

CITY OF SPOKANE ETHICS COMMISSION

Ethics Commission's Findings, Conclusions and Decision Regarding Complaint Against Terri Pfister

FINDINGS

The Ethics Commission makes the following findings:

1. On July 13, 2015, Cindy Zapotocky submitted to the City Council an ethics complaint regarding City Clerk Terri Pfister, which was subsequently forwarded to the Ethics Commission. On July 17, 2015, Ms. Zapotocky filed a subsequent complaint of the same nature as the July 13, 2015 complaint directly with the Ethics Commission. On August 4, 2015, upon the request of the Ethics Commission, Ms. Zapotocky submitted a letter clarifying her complaint.
2. The complaint alleges that Ms. Pfister failed to provide a written English transcript of a citizen's oral testimony presented to the City Council during the October 27, 2014 City Council meeting in which the citizen spoke in Spanish. Ms. Zapotocky alleges that Ms. Pfister's response that the City Clerk's Office does not provide transcription services to the public for comments made during public meetings was a dereliction of her obligation under the laws of the state to serve the citizens of Spokane.
3. On August 4, 2015, Ms. Pfister filed a written response to the complaint in which she states that no evidence has been submitted that demonstrates that she has violated the Ethics Code. Ms. Pfister further requests that the Ethics Commission dismiss the complaint based on the grounds that it has no jurisdiction pursuant to SMC 1.04A.110 D (1)(a).
4. On August 12, 2015, the Ethics Commission conducted an initial hearing to review Ms. Zapotocky's complaint to determine whether, pursuant to SMC 1.04A.110 D (1)(a), the Commission had jurisdiction to conduct further proceedings.
5. The Commission considered the July 13, 2015 and the July 17, 2015 complaints filed by Ms. Zapotocky, the August 4, 2015 letters submitted by Ms. Zapotocky and Ms. Pfister and the oral presentation presented by Ms. Zapotocky at the August 12, 2015 meeting.

CONCLUSION

The Ethics Commission makes the following conclusions:

The July 13, 2015 and July 17, 2015 complaints, as well as the August 4, 2015 letter from Cindy Zapotocky, fail to assert any facts or cite to any provision of the City's Ethics Code, which would demonstrate that the response by Terri Pfister was a violation of the Ethics Code. The facts and assertions submitted by Ms. Zapotocky fail to establish jurisdiction pursuant to SMC 1.04A.110 D (1)(a).

DECISION

Based upon the Findings and Conclusions set forth above, and the deliberation of the Ethics Commission during the August 12, 2015 meeting, the Ethics Commission unanimously voted to dismiss the complaint on the basis that complaint failed to set forth facts or alleged conduct that would establish jurisdiction for the Ethics Commission. The complaint is, therefore, dismissed pursuant to SMC 1.04A.110 D (1)(a).

 9-1-15

Troy Bruner - Chairperson Date

I Cindy Zapotocky, HEREBY AM FILING A CITIZEN COMPLAINT TO THE ETHICS COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SPOKANE AGAINST CITY CLERK TERRI PFISTER REGARDING THE FOLLOWING: On October 27th, 2014, Mr. David Brookbank, an American citizen, delivered his blistering testimony for passage of the sanctuary city ordinance C35167 all in Spanish. Most people in the room had no idea what he said. I asked City Clerk Terri Pfister to provide a translation of his testimony to me, a citizen of Spokane, but she refused. This bureaucrat's idea of being an American "public servant" is obviously quite warped. This City should either ask that those who give public testimonies in a language other than ^{ENGLISH} Spanish provide translations....or the City of Spokane should provide them. I hereby request that this Council pass an ordinance to deal with this situation so we understand what is said in this room.

How many of you in this room understand what I just said...please raise your hand.

Spanish
 Tengo una queja contra la ciudad. Nadie debería hablar en este idioma. Yo soy un ciudadano.
 Tengo una queja contra la ciudad. Nadie debería hablar en este idioma. Yo soy un ciudadano.
 Tengo una queja contra la ciudad. Nadie debería hablar en este idioma. Yo soy un ciudadano.
 Tengo una queja contra la ciudad. Nadie debería hablar en este idioma. Yo soy un ciudadano.

