2.00	225	9,889	8,990	9,439	9,889	10,338	8,990	9,889	9,889	8,990	10,338	8,540	9,439	114,619
Wknd 1 (Sat)	2.00	652	6,518	6,518	6,518	6,518	6,518	6,518	6,518	6,518	6,518	6,518	6,518	6,518	78,221
Wknd 2 (Sun)	1.00	130	652	652	652	652	652	652	652	652	652	652	652	652	7,822
Sub-Total: Eve/Wknd 1,007		17,059	16,160	16,609	17,059	17,508	16,160	17,059	17,059	16,160	17,508	15,710	16,609	200,662	
TOTAL: DAIL	Y/EVE&WKND	2,054	46,093	42,928	44,511	46,093	47,675	42,928	46,093	46,093	42,928	47,675	41,346	44,511	538,873
EXPENSES			<u>Jan</u>	<u>Feb</u>	<u>Mar</u>	<u>Apr</u>	<u>May</u>	<u>Jun</u>	<u>Jul</u>	<u>Aug</u>	<u>Sep</u>	<u>Oct</u>	<u>Nov</u>	Dec	<u>Total</u>
Operator Costs		7,114	7,114	7,114	7,114	7,114	7,114	7,114	7,114	7,114	7,114	7,114	7,114	85,371	
Protective Service		2,571	2,571	2,571	2,571	2,571	2,571	2,571	2,571	2,571	2,571	2,571	2,571	30,857	
Sweeping Services			217	217	217	217	217	217	217	217	217	217	217	217	2,609
Administration			800	800	800	800	800	800	800	800	800	800	800	800	9,600
Electricity			2,514	2,514	2,514	2,514	2,514	2,514	2,514	2,514	2,514	2,514	2,514	2,514	30,171
Minor Maintenance/Janito		800	800	800	800	800	800	800	800	800	800	800	800	9,600	
Water & Sewer		160	160	160	160	160	160	160	160	160	160	160	160	1,920	
Elevator Maintenance			257	257	257	257	257	257	257	257	257	257	257	257	3,086
Total Expenses			14,435	14,435	14,435	14,435	14,435	14,435	14,435	14,435	14,435	14,435	14,435	14,435	173,215
NET OPERATI	NG INCOME		31,658	28,494	30,076	31,658	33,240	28,494	31,658	31,658	28,494	33,240	26,912	30,076	365,658