SUBMITTED TO CITY COUNCIL
 BY: Cindy Zapotocky
 DATE: 7/13/15
Terri Pfister
 CITY CLERK

Date: Mon, 1 Dec 2014 09:48:39 -0800

From: zapox6@afo.net

To: "Pfister, Terri" <TPfister@spokanecity.org>

Cc: awaldref@spokanecity.org, bstuckart@spokanecity.org, cmumm@spokanecity.org, jsnyder@spokanecity.org, kstratton@spokanecity.org, mallen@spokanecity.org, mayor@spokanecity.org, mfagen@spokanecity.org

Bcc: "Cindy Zapotocky" <zapox6@afo.net>, "Craig Keller" <craig@respectwashington.us>, "Tim Benn" <votetimbenn@gmail.com>, "Stephen Pidgeon" <stephen.pidgeon@comcast.net>

Subject: Testimony Translation

Dear Ms. Pfister: It was a shock to receive your communication below. You are telling me that the 50 or so of us English-speaking American citizens attending the City Council Meeting on 10-27-14 DO NOT have a right to understand what was being said in the room? Your presumption in my view is unlawful and unfair.

Keeping in mind that the vast majority of Americans speak their native tongue, which is English, I hereby VIGOROUSLY PROTEST your refusal to provide a translation of this testimony to me, a citizen of the United States of America. I have reluctantly done as you directed to see just what Mr. Brookbank said in his testimony, which is attached. I believe you will agree that his testimony was something I needed to hear and understand.

I hereby respectfully ask that our Spokane City Council and our Mayor formulate and pass an ordinance requiring that all public testimonies provided at City Council meetings in non-English be translated into English by your office so that the vast majority of our nation's and this city's citizens can understand what is being said.

Your's truly, Cindy Zapotocky
1728 E. Rockwood Blvd
Spokane, WA 99203
Phone: 509-534-5707

----- Original Message -----

From: "Pfister, Terri" <TPfister@spokanecity.org>

To: "zapox6@afo.net" <zapox6@afo.net>

Sent: Wed, 19 Nov 2014 16:35:51 +0000

Subject: RE: RE Translation

> Ms. Zapotocky:

>

> In response to your email inquiry below, the City Clerk's Office
> does not provide transcription services to the public for comments
> made during public meetings, nor am I aware of any requirement that

> would require the City to hire a translator or interpreter to
> translate/interpret testimony provided at a City Council meeting. We
> are required to keep a record of meetings, which we have done. You
> are most welcome to obtain a copy of the audio recording and/or the
> video recording of the meeting and consult with a translator or an
> interpreter of your own choosing to translate/interpret the comments
> for you.

>
> Best regards,

>
> Terri L. Pfister, MMC | City of Spokane | City Clerk
> 808 W. Spokane Falls Boulevard, Spokane, WA 99201-3342
> 509.625.6354 | fax 509.625.6217 | tpfister@spokanecity.org

> -----Original Message-----

> From: zapox6@afo.net [<mailto:zapox6@afo.net>]
> Sent: Monday, November 17, 2014 11:54 AM
> To: Clerks - City of Spokane
> Subject: RE Translation

> ----- Forwarded Message ----- From: zapox6@afo.net
To: TPfister@spokanecity.org Sent: Tue, 28 Oct 2014 19:42:54 -0700 Subject: RE
Translation

>
> Dear Terry: I attended last night's City Council meeting and heard a
> testimony by David Brookbank, mostly in Spanish. Could I please have
> a translation of this sent to me?

>
> Thank you, Cindy Zapotocky
> 509-534-5707

> ----- End of Forwarded Message -----

> -----
> Help protect your family and your marriage!
> Take a look at PROTECTED internet service from American Family
> Online - <http://www.afo.net>

----- End of Original Message -----

Attachment 1: CITY COUNCIL Brookbank testimony.docx (15 KB)

Type: application/vnd.openxmlformats-officedocument.wordprocessingml.document
Encoding: base64

1 PAID \$25 FOR THIS - QJ

Here is translation/synopsis of the Brookbank testimony in Spanish on Oct. 27th.

Brookbank's 3-minute segment begins at Hour 1:25 <http://vimeo.com/110291145>

He claims that he was a Vice Consul for U.S in Latin America also a former bi-lingual CPS social worker.

Also he mentions that he was involved with a Radio station program in Spanish in Spokane and also he played the piano at a Hispanic church.

He explains that for the past 30 years he lived in several Latin American countries, he married a Salvadoran woman.

Sometime ago his wife (the Salvadoran woman) was riding a city bus here in the US and the bus was involved in an accident but because she was not able communicate in English she could not give a clear statement of the accident to file a police report. He is not very clear therefore I am not sure if she was trying to get compensation from the City Public Transportation claiming on their insurance.

His best friends here in US are illegal immigrants.

He is worried that illegal immigrants will not be protected or treated fairly if they decide to report a crime to the police, fearing that they could be deported if their illegal status comes to light

He wants that the police department in Spokane stop working with ICE and not to profile illegal immigrants.

He also mentions an indictment of a person Carmen Le Blanc for extortion of a business named Tacos Tundras ?

He does not explain this event clearly.

From: WCC [<mailto:waconco@gmail.com>]
Sent: Friday, July 17, 2015 8:15 PM
To: Riedinger, Rebecca
Cc: Mayor; Snyder, Jon; Pfister, Terri
Subject: Ethics Complaint

To: Rebecca Riedinger, Ethics Commission
From: Cindy Zapotocky, Spokane City resident

I would like to file a complaint against Spokane City Clerk Terri Pfister regarding her dereliction of her obligation under the laws of our state to serve the citizens like me in the City of Spokane. (See my testimony regarding this complaint attached, given at the City Council meeting last Monday, July 13, 2015)

On October 27, 2014, I attended a City Council meeting at City Hall. During testimony taken regarding the Sanctuary City Ordinance #C35167, Mr. David Brookbank, an American citizen, gave his testimony all in Spanish. In my estimation, out of the estimated 50 people attending this hearing, all but 3 could not understand him, including me. Consequently, because of Clerk Pfister's denial of my request, I had to hire a translator and pay her \$25 to provide me with a translation of that testimony. (See attached.) This is not right. If you consult my Table 1 U.S. Census attached, you can easily see that the vast majority of inhabitants of the United States speak English. In a nation with the many language varieties around, it only makes sense to unify communications with the HUGELY predominant English language.

After that hearing, I politely requested that my City Clerk, provide me with a translated record of that testimony. She refused. (see attached copy of email exchange between Ms. Pfister and me.)

From the City of Spokane website:

Public Records

Pursuant to SMC 3.01.820, the City Clerk acts as the City of Spokane Records Officer. It is the role of the Records Officer to provide public access to current, as well as historical, documents. The City of Spokane provides access to public records under the provisions of the Washington State Public Disclosure Act (RCW 42.56).

All records maintained by the City of Spokane are available for public inspection unless specifically exempted by law. You are entitled to access public records, under reasonable conditions, and copies of those records can be provided upon paying copying costs. In most cases, you do not have to explain why you want the records. However, specific information may be necessary to process your request. The City may require further information to establish if disclosure would violate certain provisions of law.

The more precisely you can identify the record(s) you seek, the more responsive the City can be. The City of Spokane provides access to existing public records in its possession but is not required to collect information or organize data to create a record not existing at the time of the request. Keep in mind that a question or request for information only is not a request for a record.

It is my feeling that since English is the most commonly understood language among many thousands of languages and dialects spoken in the face of the earth, let alone the primarily understood and spoken language in the U.S., our government should provide translations of all proceeding in our legislative branches of government including at the federal, state, county and city level that are not spoken in English. In Spokane, our City should require all who testify during public hearings in other than English to provide their own translator and written English testimony to the Clerk, in this case our City Council, and to our citizens so that all may understand what has been said in court or in a public hearing. (Did our City Council members understand any of what Mr. Brookbank said? Did they get a translation of what he said?)

I am very offended by the dismissive attitude of Ms. Pfister. She did not recommend my request any higher than her office, and I feel she treated me rudely in her reply. I also sent a copy of my request to Mayor Condon and all City Councilpeople, and only Mr. Fagan replied.

This is not the way anyone...citizen or not...should be treated by a "public servant" in the United States of America or our city. This is not ethical behavior that should be encouraged in our city employees.

Cindy Zapotocky
1728 E. Rockwood Blvd
Spokane, Wa 99203
Phone: 509-534-5707

Copies to: Mayor Condon, my Councilman Snyder, Clerk

I Cindy Zapotocky, HEREBY AM FILING A CITIZEN COMPLAINT TO THE ETHICS COMMISSION OF THE CITY OF SPOKANE AGAINST CITY CLERK TERRI PFISTER REGARDING THE FOLLOWING: On October 27th, 2014, Mr. David Brookbank, an American citizen, delivered his blistering testimony for passage of the sanctuary city ordinance C35167 all in Spanish. Most people in the room had no idea what he said. I asked City Clerk Terri Pfister to provide a translation of his testimony to me, a citizen of Spokane, but she refused. This bureaucrat's idea of being an American "public servant" is obviously quite warped. This City should either ask that those who give public testimonies in a language other than Spanish provide translations....or the City of Spokane should provide them. I hereby request that this Council pass an ordinance to deal with this situation so we understand what is said in this room.

How many of you in this room understand what I just said...please raise your hand.

Here is translation/synopsis of the Brookbank testimony in Spanish on Oct. 27th.

Brookbank's 3-minute segment begins at Hour 1:25 <http://vimeo.com/110291145>

He claims that he was a Vice Consul for U.S in Latin America also a former bi-lingual CPS social worker. Also he mentions that he was involved with a Radio station program in Spanish in Spokane and also he played the piano at a Hispanic church.

He explains that for the past 30 years he lived in several Latin American countries, he married a Salvadoran woman.

Sometime ago his wife (the Salvadoran woman) was riding a city bus here in the US and the bus was involved in an accident but because she was not able communicate in English she could not give a clear statement of the accident to file a police report. He is not very clear therefore I am not sure if she was trying to get compensation from the City Public Transportation claiming on their insurance.

His best friends here in US are illegal immigrants.

He is worried that illegal immigrants will not be protected or treated fairly if they decide to report a crime to the police, fearing that they could be deported if their illegal status comes to light

He wants that the police department in Spokane stop working with ICE and not to profile illegal immigrants.

He also mentions an indictment of a person Carmen Le Blanc for extortion of a business named Tacos Tundras ? He does not explain this event clearly.

Dear Ms. Pfister: It was a shock to receive your communication below. You are telling me that the 50 or so of us English-speaking American citizens attending the City Council Meeting on 10-27-14 DO NOT have a right to understand what was being said in the room? Your presumption in my view is unlawful and unfair.

Keeping in mind that the vast majority of Americans speak their native tongue, which is English, I hereby VIGOROUSLY PROTEST your refusal to provide a translation of this testimony to me, a citizen of the United States of America. I have reluctantly done as you directed to see just what Mr. Brookbank said in his testimony, which is attached. I believe you will agree that his testimony was something I needed to hear and understand.

I hereby respectfully ask that our Spokane City Council and our Mayor formulate and pass an ordinance requiring that all public testimonies provided at City Council meetings in non-English be translated into English by your office so that the vast majority of our nation's and this city's citizens can understand what is being said.

Your's truly, Cindy Zapotocky
1728 E. Rockwood Blvd
Spokane, WA 99203
Phone: 509-534-5707

----- Original Message -----

From:"Pfister, Terri" <TPfister@spokanecity.org>
To:"zapox6@afo.net" <zapox6@afo.net>
Sent:Wed, 19 Nov 2014 16:35:51 +0000
Subject:RE: RE Translation

> Ms. Zapotocky:

>

> In response to your email inquiry below, the City Clerk's Office
> does not provide transcription services to the public for comments
> made during public meetings, nor am I aware of any requirement that
> would require the City to hire a translator or interpreter to
> translate/interpret testimony provided at a City Council meeting. We
> are required to keep a record of meetings, which we have done. You
> are most welcome to obtain a copy of the audio recording and/or the
> video recording of the meeting and consult with a translator or an
> interpreter of your own choosing to translate/interpret the comments
> for you.

>

> Best regards,

>

> Terri L. Pfister, MMC | City of Spokane | City Clerk

> 808 W. Spokane Falls Boulevard, Spokane, WA 99201-3342
> 509.625.6354 | fax 509.625.6217 | tpfister@spokanecity.org

>

> -----Original Message-----

> From: zapox6@afo.net [mailto:zapox6@afo.net]

> Sent: Monday, November 17, 2014 11:54 AM

> To: Clerks - City of Spokane

> Subject: RE Translation

>

> ----- Forwarded Message ----- From:zapox6@afo.net

To:TPfister@spokanecity.org Sent:Tue, 28 Oct 2014 19:42:54 -0700 Subject:RE Translation

>

> Dear Terry: I attended last night's City Council meeting and heard a

> testimony by David Brookbank, mostly in Spanish. Could I please have

> a translation of this sent to me?

>

> Thank you, Cindy Zapotocky

> 509-534-5707

Table 1.

Detailed Languages Spoken at Home by English-Speaking Ability for the Population 5 Years and Over: 2011(For information on confidentiality protection, sampling error, nonsampling error, and definitions, see www.census.gov/acs/www/)

Characteristics	Population 5 years and over (Number)	Spoke a language other than English at home ¹ (Percent)	English-speaking ability ² (Percent)			
			Spoke English "not well"	Spoke English "not at all"	Spoke English "well"	Spoke English "very well"
Population 5 years and over	291,524,091	X	X	X	X	X
Spoke only English at home	230,947,071	X	X	X	X	X
Spoke a language other than English at home.	60,577,020	100.0	58.2	19.4	15.4	7.0
Spanish or Spanish Creole	37,579,787	62.0	56.3	17.8	16.9	9.0
Other Indo-European languages:						
French	1,301,443	2.1	79.6	13.9	5.9	0.6
French Creole	753,990	1.2	56.8	23.8	15.2	4.3
Italian	723,632	1.2	73.5	17.1	8.6	0.8
Portuguese	673,566	1.1	61.8	20.8	13.5	3.9
German	1,083,637	1.8	82.9	13.1	3.6	0.3
Yiddish	160,968	0.3	68.4	17.7	10.2	3.7
Other West Germanic languages	290,461	0.5	77.6	17.9	3.7	0.8
Scandinavian languages	135,025	0.2	90.6	7.7	1.6	0.1
Greek	304,928	0.5	75.3	15.5	7.8	1.4
Russian	905,843	1.5	52.3	25.6	16.8	5.3
Polish	607,531	1.0	60.0	23.4	13.8	2.8
Serbo-Croatian	269,624	0.4	61.7	21.9	13.6	2.9
Other Slavic languages	336,062	0.6	62.1	22.8	11.9	3.3
Armenian	246,915	0.4	53.8	22.2	16.5	7.6
Persian	407,586	0.7	62.7	21.9	12.0	3.4

Gujarati.	358,422	0.6	63.8	20.2	12.2	3.8
Hindi.	648,983	1.1	77.0	16.3	5.3	1.4
Urdu.	373,851	0.6	70.0	19.3	9.2	1.5
Other Indic languages .	815,345	1.3	60.6	23.7	10.9	4.9
Other Indo-European languages.	449,600	0.7	65.1	21.5	9.9	3.4
Asian and Pacific Island languages:						
Chinese .	2,882,497	4.8	44.3	26.1	19.9	9.7
Japanese.	436,110	0.7	57.5	27.4	13.9	1.2
Korean.	1,141,277	1.9	44.5	27.0	24.4	4.0
Mon-Khmer, Cambodian .	212,505	0.4	47.1	23.4	22.9	6.6
Hmong.	211,227	0.3	56.7	22.2	14.9	6.2
Thai.....	163,251	0.3	43.4	34.8	18.9	2.8
.....						
Laotian.	140,866	0.2	50.9	22.1	22.7	4.3
Vietnamese.....	1,419,539	2.3	39.8	27.1	25.8	7.3
.....						
Other Asian languages.	855,303	1.4	69.3	19.6	8.4	2.7
Tagalog.	1,594,413	2.6	67.2	25.6	6.7	0.5
Other Pacific Island languages.	428,476	0.7	61.6	25.7	11.7	1.1
Other languages:						
Navajo .	169,369	0.3	78.8	14.2	4.8	2.2
Other Native American languages.	195,407	0.3	85.4	11.4	2.9	0.3
Hungarian.	93,102	0.2	71.0	21.1	7.3	0.7
Arabic.	951,699	1.6	63.3	21.7	11.9	3.1
Hebrew.	216,343	0.4	84.7	11.9	2.9	0.5
African languages.....	884,660	1.5	68.1	21.1	8.6	2.1
.....						
All other languages.	153,777	0.3	56.3	19.7	14.8	9.3

X Not applicable.

¹ The percentage in this column is calculated as the number of speakers of the specific language divided by the total number of those who spoke a language other than English at home (60,577,020).

² The percentages for these columns are calculated as the number of those who spoke English "very well," "well," "not well," or "not at all" for a particular language divided by the total number of those who spoke that language.

Note: Margins of error for all estimates can be found in the Appendix Table 1 <www.census.gov/hhes/socdemo/language/data/acs/Table1.xls>. For more information on the ACS, see <www.census.gov/acs/www/>.

Source: U.S.Census Bureau, 2011 American Community Survey.

August 4, 2015

COMPLAINT

To: City of Spokane Ethics Commission

Rebecca Riedinger, Staff Liaison

From: Cindy Zapotocky, 1728 E Rockwood Blvd. Spokane, Wa 99203 Phone: 509-534-57073.63

Thank you for sending me the copy of the Spokane Municipal Code section titled “Code of Ethics”. In this document, I did indeed find everything I need to clarify for you, the essence of my complaint against Spokane City Clerk Terry Pfister.

1. **Ethics:** You had many definitions in this code except the most important one. The one defining the word “ethics”. Very odd. Because today in the United States, the most contentious and difficult debate our citizens find themselves embroiled in is that of “What is ethical behavior of those serving in government?” One can go back to the founding document of this nation, and see that clearly the standard that those who established our “united States” (See original document—small “u”) was based on what “the Creator” endowed us with and defines as “good”. We see in the Declaration of Independence, that the standard for what is right and good is the God Who Created Humankind. Clearly seen from the extensive writing of the founders, it was the Holy Bible that guided their thinking as to what was to be lawful and ethical. Certainly, they believed that “The Ten Commandments” should be a basis for legal ethical and moral standards in this nation. Murder is wrong. Stealing from others is wrong. Lying is wrong. Honoring one’s parents is good and brings blessings. And so on. The American Heritage Collected Dictionary published by Houghton Mifflin, defines the word “ethics” as follows: “The rules or standards governing the conduct of a person or the members of a population.” Our U.S. Constitution has been the governing document of this country for over 260 years.

2. **Public Servant:** This term goes back thousands of years to the Greeks and even the Romans who felt that the ideal governing official should serve those who elected him or her with humility and efficiency. This is the highest calling of the American form of government, and indeed, the first words in the U.S. Constitution that your document refers to are....”We the People”....for that is who established the governmental system that we Americans enjoy today. It was clearly set up....”of the people, by the people, and for the people.” Our government was meant to meet the needs and desires of its citizens. This not a given, by the way, in other countries around the world, where the first allegiance of leaders is not to “We the People”.

3. It is interesting to note that your document on page one says your employees and electeds shall “maintain the utmost standards of RESPONSIBILITY , trustworthiness, integrity, truthfulness, honesty, and FAIRNESS in carrying out their PUBLIC DUTIES.” I interpret this to mean that PUBLIC SERVANTS have a DUTY TO THE PUBLIC [PEOPLE WHO ELECTED/HIRED THEM} to be even handed or “fair” in their treatment of the citizens they are supposed to serve. This RESPONSIBILITY to serve the citizens is paramount.

Note: I had sent you U.S. census statistics that clearly show that the vast majority of all those living in the United States speak or understand the English language. I can give you more data on this, but it is indisputable. Additionally, across the earth, when human beings want to communicate across national boundaries, they are more likely to use English than any other language. Today there are thousands of languages and dialects spoken in the United States. If we have any hope of continued orderliness and unity, we citizens must insist on one cohesive language of communication to bind our people together in common understandings and exchange. The alternative is confusion and chaos.

So here are my conclusions. It is not fair nor ethical that:

- A. A citizen of this nation should walk into a government hearing room and not understand what is being said therein.**
- B. A public servant, when asked to assist a citizen in discerning what is being said in that room, turns down the request of a citizen to help them understand what is said in that government facility, and treats the citizen like someone without standing in that room. Clearly, it is the intent of the U.S. and State Constitutions that “We the People” understand what is going on with their government.**

Clerk Pfister, by denying me my civil right to understand what was going on in a government hearing, and by denying her stated duty on her official web page--to provide a record of testimony to citizens--was in error. She heard the testimony given in a language other than English, knowing that she herself along with the vast majority of those in the room, did not understand what was being said. What is even more troubling is that when I review the summations made by some City Council members, I suspect they had translations of Mr. Brookbank’s testimony that they were referring to. Did he, an English-speaking citizen, provide a translation to them, or to Clerk Pfister, but not to the other citizens attending the public hearing, thereby denying us in the audience, an understanding of why the City Council members voted the way they did? Were City Council members colluding with Mr. Brookbank to deny citizens an understanding of what was being said in the hearing room? These are disturbing questions for your consideration.

I politely asked Clerk Pfister to provide a translation of the proceedings of the City Council on October 27, 2015, in English, or to ask Mr Brookbank, to provide a translation, so that the U.S. citizens in the room could understand what the government was doing. She refused to even consider a remedy for me, thereby shirking her duty as a public servant to help me. Frankly, if the City Council members do not speak Spanish, and if they did not know what was being said, why in the world would they not themselves request a translation into their native English tongue and share it with us...the people they are supposed to serve????? This is VERY troubling. Have we have reached a time when “other priorities” are more important than the needs of the citizens of this nation, who not only pay Pfister’s salary but who depend on her integrity for clarity, courtesy and service?

I contend that it is your duty, as “watchdogs” of what is the right, helpful and ethical behavior of public servants in city government, to hold Clerk Terri Pfister to the standard set down by the founders of this nation. Her job is to serve “We the People...” in the City of Spokane; not the citizens of Mexico, not the citizens of Russia, and not the United Nations, but to serve us. To do otherwise is, at its very essence, in this united States of America, un-ethical.



OFFICE OF THE CITY CLERK
808 W. SPOKANE FALLS BLVD.
SPOKANE, WASHINGTON 99201-3342
509.625.6350

August 4, 2015

Mr. Troy Bruner
City of Spokane Ethics Commission
c/o Rebecca Riedinger, Staff Liaison to the Ethics Commission
City Attorney's Office
5th Floor – City Hall
808 W. Spokane Falls Blvd.
Spokane, WA 99201

Dear Mr. Bruner:

RE: ETHICS COMPLAINT FROM CINDY ZAPOTOCKY AGAINST CITY CLERK
TERRI PFISTER

This is to provide a written response to Ms. Cindy Zapotocky's complaint against me, as submitted during the July 13, 2015, Spokane City Council meeting, and her subsequent email transmission of the complaint as sent to Rebecca Riedinger on July 17, 2015. In addition, I have reviewed Ms. Zapotocky's August 4, 2015, letter to the City of Spokane Ethics Commission regarding her complaint.

I find no evidence of Ethics Code violations by me presented in any of Ms. Zapotocky's letters of complaint. I would respectfully request the Ethics Commission to dismiss the complaint based on the grounds that it has no jurisdiction in the matter [reference SMC 01.04A.110.D(1)(a)].

Although I feel the Ethics Commission has no jurisdiction in the matter, in case it may be of assistance during the Commission's deliberations on this matter, I am attaching an email exchange for your review dated December 1, 2014, between City Attorney Nancy Isserlis and Ms. Zapotocky. I believe this email backs up the response I provided to Ms. Zapotocky on November 19, 2014, in reply to her November 17, 2014, request for a translation of Spanish testimony provided by David Brookbank.

Thank you in advance for your review and consideration of my comments.

Sincerely,

Terri L. Pfister, MMC
Spokane City Clerk

Attachment

Pfister, Terri

From: Isserlis, Nancy
Sent: Monday, December 01, 2014 12:08 PM
To: zapox6@afo.net
Cc: Pfister, Terri; Dalton, Pat
Subject: Re: Testimony Translation

Ms. Pfister is correct.

Nancy Isserlis
City Attorney
808 W. Spokane Falls Blvd.
Spokane, WA 99201
509.625.6225
Sent from my iPad
Confidential Attorney Client Communication

> On Dec 1, 2014, at 10:13 AM, "zapox6@afo.net" <zapox6@afo.net> wrote:

>

> To: Nancy Isserlis, City Attorney

>

> I would like to inquire of you if Ms. Pfister's assumption below is
> correct...that there is no legal requirement of the City of Spokane to
> provide translations of non-English testimonies at public hearings to
> our city's citizens?

>

> Cindy Zapotocky
> 509-534-5707

>

> ----- Forwarded Message ----- From:zapox6@afo.net

> To:"Pfister, Terri" <TPfister@spokanecity.org>

> Cc:awaldref@spokanecity.org, bstuckart@spokanecity.org,

> cmumm@spokanecity.org, jsnyder@spokanecity.org,

> kstratton@spokanecity.org, mallen@spokanecity.org,

> mayor@spokanecity.org, mfagen@spokanecity.org Sent:Mon, 1 Dec 2014

> 09:48:39 -0800 Subject:Testimony Translation

>

> Dear Ms. Pfister: It was a shock to receive your communication below.
> You are telling me that the 50 or so of us English-speaking American
> citizens attending the City Council Meeting on 10-27-14 DO NOT have a
> right to understand what was being said in the room? Your presumption
> in my view is unlawful and unfair.

>

> Keeping in mind that the vast majority of Americans speak their native
> tongue, which is English, I hereby VIGOROUSLY PROTEST your refusal to
> provide a translation of this testimony to me, a citizen of the United
> States of America. I have reluctantly done as you directed to see just what Mr.
> Brookbank said in his testimony, which is attached. I believe you will
> agree that his testimony was something I needed to hear and understand.

>

> I hereby respectfully ask that our Spokane City Council and our Mayor

> formulate and pass an ordinance requiring that all public testimonies
> provided at City Council meetings in non-English be translated into
> English by your office so that the vast majority of our nation's and
> this city's citizens can understand what is being said.

>
> Your's truly, Cindy Zapotocky
> 1728 E. Rockwood Blvd
> Spokane, WA 99203
> Phone: 509-534-5707

>
> ----- Original Message ----- From:"Pfister, Terri"
> <TPfister@spokanecity.org> To:"zapox6@afo.net" <zapox6@afo.net>
> Sent:Wed, 19 Nov 2014 16:35:51 +0000
> Subject:RE: RE Translation

>
>> Ms. Zapotocky:
>>
>> In response to your email inquiry below, the City Clerk's Office does
>> not provide transcription services to the public for comments made
>> during public meetings, nor am I aware of any requirement that would
>> require the City to hire a translator or interpreter to
>> translate/interpret testimony provided at a City Council meeting. We
>> are required to keep a record of meetings, which we have done. You
>> are most welcome to obtain a copy of the audio recording and/or the
>> video recording of the meeting and consult with a translator or an
>> interpreter of your own choosing to translate/interpret the comments
>> for you.

>>
>> Best regards,
>>
>> Terri L. Pfister, MMC | City of Spokane | City Clerk
>> 808 W. Spokane Falls Boulevard, Spokane, WA 99201-3342
>> 509.625.6354 | fax 509.625.6217 | tpfister@spokanecity.org

>>
>> -----Original Message-----
>> From: zapox6@afo.net [<mailto:zapox6@afo.net>]
>> Sent: Monday, November 17, 2014 11:54 AM
>> To: Clerks - City of Spokane
>> Subject: RE Translation

>>
>> ----- Forwarded Message ----- From:zapox6@afo.net
> To:TPfister@spokanecity.org Sent:Tue, 28 Oct 2014 19:42:54 -0700
> Subject:RE Translation

>>
>> Dear Terry: I attended last night's City Council meeting and heard a
>> testimony by David Brookbank, mostly in Spanish. Could I please have
>> a translation of this sent to me?

>>
>> Thank you, Cindy Zapotocky
>> 509-534-5707
>> ----- End of Forwarded Message -----

>

> -----

- > Help protect your family and your marriage!
- > Take a look at PROTECTED internet service from American Family Online
- > - <http://www.afo.net> <CITY COUNCIL Brookbank testimony.docx>